III.C

MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 4811 Cumberland Ave., Chevy Chase  Meeting Date: 7/15/2020
Resource: Primary (Pre-1915) Resource  Report Date: 7/8/2020
(Somerset Historic District)  Public Notice: 7/1/2020
Applicant: James Belikove & Vanessa Piala  Tax Credit: N/A
(Jason Arce, Agent)
Review: Preliminary Consultation  Staff: Michael Kyne
Case Number: N/A

PROPOSAL: Construction of new rear addition, hardscape alteration

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the applicants make any revisions based upon the HPC’s comments and return with a HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION:

SIGNIFICANCE: Primary (Pre-1915) Resource within the Somerset District
DATE: c. 1917

Fig. 1: Subject property, as marked by the blue star.
PROPOSAL:

The applicants propose a new rear addition and hardscape alterations at the subject property.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES:

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Somerset Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(a) The commission shall instruct the director to deny a permit if it finds, based on the evidence and information presented to or before the commission that the alteration for which the permit is sought would be inappropriate, inconsistent with or detrimental to the preservation, enhancement or ultimate protection of the historic site or historic resource within an historic district, and to the purposes of this chapter.

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or

(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.
(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

**Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation:**

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” Standards 2, 9, and 10 most directly apply to the application before the commission:

#2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

#9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

#10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**STAFF DISCUSSION:**

The applicants propose to remove an existing porch from the rear/right (northeast) corner of the house. Additionally, the applicants propose to remove an existing walkway connecting the porch to be removed to another porch in the rear/left (northwest) corner of the house. A new one-story building addition is proposed in place of the porch and walkway to be removed. A bay window on the right (east) side of the house will also be removed, with French doors installed in its place. Although the application states that there have been three or four previous additions to the historic house, it is unclear whether the features to be removed are original to the house or previous additions.
The applicants also propose to replace an existing crumbling stone wall at the east property line. According to the submitted photographs, at least a portion of the existing stone wall has a wooden picket fence on top of it. The application states that the stone retaining wall will be replaced with a similar retaining wall, but specifications for the replacement retaining wall have not been submitted. The applicants have also not indicated whether fencing is proposed on top of the replacement retaining wall.

Staff seeks additional information from the applicants regarding the date of construction of the features to be removed (i.e., porch, walkway, bay window). Staff also seeks additional regarding the proposed replacement retaining wall information (i.e., height, materials, fencing or other features). Staff asks for the Commission’s guidance regarding the proposed demolition/alterations, based upon any additional information provided by the applicants.
Staff seeks the Commission’s guidance regarding the appropriateness of the proposed location for the new addition. The Commission typically requires additions to be entirely at the rear and inset from each corner of the historic house. This reduces the visibility of additions from the public right-of-way and ensures that they do not detract from the historic house or surrounding streetscape. As depicted in the submitted plans, the proposed addition will project beyond the right (east) side of the historic house. The applicants have not indicated whether there are setback or programming requirements that preclude an addition entirely at the rear.

Material specifications for the proposed addition have not been submitted as of this writing. In order to determine appropriateness and compatibility, staff asks for specifications for all proposed building materials, including siding, roofing, doors, and windows.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the applicants make any revisions based upon the HPC’s comments and return with a HAWP application.
Application for
Historic Area Work Permit
Historic Preservation Commission
301.563.3400

Applicant:

Name: ____________________________
Address: __________________________
Daytime Phone: _____________________

E-mail: ____________________________
City: ________________ Zip: __________

Agent/Contact (if applicable):

Name: Jason Arce
Address: 7913 MacArthur Blvd.
Daytime Phone: 703.328.2850

E-mail: jason@anthonywilder.com
City: Cabin John Zip: 20818
Contractor Registration No.: BC213041

Location of Building/Premise: MIHP # of Historic Property

M: 35-36 Somerset

Is the Property Located within an Historic District? Yes/District Name
No/Individual Site Name

Is there an Historic Preservation/Land Trust/Environmental Easement on the Property? If YES, include a map of the easement, and documentation from the Easement Holder supporting this application.

