Address:	3713 Underwood St., Chevy Chase	Meeting Date:	7/13/2022
Resource:	Clark House Individually Listed Master Plan Site	Report Date:	7/6/2022
Applicant:	Hannah Graae & Duke Schaeffer	Public Notice:	6/29/2022
Review:	HAWP	Tax Credit:	n/a
Case Number:	997705	Staff:	Dan Bruechert
Proposal:	Skylight Installation		

MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the HPC **<u>approve</u>** the HAWP application.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE:	Master Plan for Historic Preservation Site
STYLE:	Queen Anne
DATE:	1898

The house is a two-and-a-half story clapboard house, three bays wide, with an asphalt shingled front gable roof and a single-story porch in the right front corner. The front façade contains one-over-one sash windows, while the remaining windows are two-over-two sash windows. There is a Palladian window in the front gable and the left front corner has a decorative scroll work. On the right side, there is a rectangular bay with a large central one-over-one window flanked by two narrower one-over-one sash windows. There is a screened-in back porch with a shed roof, supported by wood piers.

The Clark House is one of the 19 houses that were added to the Master Plan for Historic Preservation as an expansion of the Chevy Chase Village Historic District. So, while these properties are not governed by the *Chevy Chase Village Historic District Design Guidelines*, their development is associated with the growth of the Chevy Chase.



Figure 1: The Clark House is constructed on a double lot.

From *Places from the Past*:

"Like the Earll House, the Clark House was the residence of one of Otterbourne's Founders. Eugene B. Clark built his house at 3713 Underwood in 1897. Clarke remained involved in the development of Otterbourne – investigating, for example, the best options for a community sewage disposal system. The Clark House is noteworthy for its continuity of ownership, having remained in the original family for 40 years.

"The Clark House was likely designed by or based on the designs of H. Galloway Ten Eyck, New Jersey architect. The exterior design bears striking similarities with his Design #52, and the floorplan is nearly identical with Design #61. Ten Eyck's patternbook was discovered in Eugene Clark's personal papers which remained in the house after its 1953 sale. The Clarke House is noteworthy for its original double-lot setting."



Figure 2: The Clark House sits prominently on its double lot.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to add two skylights on the east and west (left and right) roof slopes and install two casement windows in the rear gable.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and additions to a *Master* Plan site several documents are to be utilized and guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include Montgomery County Code chapter 24A (Chapter 24A) and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* (*Standards*) and can be guided by the details in the Design Guidelines for Historic Sites and Districts in Montgomery County, Maryland (*Design Guidelines*). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8(b)

A HAWP permit should be issued if the Commission finds that:

- 1. The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of a historic site or historic resource within a historic district.
- 2. The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical archaeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which a historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto of to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, space and spatial relationships that characterize a property will

be avoided.

- 3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes to a property that has acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportions, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF DISCUSSION

The applicant proposes to install four $21^{"} \times 54^{"}$ (twenty-one inch wide by fifty-four inch tall) low-profile Velux skylights, two on the east (right) roof slope and two on the west (left) roof slope of the front gable roof. At the rear, the applicant proposes to install a pair of 18" (eighteen inch) square wood casement windows.

Staff finds the pair of wood casement windows on the rear of the house are compatibly designed and will not have a significant impact on the character of the historic house and Staff recommends the HPC approve the pair of rear windows under 24A-8(b)(1) and (2) and Standards 2.

Staff considered several factors in evaluating the appropriateness of the proposed skylights. First, Staff considered whether any skylights were appropriate at the subject property. As an individually listed Master Plan Site, its review needs to be relatively restrictive. Staff first determined that the historic roofing material is gone and all that remains is a contemporary asphalt shingle roof. Next, Staff considers the impact skylights would have on the roof form. The existing roof is a front gable with hipped dormers on the left and right roof slopes. A low-profile skylight would project approximately 2" (two inches) above the roof plane. Staff finds that while this would disrupt the roof form, its impact is less than solar panels which would likely be acceptable on these roof slopes. Staff concludes that the subject property can accommodate some skylights on the roof.

The second question is whether the proposed skylight arrangement is compatible with the architectural character of the historic resource. Staff's initial recommendation was to locate the skylights as far from the front as possible to best preserve the resource's historic character. The recommendation included potentially placing one skylight to the rear of the dormer. However, in conversations with Staff, the applicant stated the that arrangement would be unsatisfactory because of the attic space's interior arrangement. Staff next considered only a single skylight on each roof slope, but concluded that a single skylight looked unbalanced and tended to stand out more than a pair of skylights. Staff concluded that the proposed two skylight arrangement was appropriate and would not detract from the character of the house. Staff finds the proposal is consistent with 24A-8(b)(2).

The final consideration in favor of the application is that the narrow width of the skylights was selected because it would avoid any impacts on the roof structure. This means that in the future, the house could be returned to its current appearance by removing the skylights, and installing new sheathing and shingles. Staff finds this is consistent with the requirements of Standard 10.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Commission <u>approve</u> the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b)(2) having found that the proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #2 and 10;

and with the general condition that the applicant will obtain all other applicable Montgomery County or local government agency permits. After the issuance of these permits, the applicant must contact this Historic Preservation Office if any changes to the approved plan are made;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff's discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make **any alterations** to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will <u>contact the staff person</u> assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or <u>dan.bruechert@montgomeryplanning.org</u> to schedule a follow-up site visit.

COMERY COL			For Staff only: HAWP# Date assigned
	APPLICA STORIC AREA HISTORIC PRESERV 301.56	WORK PEI	
APPLICANT:			
Name:		E-mail:	
Address:		City:	Zip:
Daytime Phone:		Tax Account N	lo.:
AGENT/CONTACT (if ap	plicable):		
Name:		E-mail:	
Address:		City:	Zip:
Daytime Phone:		Contractor Re	gistration No.:
LOCATION OF BUILDIN	G/PREMISE: MIHP # of I	Historic Property	
Is the Property Located	within an Historic District		
		ronmental Easement	te Name on the Property? If YES, include a supporting this application.
• •	ce, Record Plat, etc.?) If Y	· · ·	uired as part of this Application? on on these reviews as
Building Number:	Street:		
Town/City:	Neares	st Cross Street:	
Lot: Blo	ck: Subdiv	ision: Parcel	:
			v that all supporting items ete Applications will not
be accepted for review			Shed/Garage/Accessory Structure
New Construction			Solar
Addition	Fence		Tree removal/planting
Demolition	Hardscape/	'Landscape	Window/Door
Grading/Excavati	on Roof		Other:
I hereby certify that I ha	ive the authority to make	the foregoing application	ation, that the application is correct
and accurate and that t	he construction will com	ply with plans reviewe	ed and approved by all necessary
agencies and hereby ac	knowledge and accept tl	his to be a condition f	or the issuance of this permit.

HAWP APPLICATION: MAILING ADDRESSES FOR NOTIFING [Owner, Owner's Agent, Adjacent and Confronting Property Owners] **Owner's** mailing address **Owner's Agent's** mailing address Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses

Description of Property: Please describe the building and surrounding environment. Include information on significant structures, landscape features, or other significant features of the property:

Description of Work Proposed: Please give an overview of the work to be undertaken:

Work Item 1:			
Description of Current Condition:	Proposed Work:		
Work Item 2:			
Description of Current Condition:	Proposed Work:		

Work Item 3:	
Description of Current Condition:	Proposed Work:

Attachment 1 – Written Description

Description of Property:

Listed in the Montgomery County Master Plan for Historic Preservation as an Individual Site (Survey No. M:35-75), the Clark House dates from 1897 on a double lot, mostly occupying lot 15 with the wrap around porch partially overlapping Lot 14. We are only the third owner of this house, bought in 2017. The structure has remained largely unchanged with most of the original trim, siding, doors and windows. The front porch was recently restored; the roof membrane was replaced with asphalt shingles perhaps 15 years or more ago and at the same time the two main roof dormers sides – which presumably was bevel/clapboard siding – was covered or replaced with shingles as well. Windows are a mix of original wood single pane with sash cord and weights and new historically accurate Marvin wood clad windows that replaced deteriorated units under a previous permit.

Description of Work Proposed:

Owners propose to add four (4) narrow skylights to the east and west facing roof lines as well as a pair of twin windows at the back (north) gable in order to bring natural light into the attic of the home. The attic great room is quite a large and deep space with ~13 foot tall cathedral ceiling. The attic has dormers on the east and west sides, but the gable end faces the street (south/front). The gable end of the front has Palladian windows that are quite small (especially the two small double hung windows on either side of the arched window). Combined with the tall ceiling, the room is very dark.

Skylights: Our goal is to bring more natural light into the space with a balanced look of two skylights on either side of the roof (east and west facing roof lines). Each skylight would be relatively small/narrow in order to fit within the existing original roof rafters, so as to avoid any structural changes/modifications to the home. As a result owners propose two narrow skylights (~21" wide) on each side rather than one larger skylight on each side. One narrow skylight on each side will feel disproportionate and would not be aesthetically appropriate for the interior space and, as described, anything larger would require structural modifications (which we would like to avoid).

The proposed skylights will have a minimal profile and will only protrude above the roofline by approximately 2 inches or less (see attached specification sheet). The proposed skylights would be located approximately 7-8 feet back from the beginning of the roofline - we intentionally pulled the location back to minimize potential visibility from the street. It is not possible to move the skylights further back behind the dormers because of the existence of a bathroom with plumbing and tile, etc, which would prevent installation of a skylight to the north of the dormers. Additionally, the proposed skylights on both the east and west side gables would be minimally visible from the street/sidewalk. On the east side, the view of the roofline is obscured by two large trees on the south-east corner of the house (south facade) that also obscures the roofline on both the south, east, and west sides. On the west side, the view of the roofline is obscured by a very large house and large ash tree and maple tree located within 10-15 feet of our house. Photos of the minimal roofline views are provided as attachments. The proposed skylight locations are consistent with the "Design Guidelines for Historic Sides and Districts in Montgomery County, Maryland" (skylights are lower than the ridgeline, are minimal in profile, are not proposed on front facade locations, etc).

Double Window at Rear (North) Gable: Owners also propose the installation of two small windows at the back gable to provide additional light. Due to the presence of a structural king post stud in the gable-end supporting the ridge beam, we are proposing two matching approx. 18' x 18" sash fixed windows on either side trimmed similar to existing windows, rather than a single window in the center.



Drawing Scale: 1" = 10'-0"

9.12.17

Clark House Duke Schaeffer & Hannah Graae 3713 Underwood St. Chevy Chase, MD 20815

2017-01-Clark House

SITE PLAN

12





2017-01-Clark House





2017-01-Clark House

ROOF 6 15







FULL EX. 2X6 PARTER EX. MAPHONT MITINGLED-RESAMBO FELT PAPER PPENUMED 1/2" DAT. SHTHE ORIG. IX BAPPED SHTHE 6° 0 - PAFTER @ 24" 014 ,2 MAX DEPTH OPEN GEN MPRAY FAMM (R 22 ±) oo 0 OPTIONAL 1/2"GWB TAPED SPREELED, SANDED + PRIMED TEPICAL IMPROVED ROOF PAFTER GRATION (I) 3" THROUGH -CMT 3 VE. VE 1/95 4 Drawing Scale: 0' 2' 4' **Clark House** 9.12.17 10,2,17

2017-01-Clark House





ATTACHMENT 5 – Photographs

South View – Close Up of Front Facade



South View – Front Façade with Oak tree, maple, and crepe myrtle visible.



South View – Front façade with Oak tree and maple tree visible (ash tree in background)



East View – East façade with crepe myrtle and maple tree visible.



East View – East façade with crepe myrtle and maple tree visible.



East view – East façade from a distance showing tree lined street blocking roofline view.



East view – east façade as viewed from street.



East Façade - Close up of east façade.



West view – West façade showing neighbors house, large ash tree and oak tree in background, and maple tree in foreground.



West view - Close up of west façade.



North View – Close up of Rear (north) façade.