### MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

Address: 512 Albany Ave., Takoma Park Meeting Date: 3/8/2023

**Resource:** Non-Contributing Resource **Report Date:** 3/1/2023

Takoma Park Historic District

**Applicant:** Brian Harris **Public Notice:** 2/22/2023

**Review:** HAWP **Tax Credit:** n/a

Case No.: 1020430 Staff: Dan Bruechert

**Proposal:** PorhchAlterations and Siding Replacement

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends the HPC **approve** the HAWP application with **one** (1) **condition**:

1. The proposed Trex decking is incompatible with the surrounding district and is not approved. An alternative substitute material that has a smooth finish, is solid and paintable, and faithfully reproduces the material qualities of wood in its finish and construction. is acceptable and final approval authority is delegated to Staff.

#### **ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION**

SIGNIFICANCE: Non-Contributing Resource to the Takoma Park Historic District

STYLE: Colonial Revival

DATE: c.1940



Figure 1: The subject property is adjacent to several Contributing and Non-Contributing Resources.

#### **PROPOSAL**

The applicant proposes to remove and replace the existing front porch decking, stairs, and railing; and to replace the wood facia.

#### APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Takoma Park Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the historic preservation review guidelines in the approved and adopted amendment for the *Takoma Park Historic District (Guidelines)*, *Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A)*, and *the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*.

#### Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines

There are two very general, broad planning and design concepts which apply to all categories. These are:

The design review emphasis will be restricted to changes that are at all visible from the public right-of-way, irrespective of landscaping or vegetation (it is expected that the majority of new additions will be reviewed for their impact on the overall district), and,

The importance of assuring that additions and other changes to existing structures act to reinforce and continue existing streetscape, landscape, and building patterns rather than to impair the character of the district.

Non-Contributing/Out-of-Period Resources should receive the most lenient level of design review. Most alterations and additions to Non-Contributing/Out-of-Period Resources should be approved as a matter of course. The only exceptions would be major additions and alterations to the scale and massing of Non-Contributing/Out-of-Period Resources which affect the surrounding streetscape and/or landscape and could impair character of the district as a whole.

#### Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

- (a) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to ensure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:
  - (1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or
  - (2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or
- (d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

#### Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportions, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

#### STAFF DISCUSSION

The applicant proposes to remove the existing wood front porch decking, stairs, and railing and replace them with a composite material in matching dimensions. Additionally, the applicant proposes to remove the wood facia board over the front porch with Veranda PVC boards.

Because the subject property is a 'Non-Contributing Resource,' the *Guidelines* give property owners wide latitude to make alterations, provided the work will not detract from the character of the streetscape and surrounding district. The application proposes to use Trex decking, a material that appears so much like plastic and is so reflective that Staff finds would detract from the character of the streetscape. Staff reached out to the applicant's representative who was receptive to Staff's guidance. However, at the time of this report, the applicant has not identified an alternative material. Because this resource is designated 'Non-Contributing' Staff finds it is appropriate for the HPC to delegate the material specification to Staff. Staff's initial recommendations to the applicant included Azek, Fiberon, Timbertech, and Aeratis as examples of materials that would be appropriate. Staff will update the HPC if a final material selection is made before the HAWP is considered at the HPC meeting on March 8.

When evaluating material substitutions for wood several factors should be utilized in determining whether or not the material is a compatible replacement that would detract from either the resource (in the case of a contributing property) or the streetscape. Those factors include the material's paintability, surface texture, whether it is millable or has to be manufactured to size, and if the material has a solid core and feels like natural wood. If the HPC determines the material is appropriate, then the HPC should consider its installation method (acceptable substitutes should be installed with traditional hardware or have its joinery sufficiently hidden).

Staff finds the proposed Veranda PVC boards are an acceptable replacement material, as its visibility from the right-of-way is reduced because it is higher up than the porch decking. Staff finds this material would not detract from the character of streetscape or district.

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the HAWP application with one (1) condition:

1. The proposed Trex decking is incompatible with the surrounding district and is not approved. An alternative substitute material that has a smooth finish, is solid and paintable, and faithfully reproduces the material qualities of wood in its finish and construction. is acceptable and final approval authority is delegated to Staff;

under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b)(1), (2), and (d), and the *Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines*, having found that the proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #2, 9, and 10;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present an electronic set of drawings, if

applicable, to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff's discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make **any alterations** to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or dan.bruechert@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.



## **APPLICATION FOR** HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION 301.563.3400

HAWP#\_ DATE ASSIGNED\_\_\_\_

FOR STAFF ONLY:

#### **APPLICANT:**

Name:	E-mail:			
Address:	City:	Zip:		
Daytime Phone:	Tax Ac	count No.:		
AGENT/CONTACT (if applicable)	):			
Name:	E-mail:	E-mail:		
Address:	City:	Zip:		
Daytime Phone:	Contra	ctor Registration No.:		
LOCATION OF BUILDING/PREMI	ISE: MIHP # of Historic Proper	rty		
Is there an Historic Preservation/I map of the easement, and document of the easement, and document of the Planning and/or Hearing (Conditional Use, Variance, Record supplemental information.  Building Number:	nentation from the Easement g Examiner Approvals /Review d Plat, etc.?) If YES, include in Street:	Holder supporting this apples  ws Required as part of this a  formation on these reviews	ication. Application? as	
Town/City:				
TYPE OF WORK PROPOSED: See for proposed work are submitted be accepted for review. Check at New Construction Addition Demolition Grading/Excavation  I hereby certify that I have the aut and accurate and that the construction agencies and hereby acknowledge.	e the checklist on Page 4 to ted with this application. In all that apply: Deck/Porch Fence Hardscape/Landscape Roof thority to make the foregoing suction will comply with plans	Shed/Garage/Acces Solar Tree removal/planti Window/Door Other: application, that the applic	rill not ssory Structure ing cation is correct	

# HAWP APPLICATION: MAILING ADDRESSES FOR NOTIFING [Owner, Owner's Agent, Adjacent and Confronting Property Owners] Owner's mailing address Owner's Agent's mailing address Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses 7403 Buffalo Avenue, Takoma Park 20912 7407 Buffalo Avenue, Takoma Park 20912 507 Albany Avenue, Takoma Park 20912 511 Albany Avenue, Takoma Park 20912

Description of Property: Please describe the building and surrounding environment. Include information on significant structure landscape features, or other significant features of the property:	res
Description of Work Proposed: Please give an overview of the work to be undertaken:	

Work Item 1:	
Description of Current Condition:	Proposed Work:
Work Item 2:	
Description of Current Condition:	Proposed Work:
Work Item 3:	
Description of Current Condition:	Proposed Work:









