Address:	51 Walnut Avenue, Takoma Park	Meeting Date:	2/21/2024	
Resource:	Contributing Resource Takoma Park Historic District	Report Date:	2/14/2024	
Applicant:	Jeffrey Hopkins & Rebecca Smith	Public Notice:	2/7/2024	
	Brian McCarthy, Architect	Tax Credit:	n/a	
Review:	HAWP	Staff: Dan Bruech		
Permit Number: 1057412				
Proposal:	Partial Demolition and New construction/building addition.			

MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) <u>approve</u> the HAWP application with <u>five (5) conditions</u>:

- 1. Annotated drawings with labeled measurements must be submitted to this office to append to the application materials. Drawings will be substituted in the application once they are received by Staff.
- 2. A roof plan for the proposal must be submitted to this office to append to the application materials. The roof plan will be added to the submitted application materials once it is received by Staff.
- 3. The proposed brackets in the addition's roof shall be wood. Full detailed drawings showing their material, size, and details shall be submitted prior to issuance of the HAWP. Final approval authority to verify the bracket material and appropriate design is delegated to Staff.
- 4. The railing for the new rear stairs shall be wood. Drawings showing this condition has been satisfied are required before issuance of the HAWP. Final approval authority to verify this condition has been satisfied is delegated to Staff.
- 5. The proposed aluminum-clad wood windows shall have permanently affixed interior and exterior grilles with a spacer bar. Window specifications showing this condition has been satisfied must be submitted to Staff prior to issuance of the final HAWP. Final approval authority to verify this condition has been satisfied is delegated to Staff.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE:Contributing Resource within the Takoma Park Historic DistrictSTYLE:CraftsmanDATE:c.1920



Figure 1: The subject property is located at the Takoma Park/Washington DC border.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to demolish a rear dormer and construct a rear addition and screened-in porch.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and additions for new construction to Contributing Resources within the Takoma Park Historic District, decisions are guided by the Takoma Park Historic District Design Guidelines (*Design Guidelines*) and Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (*Chapter 24A*) and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (*The Standards*). Additionally, as a building located within the Takoma Old Town and Commercial Revitalization Area, Ordinance No. 2592 applies.

Takoma Park Historic District Design Guidelines

There are two very general, broad planning and design concepts which apply to all categories. These are:

The design review emphasis will be restricted to changes that are at all visible from the public right-of-way, irrespective of landscaping or vegetation (it is expected that the majority of new additions will be reviewed for their impact on the overall district), and,

The importance of assuring that additions and other changes to existing structures act to reinforce and continue existing streetscape, landscape, and building patterns rather than to impair the character of the district.

Contributing Resources should receive a more lenient review than those structures that have been classified as Outstanding. This design review should emphasize the importance of the resource to the overall streetscape and its compatibility with existing patterns rather than focusing on a close scrutiny of architectural detailing. In general, however, changes to Contributing Resources should respect the predominant architectural style of the resource. As stated above, the design review emphasis will be

restricted to changes that are *at all visible from the public right-of-way*, irrespective of landscaping or vegetation.

All exterior alterations, including those to architectural features and details, should be generally consistent with the predominant architectural style and period of the resource and should preserve the predominant architectural features of the resource; exact replication of existing details and features is, however, not required

Original size and shape of window and door openings should be maintained, where feasible

Some non-original building materials may be acceptable on a case-by-case basis; artificial siding on areas visible to the public right-of-way is discouraged where such materials would replace or damage original building materials that are in good condition

Major additions should, where feasible, be placed to the rear of existing structures so that they are less visible from the public right-of-way; additions and alterations to the first floor at the front of a structure are discouraged, but not automatically prohibited

While additions should be compatible, they are not required to be replicative of earlier architectural styles

Alterations to features that are not visible from the public right-of-way should be allowed as a matter of course

All changes and additions should respect existing environmental settings, landscaping, and patterns of open space.

Montgomery County Code, Chapter 24A Historic Resources Preservation

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

- 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportions, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF DISCUSSION

The subject property is a one-and-a-half-story side-gabled bungalow covered in formstone. There are small dormers on the front and rear roof slopes. There is a small wood deck at the rear of the house. The applicant proposes to demolish the rear-facing dormer and construct an addition in its place; and to demolish the existing rear deck and construct a screened-in porch in its place. Staff finds the proposed changes will not have a significant impact on the character of the site or surrounding district and recommends the HPC approve the HAWP.

Dormer Demolition and Building Addition

At the rear of the house, there is a small gable dormer covered in wood clapboards with a single one-overone sash window. The applicant proposes to demolish this dormer and construct an addition over the rear roof slope.

The proposed addition is primarily comprised of a shed dormer, with a rear-facing gable on the left side. The dormer will be covered in fiber cement clapboards, with a membrane roof and three six-over-one sash wood-clad windows. On the south (left) elevation, the applicant proposes to install a pair of two-light casement windows. The low-pitched shed roof on the left side of the rear elevation will be architectural shingle to match the existing roof.







Staff finds the rear elevation of the house is visible from the public right of way (see Fig. 3, below), but that the rear roof slope and rear dormer do not significantly contribute to the architectural character of the house or surrounding district. Staff supports the removal of the dormer under 24A-8(b)(2) and Standards 2 and 9.

PROPOSED REAR ELEVATION



Figure 3: The rear of the subject property is visible from Eastern Ave.

Staff finds the size and massing of the proposed addition will not overwhelm the character of the house and does not project above the historic ridge height. Staff further finds the materials proposed (i.e. fiber cement siding, clad wood windows, architectural shingles, etc.) are all in keeping with the character of the house and have consistently been determined appropriate for new construction and additions within the Takoma Park Historic District. The HPC typically requires clad windows to have permanently affixed interior and exterior grilles with a spacer bar. Because the submitted materials did not include a window specification packet, Staff recommends the HPC add a condition to the approval that the windows divisions satisfy this typical requirement. Additionally, Staff notes the detail for the brackets on the rear addition did not provide a material specification nor were the drawings detailed enough to make a recommendation on their appropriateness. Because the house retains its historic wood brackets, Staff recommends the HPC add a condition to the approval of their design to Staff. Staff recommends the HPC approve the rear dormer addition under the Takoma Park Historic District *Design Guidelines*, Chapter 24A-8(b)(2) and (d), and Standards 2, 9, and 10 with the two added conditions covering the windows and brackets.

Screened-In Porch

At the rear of the house, in the right corner, there is a small wood deck with wood stairs. The deck and stairs do not appear to be historic. The applicant proposes to demolish this deck and stairs and construct a screened-in porch and a new set of stairs in the same approximate location. The porch, which measures 11' $6'' \times 11' 6''$ (eleven feet, six inches square), will be constructed out of wood, with pressure-treated wood flooring, boral-wrapped columns, a Trex Transcend railing system, and an architectural shingle rear gable roof. The fenestration on the rear will not be impacted by the proposed porch.

Staff finds the existing deck is not historic and its removal will not impact the historic character of the site or surrounding district and recommends the HPC approve its removal under 24A-8(b)(1), (2), and (d); and Standard 2. Staff additionally finds the proposed screened-in porch will not detract from the character of the house and will not overwhelm the character of the house and surrounding district. With one exception, Staff finds the proposed materials are appropriate for the house and surrounding district. Staff does not find the proposed Trex Transcend railing to be an appropriate material, as it tends to appear to plastic-y and lacks the solid feeling of wood. Additionally, only limited colors of Trex Transcend can be painted. Staff recommends the HPC approve the proposed screened-in porch and new stairs under 24A-8(b)(2) and (d); the *Design Guidelines*; and Standards 2, 9, and 10 with the added condition that the railing be wood.

