MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 10304 Montgomery Ave., Kensington

Meeting Date: 5/26/2021

Resource: Primary One Resource

Report Date: 5/19/2021

Kensington Historic District

Applicant: David Vogt

Public Notice: 5/12/2021

Review: HAWP

Tax Credit: No

Case No.: Pending

Staff: Dan Bruechert

PROPOSAL: Accessory Structure Demolition, Accessory Dwelling Unit Construction, and Porch Demolition

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the HPC approve the HAWP.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Primary One Resource within the Kensington Historic District

STYLE: Colonial Revival

DATE: 1893

Figure 1: 10304 Montgomery Ave.
PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to remove a non-historic rear deck and to demolish an existing accessory structure and construct a new ADU in the rear of the property.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

Kensington Historic District Guidelines

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Kensington Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the Approved & Adopted Amendment to the Master Plan for Historic Preservation: Kensington Historic District, Atlas #31/6 (Amendment), Vision of Kensington: A Long-Range Preservation Plan (Vision), Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Approved & Adopted Amendment to the Master Plan for Historic Preservation: Kensington Historic District, Atlas #31/6

"In regard to the properties identified as secondary resources--that is visually contributing, but non-historic structures or vacant land within the Kensington District--the Ordinance requires the Preservation Commission to be lenient in its judgment of plans for contemporary structures or for plans involving new construction unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding resources or impair the character of the district."

Vision of Kensington: A Long-Range Preservation Plan

The HPC formally adopted the planning study, Vision of Kensington: A Long-Range Preservation Plan, and is directed by the Executive Regulations, which were approved by the County Council, to use this plan when considering changes and alterations to the Kensington Historic District. The goal of this preservation plan "was to establish a sound database of information from, which to produce a document that would serve the HPC, M-NCPPC, their staff and the community in wrestling with the protection of historic districts amidst the pressures of life in the 21st century." (page 1). The plan provides a specific physical description of the district as it is; an analysis of character-defining features of the district; a discussion of the challenges facing the district; and a discussion of proposed strategies for maintaining the character of the district while allowing for appropriate growth and change.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to ensure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the
I.

A historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The Standards are as follows:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF DISCUSSION

The subject property is a two-story Colonial Revival house with clapboard siding on a large lot. To the rear of the property is a one-bay garage. The applicant proposes to demolish the existing one-bay garage and construct a one-and-a-half-story accessory dwelling unit (ADU) and demolish a non-historic rear deck. Staff finds the work is compatible with the house and surrounding district and recommends the HPC approve the HAWP.

Accessory Building Demolition and ADU Construction

At the rear of the property is a one-bay, front gable garage constructed just off of the property line. The garage faces north. Staff was unable to determine the date of construction of the structure, but has determined that it was built sometime after 1924. Below are two Sanborn Maps. The 1911 Map shows no accessory structure at all behind the house (it also does not show a property boundary between the subject property and the house at 18 Carroll Place, but that’s an investigation for a different day). The 1924 Sanborn shows there was a small accessory structure to the rear of the house, however, it faces towards the east and appears to be even smaller than the existing structure. Having determined that the existing garage was constructed after 1924, and because Chapter 24A does not account for acquired significance, Staff finds that it is acceptable to demolish the structure under 24A-8(b)(1) and (2),
In place of the existing garage, the applicant proposes to construct a one-and-a-half-story ADU. This structure will be located 15’ 3” (fifteen feet, three inches) off of the western property line and placed directly behind the house. The proposed structure has a bungalow form with a traditional architectural vocabulary that includes multi-lite windows, clapboard siding, and front and rear wall dormers. The structure measures 23’ × 23’ (twenty-three feet square), which is the approximate size of a two-car garage; and is 20’ tall. There are no trees in the rear yard that will be impacted by the proposed
The house will have fiber cement clapboard siding, Andersen 400 Series clad windows and doors, and an architectural shingle roof. The applicant proposes to repurpose a salvaged barn door for the opening on the north elevation. The east elevation, which faces the house, will have a small shed-roofed porch, supported by wood columns.

Staff finds the size of the proposed ADU, consistent with a two-car garage, is not out of scale with the houses and outbuildings in the surrounding district. While the proposed 20’ (twenty-foot) height is taller than many of the accessory structures in the district, its height is mitigated by a few factors. First, the proposed structure will be largely obscured from the right-of-way by the house. By placing the ADU directly behind the house, views of the structure are limited to oblique angles that are more than 175’ (one hundred seventy-five feet) from the ADU. Second, by utilizing large dormers in the design, the apparent massing of the second floor is reduced, so the building will not look like a cube. Staff also notes that the houses at 10225 Carroll Place and 10225 Montgomery Ave. both have one-and-a-half to two-story accessory buildings, so Staff finds the size of the proposal is not out of scale with the immediate surrounding area.