Are other Planning and/or Hearing Examiner Approvals /Reviews Required as part of this Application? (Conditional Use, Variance, Record Plat, etc.) If YES, include information on these reviews as supplemental information.

Building Number: ________________ Street: __________________________

Town/City: __________________________ Nearest Cross Street: __________________________

Lot: __________ Block: __________ Subdivision: _______ Parcel: _______

Type of Work Proposed: See the checklist on Page 4 to verify that all supporting items for proposed work are submitted with this application. Incomplete Applications will not be accepted for review. Check all that apply:

☐ New Construction
☐ Deck/Porch
☐ Shed/Garage/Accessory Structure

☐ Addition
☐ Fence
☐ Solar

☐ Demolition
☐ Hardscape/Landscape
☐ Tree removal/planting

☐ Grading/Excavation
☐ Roof
☐ Window/Door

☐ Other: Retaining wall

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct and accurate and that the construction will comply with plans reviewed and approved by all necessary agencies and hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Signature of owner or authorized agent Date

06.24.20
Description of Property: Please describe the building and surrounding environment. Include information on significant structures, landscape features, or other significant features of the property:

The house is a historic house that has had 3-4 additions in the past. There is a slope up on the right side of the property that leads to the neighbors property. This is being held up by a masonry wall that is completely crumbling. The rear yard (location of proposed addition) is flat.

Description of Work Proposed: Please give an overview of the work to be undertaken:

The first floor will be reconfigured to provide better circulation and unify a chopped up floor plan which includes relocating the kitchen, powder room and laundry/mud room. We are proposing a master suite addition off of the back in order for the owners to have a home that they can age in place in, avoiding stairs. The existing retaining wall on the right side of the property will be replaced with a similar retaining wall.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Item 1: First floor renovation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description of Current Condition:</strong> Poor circulation with very narrow corridors (not wheelchair friendly). Very dark floor layout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Proposed Work:</strong> Open up the floor plan to provide a wheelchair friendly layout allowing more light to come in. Relocation of kitchen, powder room and laundry room for better circulation and open space.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Item 2: Master suite addition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description of Current Condition:</strong> Existing master bedroom is upstairs and is becoming hard for owners to move up and down stairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Proposed Work:</strong> First floor addition off of the back of the house will allow for owners to age in place and be wheelchair friendly. Master suite will be taking the place of an existing rear roofed porch that will be removed. No trees will be affected.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Item 3: Replacement of retaining wall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description of Current Condition:</strong> Existing retaining wall is crumbling and damaging the existing landscape and allowing the neighbors water run off to accumulate on the property</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Proposed Work:</strong> Replace the existing masonry wall with a similar masonry wall. Wall will be hand dug to avoid damaging or removing any existing trees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Construction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additions/Alterations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demolition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deck/Porch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fence/Wall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Driveway/Parking Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grading/Excavation/Landscape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tree Removal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siding/Roof Changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Window/Door Changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masonry Repair/Repaint</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GAME ROOM
STORAGE ROOM
FAMILY ROOM
MECHANICAL ROOM
CRAWL SPACE

GENERAL DEMOLITION NOTES:
1. PROTECT ALL FLOORS, WALLS, CEILINGS, AND FURNITURE/BUILT-INS TO REMAIN UNDISTURBED DURING CONSTRUCTION.
2. EXISTING BOILER TO BE REMOVED AND PREPARED FOR NEW NOT IN SCOPE
3. CAP PLUMBING LINES WHERE FIXTURES & APPLIANCES HAVE BEEN REMOVED
4. PROVIDE TEMPORARY SHORING AS REQUIRED

DEMO PLAN NOTES:
1. EXISTING BOILER TO BE REMOVED AND PREPARED FOR NEW

THIS DRAWING IS THE PROPERTY OF AND FOR USE OF ANTHONY WILDER DESIGN/BUILD, INC. THE USE OF THE IDEAS EXPRESSED IN THIS DRAWING IS NOT TO BE COPIED, REPRODUCED OR SHARED WITH ANY THIRD PARTY IN ANY WAY. COPYRIGHT © 2020 ANTHONY WILDER DESIGN/BUILD INC. 7913 MACARTHUR BLVD 2ND FLOOR CABIN JOHN, MD 20818 301.907.0100
WWW.ANTHONYWILDER.COM