Other Considerations

The box on the front page for "Tree removal/planting" is checked, however, the site plan does not identify any trees to be removed and the accompanying narrative does not include a mention of any tree removals. The removal of any tree larger than 6" (six inches) d.b.h. requires an approved HAWP (or appropriate waiver) before trees can be cut down in the Takoma Park Historic District. Approval of this HAWP does not extend to the removal of any trees at the subject property. If the applicant proposes to remove any tree larger than 6" d.b.h., then the applicant needs to submit an amendment to this HAWP application or as a stand-alone HAWP for review an approval.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Commission **approve** the HAWP with five (5) conditions:

- 1. Annotated drawings with labeled measurements must be submitted to this office to append to the application materials. Drawings will be substituted in the application once they are received by Staff.
- 2. A roof plan for the proposal must be submitted to this office to append to the application materials. The roof plan will be added to the submitted application materials once it is received by Staff.
- 3. The proposed brackets in the addition's roof shall be wood. Full detailed drawings showing their material, size, and details shall be submitted prior to issuance of the HAWP. Final approval authority to verify the bracket material and appropriate design is delegated to Staff.
- 4. The railing for the new rear stairs shall be wood. Drawings showing this condition has been satisfied are required before issuance of the HAWP. Final approval authority to verify this condition has been satisfied is delegated to Staff.
- 5. The proposed aluminum-clad wood windows shall have permanently affixed interior and exterior grilles with a spacer bar. Window specifications showing this condition has been satisfied must be submitted to Staff prior to issuance of the final HAWP. Final approval authority to verify this condition has been satisfied is delegated to Staff;

under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b)(1), (2), and (d), having found that the proposal, as modified by the condition, is consistent with the *Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines* and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #2, #9, and #10.

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present an electronic set of drawings, if applicable, to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff's discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make any alterations to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or dan.bruechert@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.

COMERY CO.	FOR STAFF ONLY: HAWP#
APPLICATION HISTORIC AREA WO HISTORIC PRESERVATION 301.563.3400	ORK PERMIT
APPLICANT:	
Name: Jeffrey Hopkins + Rebecca Smith	E-mail: <u>Rebecca</u> . Smithe wontgomery county md. gov
Address: 51 Walnut Ävenve	City: Takoma Park Zip: 20912
Daytime Phone: 301 / 602 · 0115	Tax Account No.: 13-01064985
AGENT/CONTACT (if applicable): Brian McCarthy	
Name: Bennett Frank McCarthy Architects	E-mail: briane bfmarch.com
Address: 1400 Spring Street # 320	E-mail: briane bfmarch.com City: <u>Silver Spring</u> Zip: 20910
Daytime Phone: <u>301.602.0115</u>	Contractor Registration No.:
LOCATION OF BUILDING/PREMISE: MIHP # of Historia	c Property 51 Walnut Avenue, Takoma PK
Is the Property Located within an Historic District? \times	es/District Name Takoma Park
Is there an Historic Preservation/Land Trust/Environme map of the easement, and documentation from the Eas	
Are other Planning and/or Hearing Examiner Approvals (Conditional Use, Variance, Record Plat, etc.?) If YES, in supplemental information.	
Building Number: 51 Street: W	lalnut Avenue
Town/City: Takoma Park Nearest Cros	s Street: Eastern Ävenve
Lot: 17 Block: 17 Subdivision:	025 Parcel:
TYPE OF WORK PROPOSED: See the checklist on Pa for proposed work are submitted with this applica	tion. Incomplete Applications will not
be accepted for review. Check all that apply:	Shed/Garage/Accessory Structure
New Construction Deck/Porch	Solar Tree removal (planting
Addition Demolition Hardscape/Lands	Cape X Tree removal/planting
Grading/Excavation Roof	Other:
I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the for	
and accurate and that the construction will comply wit agencies and hereby acknowledge and accept this to b	be a condition for the issuance of this permit.
-73000	

7

HAWP APPLICATION: MAILING ADDRESSES FOR NOTIFING [Owner, Owner's Agent, Adjacent and Confronting Property Owners] Owner's mailing address **Owner's Agent's mailing address** Bennett Frank McCarthy Architects, Inc 1400 Spring Street #320 Silver Spring, Md 20912 51 Walnut Avenue Takoma Park, Md 20912 Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses William J; MR Valdez Steven A Shira 53 Walnut Avenue 54 Walnut Avenue Takoma Park, Md 20912 Takoma Park, Md 20912 Aubrey & Stevenson & Maureen Booker 6761 Eastern Avenue Deborah A. George 56 Walnut Avenue Takoma Park, Md 20912 Takoma Park, Md 20912

Description of Property: Please describe the building and surrounding environment. Include information on significant structures, landscape features, or other significant features of the property:

Please see Memorandum dated January 29, 2024, Addendum A

Description of Work Proposed: Please give an overview of the work to be undertaken:

Please see Memorandum dated January 29, 2024, Addendum B

Work Item 1: <u>kitchen remadel</u> Description of Current Condition: Small, compartmentalized kitchen and inefficient teth/closet arrangement on main level.	Proposed Work: Open kitchen to dining room & family room. Remodel / modernize kitchen. Recanfigure bathroom and bedroom closet. Bring laundry up from basement to facilitate aging in place.
Work Item 2: Outdoor space c man Description of Current Condition: The front porch is inscreened and	Proposed Work: Provide a modest screen porch at the
atthear space in the backyard is a full story below the main level.	main level with access to the backyard. The new porch will mimic the roof form of the existing front porch.

Work Item 3: Expansion of second flo	a
Description of Current Condition: The second floor consists of two bedrooms and one hall bathroom The ceilings are all below 6'. 6". The owners are interested in expanding the top floor to make it adaptable to multi-generational living to accommadate one or more of their grown children.	Proposed Work: A rear shed dormer addition to provide a third bedroom and second bethroom. The dormer would not impact the ridgeline and would not be visible from the front of the base.

HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT CHECKLIST OF APPLICATION REQUIREMENTS

	Required Attachments						
Proposed Work	I. Written Description	2. Site Plan	3. Plans/ Elevations	4. Material Specifications	5. Photographs	6. Tree Survey	7. Property Owner Addresses
New Construction	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Additions/ Alterations	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Demolition	*	*	*		*		*
Deck/Porch	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Fence/Wall	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Driveway/ Parking Area	*	*		*	*	*	*
Grading/Exc avation/Land scaing	*	*		*	*	*	*
Tree Removal	*	*		*	*	*	*
Siding/ Roof Changes	*	*	*	*	*		*
Window/ Door Changes	*	*	*	*	*		*
Masonry Repair/ Repoint	*	*	*	*	*		*
Signs	*	*	*	*	*		*





-EX. SIDE EXTENTION (106 SF) 2.5'

ZONING SITE PLAN / L	LEGEND
WOOD FENCE	
SETBACK LINE	
PROPERTY LINE	
EXISING FOOTPRINT	
FIRST FLOOR ADDITION	
SECOND FLOOR ADDITION	









___+











Detail: 51 WALNUT AVE. FRONT



Detail: 51 WALNUT AVE. NORTH-EAST CORNER



Detail: 51 WALNUT AVE. NORTH-WESTERN CORNER



Detail: 51 WALNUT AVE. WESTERN SIDE



Detail: 51 WALNUT AVE. REAR



Detail: 51 WALNUT AVE. SOUTH-EASTERN CORNER



Detail: 51 WALNUT AVE. GARAGE SOUTH-WEST CORNER



Detail: 51 WALNUT AVE. GARAGE



Detail: CONTEXT: 6761 EASTERN AVE.



Detail: CONTEXT: 53 WALNUT AVE.



Detail: CONTEXT: 55 WALNUT AVE.



Detail: CONTEXT: 54 WALNUT AVE.



Detail: CONTEXT: 56 WALNUT AVE.



Detail: CONTEXT: 58 WALNUT AVE.

BENNETT FRANK McCARTHY

architecton 1400 Spring Street, Suite 320, Silver Spring, Maryland 20910-2755

Memorandum

29 January 2024

To:	Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) Maryland-National Capital Park & Planning Commission c/o Department of Permitting Services, Montgomery County
From:	Brian McCarthy
Re:	Historic Area Work Permit for 51 Walnut Avenue, Takoma Park Historic District Addenda to HAWP: Written Description of Project

Addendum a.

The property is a 1-1/2 story wood frame Bungalow with a finished, walk-out basement apartment on a 8,075 square foot corner lot located at 51 Walnut Avenue. The house, built circa 1920s, is designated as a contributing resource in the Takoma Park Historic District. The west side of the house borders Eastern Avenue at the southern edge of the Historic District. The basic form has a square footprint with two projections; a covered front porch and an enclosed two- story side porch. The main house is crowned by a rather low-slung gable roof with the ridge set parallel to Walnut Avenue. The ridge is set rather low – roughly 9 ft above the second floor – resulting in a finished bedroom ceiling height of 6'-5" sloping down to 4'-2". Given the low ceilings it's somewhat surprising that the second floor was actually a stand-alone apartment when the owners purchased the house in 2004. Apartment access was via the side door/stoop facing Eastern Avenue, located at the base of the internal staircase.

The roof is punctuated by two modest dormers; a gabled dormer on the front and a shed roofed version on the rear. The front dormer has a ceiling height of only 6'-2 ¹/₂". The painted wood rake and eave overhangs are enclosed by soffits and visually supported by decorative scrolled brackets on the gables.

The front porch occupies the right/northwestern half of the front façade and has a gable roof that is perpendicular to the main roof. The façade of the shallow, two-story side extension features an almost continuous ribbon of windows. It is capped by a flat roof terrace accessed from a second-floor bedroom.

The main body of the house is clad primarily in formstone, with some 6.5" exposure wood clapboard siding on the enclosed side porch and Dutch-lap vinyl siding on the dormers. The pitched roofing consists of laminated "architectural" fiberglass composition shingles. A membrane material was used on the roof terrace above the enclosed side porch. The original wood windows are predominantly double hung with a 6 over 1 muntin pattern.

The property also includes a freestanding two-car garage at the southeastern end of the back yard. The garage is accessed off Little Eastern Avenue.

Addendum b.

The project consists of three primary components; an interior kitchen remodel and two external features, a screen porch on the main level and a bedroom expansion on the second floor. Both are manifested on the rear of the house.

The proposed screen porch is roughly 12x12 ft and would sit at the back corner furthest from Eastern Avenue. The gabled porch roof pitch and eaves match the front porch. The work on the second floor consists of shed dormer designed to add a third bedroom and a second full bath. Given the modest height of the existing main ridge the new dormer roof is nearly flat. The dormer is inset one foot from the Eastern Avenue side façade and a steep gabled element has been incorporated for visual interest. The opposite side of the dormer is less visible and has been set flush with the formstone wall below. The existing projected rake would remain, and coupled with the two-story enclosed porch extension, the eastern side of the new dormer would be largely obscured.

The new roof eaves and rakes will be enclosed with soffits like the main house. The dormer addition and porch gable will be clad in cement fiberboard clapboard siding. New windows in the addition will be aluminum clad wood and a mix of double hung, awnings and casements (for bedroom egress) with simulated divided lites. Casements, where used, will have faux check rails to mimic double hungs. Steep roofing will be laminated fiberglass composition shingles with a membrane like TPO used on the low slope dormer roof. The porch columns will be painted Boral wrapping 6x6 posts. The railing system will be a prefabricated PVC system like Transcends by Trex. Porch framing will be pressure treated wood.

We feel the proposed expansions are consistent with and sympathetic to the resource, and the historic district at large.



DEPARTMENT OF PERMITTING SERVICES

Rabbiah Sabbakhan Director

Marc Elrich County Executive

HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT APPLICATION

Application Date: 1/30/2024

Application No: 1057412 AP Type: HISTORIC Customer No: 1482670

Comments

Rear screen porch at main level with landing and steps to grade. Brian McCarthy, Architect, brian@bfmarch.com; Susan Darcey, permitting, susan@bfmarch.com.

Affidavit Acknowledgement

The Homeowner is the Primary applicant This application does not violate any covenants and deed restrictions

Primary Applicant Information

Address	51 WALNUT AVE TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912
Homeowner	Jeffrey Hopkins and Rebecca Smith (Primary)
Othercontact	Bennett Frank McCarthy Architects, Inc.

Historic Area Work Permit Details

Work TypeADDScope of WorkAdd rear shed dormer @ 2nd floor and rear screen porch; interior renovations.