Staff finds the materials are all compatible substitute materials for new construction and building additions within the Kensington Historic District (per Standards 9 and 10). They maintain a traditional appearance but are recognizable as new. Additionally, the visual impact the materials will have on the surrounding district is reduced by the large setback to the right-of-way.

Finally, Staff finds the design of the proposed structure is compatible with the surrounding Victorian and early 20th-century architecture. The simple design will not visually compete with the grand scale and high style of the surrounding homes. Staff recommends the HPC approve the proposed ADU under 24A-8(b)(1), (2), and (d); and Standards 2, 9, and 10.

Deck Demolition
At the rear of the house is a hexagonal wood deck, approximately 3’ (three feet) above grade. The applicant proposes to demolish the deck.

The deck is a contemporary feature that is not visible from the right of way. The application materials state that temporary barriers will be installed at the rear French Doors. Staff assumes that the applicant is still developing plans for a replacement deck and notes a HAWP will be needed for a replacement deck, except for an in-kind reproduction that would match the materials, dimensions, and finish of the existing deck.

Removing the deck will not impact the historic character of the house or surrounding district and Staff recommends the HPC approve its demolition under 24A-8(1) and (d) and Standards 9 and 10.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**
Staff recommends that the Commission approve the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b)(1), (2), and (d), and the Vision of Kensington, and the Kensington Historic District Designation, having found that the proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2, 9, and 10

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present an electronic set of drawings, if applicable, to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to
submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make any alterations to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or dan.bruechert@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
David Vogt, B. Arch | Director of Project Development | www.casedesign.com
240-235-9745 (o) | 301-219-7626 (m) | DVogt@casedesign.com
daytime # 301-219-7626

Premises:
10304 Montgomery Ave, Kensington MD 20895
Capron Residence
10304 Montgomery Ave Kensington MD 20895

Proposed Addition Project

Capron CONTRACT Carriage.vwx

CONTRACT prelim

THESE PLANS HAVE BEEN PREPARED BY CASE DESIGN/REMODELING, INC. SOLELY FOR ITS USE AND SHOULD NOT BE RELIED UPON BY ANY OTHER PARTIES.

Alexandria
119 N. Washington St.
Alexandria, VA  22314
(p) 703.000.0000
(f) 703.000.0001

Bethesda
4701 Sangamore Road
North Plaza, Suite 40
Bethesda, MD  20816
(p) 301.229.4600
(f) 301.229.3185

Washington, DC
1327 14th Street NW
Wash., DC  20005
(p) 202.556.2273
(f) 202.229.3185

Falls Church
701 Park Avenue
Falls Church, VA  22046
(p) 703.241.2980
(f) 703.534.0207

Document Sheet Index

Sheet No. | Description
--- | ---
A01 | Cover Sheet/General Notes
A02 | Schedules
A03 | Site/Roof Plan
A04 | Carriage House Plans
A05 | Main House Bath Details
A06 | Carriage House Plans
A07 | Carriage House Sections
A08 | Carriage House Elevations
A09 | Carriage House Electrical Plans
A10 | Carriage House Kitchen Details
A11 | Carriage House Bath Details

TOTAL SHEETS 8

Dimensions shown or scaled are subject to change for actual job conditions.

Materials are to be as specified or equal or standard when not specified.

Three-dimensional drawings are for conceptual purposes only and should not be relied upon for detailed information.

Installed materials may vary in appearance from drawings, reference manufacturer's product data.

For actual approval & specifications.

Clients for Life
Section at Dormers

- R-10 insulation
- Stemwall to continue 8” above finished floor - flashing at exterior, typ
- Conditioned crawlspace - OPTION for full basement with exterior stairs

Section at Gable Ends

- R-10 insulation
- 2x10 joists
- Beam below floor
- Stemwall to continue 8” above finished floor - flashing at exterior, typ
- Conditioned crawlspace - OPTION for full basement with exterior stairs

Details:
- 2x10 rafters @ 16" O.C. - furled down for 7.5" foam depth
- 7.5" closed-cell spray-foam insulation = R-49
- Structural ridge - support on girder trusses each end

Pre-manufactured trusses at 4’ each end - girder trusses to support structural ridge at dormers

Conditioned crawlspace - OPTION for full basement with exterior stairs
Pre-manufactured trusses at 4' each end - girder trusses to support structural ridge at dormers.

Exterior barn door

B. O. joists

West Elevation - Facing Rear

North Elevation - Facing Driveway

Conditioned crawlspace - OPTION for full basement with exterior stairs

Basement stairway

Exterior barn door

1st Fl Fin Clg

2nd Fl Fin Fl

1st Fl Fin Fl

B. O. joists

Truss roof at end

Stick-frame at dormers both sides

Truss roof at end

South Elevation

East Elevation - Facing House

2nd Fl Fin Fl

1st Fl Fin Clg

1st Fl Fin Clg

B. O. joists

1/4" = 1'-0"
Assume all new recessed lights are LED verify size

Dave: we should change this to two sconces, but the electrical quote only shows one fixture...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line #</th>
<th>Qty</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Hinge</th>
<th>FE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>TVBSF0538</td>
<td>36&quot; x 34.5&quot; x 21&quot; Tall Vanity Base Special 3 Stack Vanity Depth 21&quot; Drawer Stack Left</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>FWID</td>
<td>Full Width Drawer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>TV3D21</td>
<td>36&quot; x 34.5&quot; x 21&quot; Tall Vanity Three Drawer Vanity Depth 21&quot;</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>TVF3</td>
<td>36&quot; x 30&quot; x 0.75&quot; Tall Vanity Filler</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>NTS</td>
<td>No Toe Space</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>BSM</td>
<td>Base Shoe Mounting Random Length</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>TP10ANT</td>
<td>Touch Up Paint 1 oz Jar with Brush and fill sticks SIMPLY WHITE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>WTK</td>
<td>Wood Toe Kick</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Capron Residence
Proposed Addition Project
10304 Montgomery Ave Kensington MD 20895

Project No: 26-24-0208
Development: ELW
Design: DV
Management: PM

CONTRACT prelim
THESE PLANS HAVE BEEN PREPARED BY CASE DESIGN/REMODELING, INC. SOLELY FOR ITS USE AND SHOULD NOT BE RELIED UPON BY ANY OTHER PARTIES

Bethesda
4701 Sangamore Road
North Plaza, Suite 40
Bethesda, MD 20816
(p) 301.229.4600
(f) 301.229.3185

Falls Church
701 Park Avenue
Falls Church, VA 22046
(p) 703.241.2980
(f) 703.534.0207

Washington, DC
1327 14th Street NW
Wash., DC 20005
(p) 202.556.2273
(f) 202.229.3185

Alexandria
119 N. Washington St.
Alexandria, VA 22314
(p) 703.000.0000
(f) 703.000.0001

Carriage House Plans

Carriage House Second Floor Plan
1/4" = 1'-0"

Carriage House First Floor Plan
1/4" = 1'-0"

Carriage House Basement Plan OPTION
1/8" = 1'-0"

Option for extended slab and concrete steps to OPTIONAL basement

Shutter at side of window

Sump pump and area drain

R-13 batt insulation and 2x4 stud furring OR R-10 continuous insulation, typical

8'-0" ceiling line

6'-10.5" ceiling

6'-8" ceiling

8'-0" ceiling

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"

2'-0" 3'-4" 5'-10 1/2"

3'-0" 6'-8" 8'-0"
Capron Residence
Proposed Addition Project
10804 Montgomery Ave Bethesda MD 20895

Basement Slab
8'-0" R-19 insulation

Conditioned crawlspace - OPTION for full basement
Stemwall to continue 8" above finished floor - flashing at exterior, typ

2x8 rafters @ 16" O.C. - furred down for 7.5" foam depth
7.5" closed cell spray foam insulation ≤ R-49

Structural ridge - support on girder trusses each end

Beam below floor

Beam in floor?

2x10 joists

12'-0" Beam in floor?

Section at Dormers

1/4" = 1'-0"
Capron Residence
Proposed Addition Project
10804 Montgomery Ave Kensington MD 20895

CONTRACT prelim
THESE PLANS HAVE BEEN PREPARED BY CASE DESIGN/REMODELING, INC. SOLELY FOR ITS USE AND SHOULD NOT BE RELIED UPON BY ANY OTHER PARTIES.

Bethesda
4701 Sangamore Road
North Plaza, Suite 40
Bethesda, MD 20816
(p) 301.229.4600
(f) 301.229.3185

Falls Church
701 Park Avenue
Falls Church, VA 22046
(p) 703.241.2980
(f) 703.534.0207

Washington, DC
1327 14th Street NW
Wash., DC 20005
(p) 202.556.2273
(f) 202.229.3185

Alexandria
119 N. Washington St.
Alexandria, VA 22314
(p) 703.000.0000
(f) 703.000.0001

property line
12'-6"
23'-0"
23'-0"
12'-6"
Center new Carriage House on (E) deck and rear addition
(E) Deck
(E) Porch
(E) Areaway
(E) Porch
(R) Areaway
(E) Porch

Remodel hall Bath at Main House Second floor