SHEET NUMBER
SHEET TITLE
DATE
DRAWN BY:

BELIKOVE-PIALA RESIDENCE
4811 CUMBERLAND AVENUE, CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815
Schematic Design May 27, 2020
HPC Review Set
Design Development June 11, 2020
Letter of Commitment June 23, 2020
HPC Review June 24, 2020

01 BASEMENT DEMOLITION PLAN
1/4" = 1'-0"
GENERAL DEMO PLAN NOTES:
1. PROTECT ALL FLOORS, WALLS, CEILINGS, AND FURNITURE/BUILT-INS TO REMAIN UNDISTURBED DURING CONSTRUCTION.
2. CAP PLUMBING LINES WHERE FIXTURES & APPLIANCES HAVE BEEN REMOVED.
3. PROVIDE TEMPORARY SHORING AS REQUIRED

DEMO PLAN NOTES:
1. REMOVE EXISTING FOYER WALL AND CASED OPENING
2. REMOVE EXISTING FOYER CLOSET
3. REMOVE HALL CLOSET AND PART OF EXISTING WALL
4. REMOVE PORTION OF LIVING ROOM WALL
5. REMOVE PORTION OF KITCHEN WALLS, ALL EXISTING CABINETS, COUNTERS, AND APPLIANCES
6. REMOVE EXISTING COUNTER AND SECOND SINK
7. REMOVE BAY WINDOW
8. REMOVE EXISTING DOOR AND PORTION OF WALL FOR LARGER CASED OPENING
9. ENLARGE EXISTING CASED OPENING TO FOYER
10. REMOVE EXISTING DOOR FROM BREAKFAST NOOK TO EXTERIOR
11. REMOVE INTERIOR WALLS OF BREAKFAST NOOK
12. REMOVE EXISTING CLOSET AND POWDER ROOM WALLS
13. REMOVE PORTION OF WALL FOR LARGER CASED OPENING
14. REMOVE EXISTING WINDOW
15. REMOVE EXTERIOR WALL, DOOR, AND WINDOW
16. REMOVE EXISTING PORCH, COLUMNS AND STEPS
17. REMOVE WALKWAY BETWEEN PORCHES
18. REMOVE PART OF COLUMNS AND RAILINGS
19. REMOVE EXISTING RETAINING WALL ALONG RIGHT SIDE OF PROPERTY
20. REMOVE EXISTING SKYLIGHT AND PREPARE FOR NEW...

FIRST FLOOR DEMOLITION PLAN
NOT IN SCOPE

GENERAL DEMO PLAN NOTES:
1. PROTECT ALL FLOORS, WALLS, CEILINGS, AND FURNITURE/BUILT-INS TO REMAIN UNDISTURBED DURING CONSTRUCTION.
2. TO BE REMOVED.
3. CAPTAIN MOLDING WHERE FIXTURES & APPLIANCES HAVE BEEN REMOVED.
4. PROVIDE TEMPORARY SHORING AS REQUIRED.

DEMO PLAN NOTES #:
1. REMOVE EXISTING CARPET
2. REMOVE EXISTING PORCH ROOF

15 ROOF DEMOLITION PLAN
1/4" = 1'-0"
GENERAL ARCHITECTURE PLAN NOTES:

1. DRAWINGS ARE GRAPHIC REPRESENTATIONS OF EXISTING CONDITIONS AND DESIGN INTENT. ACTUAL FIELD CONDITIONS MAY VARY FROM WHAT IS SHOWN.

2. PROTECT ALL FLOORS, WALLS, CEILINGS, AND FURNITURE/BUILT-INS TO REMAIN UNDISTURBED DURING CONSTRUCTION.

3. WALLS TO REMAIN.
   NEW WALLS - EXTERIOR WALLS 2x6 @ 16" O.C. U.O.N.; NON BEARING AND BEARING INTERIOR WALLS 2x4 or 2x6 @ 16" O.C.

4. ALL DIMENSIONS ARE TO FACE OF STUD U.O.N. VERIFY ALL DIMENSIONS IN FIELD.

5. RELOCATE MECHANICAL DUCTS AND PLUMBING AS REQUIRED.

6. PROVIDE NEW WOOD FLOOR TO MATCH EXISTING IF NOT ENOUGH EXISTING CAN BE SALVAGED DURING DEMO.

7. WINDOW AND DOOR TRIM, BASE AND CROWN: SEE FINISH SCHEDULE.

8. TEMPORARY KITCHENETTE TO BE LOCATED UPSTAIRS.

9. NEW DOORS SIMILAR TO EXISTING DOORS IN THE HOUSE: PROFILE T.B.D.

10. PROVIDE BLOCKING WITHIN WALLS AT WALL MTD. FIXTURES - TOWEL RACKS, SCONCES, CABINETS ETC. - AS REQUIRED.

11. SEE MEP AND STRUCTURAL PLANS FOR ADDITIONAL NOTES AND INFORMATION.

12. GLASS SHOWERS ENCLOSURES
   12.1. MINIMUM 3/8" THICK DOORS
   12.2. MINIMUM 1 1/2" THICK STATIONARY PANELS

ARCHITECTURE PLAN NOTES  

1. BOILER/FURNACE TO BE REPLACED IF NECESSARY
2. EXISTING CRAWL SPACE TO BE INSULATED AND SEMI-CONDITIONED
3. FOUNDATION TO BE INSPECTED FOR WATER DAMAGE

PROPOSED BASEMENT PLAN

NOT IN SCOPE

PROPOSED BASEMENT PLAN

Schematic Design May 27, 2020
HPC Review Set
Design Development June 11, 2020
Letter of Commitment June 23, 2020
HPC Review June 24, 2020

BELKOVE-PIALA RESIDENCE
4811 CUMBERLAND AVENUE, CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815

PROPOSED BASEMENT PLAN

1/4" = 1'-0"

N

PROPOSED BASEMENT PLAN

HPC Review Set

SHEET NUMBER
SHEET TITLE
DATE
DRAWN BY:

BELKOVE-PIALA RESIDENCE
4811 CUMBERLAND AVENUE, CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815

Schematic Design May 27, 2020
HPC Review Set
Design Development June 11, 2020
Letter of Commitment June 23, 2020
HPC Review June 24, 2020

PROPOSED BASEMENT PLAN

1/4" = 1'-0"

N
1. DRAWINGS ARE GRAPHIC REPRESENTATIONS OF EXISTING CONDITIONS AND DESIGN INTENT. ACTUAL FIELD CONDITIONS MAY VARY FROM WHAT IS SHOWN.

2. PROTECT ALL FLOORS, WALLS, CEILINGS, AND FURNITURE/BUILT-INS TO REMAIN UNDISTURBED DURING CONSTRUCTION.

3. NEW WALLS - EXTERIOR WALLS 2x6 @ 16" O.C. U.O.N.; NON BEARING AND BEARING INTERIOR WALLS 2x4 or 2x6 @ 16" O.C.

4. ALL DIMENSIONS ARE TO FACE OF STUD U.O.N. VERIFY ALL DIMENSIONS IN FIELD.

5. RELOCATE MECHANICAL DUCTS AND PLUMBING AS REQUIRED.

6. PROVIDE NEW WOOD FLOOR TO MATCH EXISTING IF NOT ENOUGH EXISTING CAN BE SALVAGED DURING DEMO.

7. WINDOW AND DOOR TRIM, BASE AND CROWN: SEE FINISH SCHEDULE.

8. TEMPORARY KITCHENETTE TO BE LOCATED UP STAIRS.

9. NEW DOORS SIMILAR TO EXISTING DOORS IN THE HOUSE: PROFILE T.B.D.

10. PROVIDE BLOCKING WITHIN WALLS AT WALL MTD. FIXTURES - TOWEL RACKS, SCONCES, CABINETS ETC. - AS REQUIRED.

11. SEE MEP AND STRUCTURAL PLANS FOR ADDITIONAL NOTES AND INFORMATION.

12. GLASS SHOWERS ENCLOSURES
   12.1. MINIMUM 3/8" THICK DOORS
   12.2. MINIMUM 1/2" THICK STATIONARY PANELS

ARCHITECTURE PLAN NOTES:

1. NEW HARDWOOD FLOORS TO BE INSTALLED
2. REPLACE 2-3 DAMAGED HARDWOOD FLOOR PLANKS
3. RESHAPE EXISTING FOYER WITH NEW COAT CLOSET
4. NEW POWDER ROOM
5. NEW BUTLERS PANTRY
6. NEW LAUNDRY ROOM WITH CLOSET/PANTRY
7. NEW MUDROOM WITH LARGER CASED OPENINGS TO OFFICE AND KITCHEN
8. CONVERT EXISTING DINING ROOM TO OFFICE SPACE
9. REMOVE BAY WINDOW, FILL IN EXISTING WALL FLUSH WITH NEW FRENCH DOOR W/ SIDELIGHTS
10. SHIFT AND WIDEN HALLWAY FROM FOYER TO FAMILY ROOM WITH LARGER CASED OPENINGS
11. WIDEN EXISTING CASED OPENING TO FAMILY ROOM
12. NEW KITCHEN WITH NEW APPLIANCES, FLOORS, CABINETRY AND COUNTERS
13. NEW MASTER SUITE WITH 2 WALK IN CLOSETS, MASTER BATHROOM, AND HALLWAY LEADING TO EXISTING PORCH
14. EXISTING LIVING ROOM TO BE NEW DINING ROOM
15. NEW SKYLIGHT TO REPLACE EXISTING
16. NEW GAS FIREPLACE INSERT
17. NEW RETAINING WALL TO REPLACE EXISTING WITH SIM.
GENERAL ARCHITECTURE PLAN NOTES:
1. DRAWINGS ARE GRAPHIC REPRESENTATIONS OF EXISTING CONDITIONS AND DESIGN INTENT. ACTUAL FIELD CONDITIONS MAY VARY FROM WHAT IS SHOWN.
2. PROTECT ALL FLOORS, WALLS, CEILINGS, AND FURNITURE/BUILT-INS TO REMAIN UNDISTURBED DURING CONSTRUCTION.
3. NEW WALLS - EXTERIOR WALLS 2x6 @ 16" O.C. U.O.N.; NON BEARING AND BEARING INTERIOR WALLS 2x4 or 2x6 @ 16" O.C.
4. ALL DIMENSIONS ARE TO FACE OF STUD U.O.N. VERIFY ALL DIMENSIONS IN FIELD.
5. RELOCATE MECHANICAL DUCTS AND PLUMBING AS REQUIRED.
6. PROVIDE NEW WOOD FLOOR TO MATCH EXISTING IF NOT ENOUGH EXISTING CAN BE SALVAGED DURING DEMO.
7. WINDOW AND DOOR TRIM, BASE AND CROWN: SEE FINISH SCHEDULE.
8. TEMPORARY KITCHENETTE TO BE LOCATED UP STAIRS.
9. NEW DOORS SIMILAR TO EXISTING DOORS IN THE HOUSE: PROFILE T.B.D.
10. PROVIDE BLOCKING WITHIN WALLS AT WALL MTD. FIXTURES - TOWEL RACKS, SCONCES, CABINETS ETC. - AS REQUIRED.
11. SEE MEP AND STRUCTURAL PLANS FOR ADDITIONAL NOTES AND INFORMATION.
12. GLASS SHOWERS ENCLOSURES
   12.1. MINIMUM 3/8" THICK DOORS
   12.2. MINIMUM 1" THICK STATIONARY PANELS
ARCHITECTURE PLAN NOTES  '#':
1. NEW HARDWOOD FLOORS TO BE INSTALLED
2. NEW ROOF OVER ADDITION TO TIE INTO EXISTING
3. EXISTING ROOFS TO REMAIN

NOT IN SCOPE

BELKOVE-PIALA RESIDENCE
4811 CUMBERLAND AVENUE, CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815
Schematic Design May 27, 2020
HPC Review Set
Design Development June 11, 2020
Letter of Commitment June 23, 2020
HPC Review June 24, 2020

01 EXISTING SECOND FLOOR & PROPOSED ROOF PLAN

HPC Review Set
A6