MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

Address: 2 Newlands St., Chevy Chase

Meeting Date: 3/11/2020

Resource: Contributing Resource

Report Date: 3/4/2019

(Chevy Chase Village Historic District)

Public Notice: 2/26/2019

Applicant: Jenifer and Danielle Aguirre

Tax Credit: N/A

(Luke Olson, Architect)

Staff: Michael Kyne

Review: HAWP

Case Number: 35/13-20K

PROPOSAL: Window replacement

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the HPC approve the HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Contributing Resource within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District

STYLE: Colonial Revival

DATE: c. 1892-1916

Fig. 1: Subject property.
PROPOSAL

The applicants propose window replacement at the subject property.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the historic preservation review guidelines in the approved and adopted amendment for the Chevy Chase Village Historic District (Guidelines), Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or

(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.

(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)


**Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines**

The guidelines break down specific projects into three levels of review – Lenient, Moderate and Strict Scrutiny.

“Lenient Scrutiny” means that the emphasis of the review should be on issues of general massing and scale, and compatibility with the surrounding streetscape, and should allow for a very liberal interpretation of preservation rules. Most changes should be permitted unless there are major problems with massing, scale and compatibility.

“Moderate Scrutiny” involves a higher standard of review than “lenient scrutiny.” Besides issues of massing, scale and compatibility, preserving the integrity of the resource is taken into account. Alterations should be designed so that the altered structure still contributes to the district. Use of compatible new materials, rather than the original building materials, should be permitted. Planned changes should be compatible with the structure’s existing design, but should not be required to replicate its architectural style.

“Strict Scrutiny” means that the planned changes should be reviewed to insure that the integrity of the significant exterior architectural or landscaping features and details is not compromised. However, strict scrutiny should not be “strict in theory but fatal in fact” i.e. it does not mean that there can be no changes but simply that the proposed changes should be reviewed with extra care.

The Guidelines state three basic policies that should be adhered to, including:

Preserving the integrity of the contributing structures in the district. Alterations to contributing structures should be designed in such a way that the altered structure still contributes to the district.

Design review emphasis should be restricted to changes that will be visible from the front or side public right-of-way, or that would be visible in the absence of vegetation or landscaping.

Alterations to the portion of a property that are not visible from the public right-of-way should be subject to very lenient review. Most changes to rear of the properties should be approved as a matter of course.

The Guidelines that pertain to this project are as follows:

**Windows** (including window replacement) should be subject to lenient scrutiny if they are visible from the public right-of-way, lenient scrutiny if they are not.

**Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation**

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The Standards are as follows:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
STAFF DISCUSSION

The subject property is a c. 1892-1916 Colonial Revival-style Contributing Resource on a corner lot within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District. There is a second floor sleeping porch on the left (northeast) side of the house, which has been previously enclosed. The applicants propose to replace the existing non-historic slider windows within the enclosed sleeping porch with new aluminum-clad casement windows. The proposed new windows will take visual cues from the existing first floor casement windows.

Staff supports the applicants’ proposal. The windows to be replaced are non-historic and the proposed replacement windows are compatible in design and material with historic house. In accordance with Standards #2 and #9, the proposal will not remove or alter character-defining features of the subject property.

After full and fair consideration of the applicant’s submission staff finds the proposal as being consistent with the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-(b) 1 and 2, (c) and (d), having found the proposal is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2 and #9, and Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines outlined above.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the HAWP application only for alterations to the main house under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b) 1 and 2, (c), and (d), having found that the proposal is consistent with the Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines identified above, and therefore will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2 and #9;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the 3 permit sets of drawings, if applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make any alterations to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: L Olson E CATHABVTTS.COM
Contact Person: Luke Olson
Daytime Phone No.: 240-333-2021

Tax Account No.: 
Name of Property Owner: JAMERI DANIELLE ACHEREE
Daytime Phone No.: 
Address: 2 NEWLANDS ST CHAIN CHASE MD 20815
Street Number: City: State: Zip Code:
Contractor: TEO
Phone No.: 
Contractor Registration No.: 
Agent for Owner: Luke Olson
Daytime Phone No.: 240-333-2021

LOCATION OF HISTORIC PREMISES
House Number: 2
Street: NEWLANDS ST
Town/City: CHAIN CHASE Nearest Cross Street: CONNECTICUT AVE
Lot: P7 Block: 47 Subdivision: CHAIN CHASE SECTION 2 (0029)

PART I - RELATED PROJECT AND USE

1. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE: CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:
   [ ] Alter/Renovation □ A/C □ Sib □ Room Addition □ Porch □ Deck □ Shed
   [ ] Move □ Install □ Wheel/Frame □ Solar □ Fireplace □ Woodburning Stove □ Single Family
   [ ] Revision □ Repair □ Renovate □ Fence/Wall (complete Section 4) □ Other: 

2. Construction cost estimate: $5,000

3. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit #:

PART II - RELATED TO CONSTRUCTION AND EXCAVATION

2A. Type of sewage disposal: 01 WSSC 02 Septic 03 Other: 
2B. Type of water supply: 01 WSSC 02 Well 03 Other: 

PART III - RELATED TO VARIOUS STRENGTH WALL

3A. Height: feet inches

3B. Indicates whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
   [ ] On party line/property line [ ] Entirely on land of owner [ ] On public right of way/assessment

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the specification is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

[Signature]

Date: 2/12/2010

Approved: 905512
For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproved: ____________________________
Signature: ____________________________
Date: ____________________________

Application/Permit No.: ____________________________
Date Filed: ____________________________
Date Issued: ____________________________

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:

   PRE-1900 COLONIAL REVIVAL SPLIT FAMLY HOME
   LARGE 6 OVER 6 LOID DOUBLE HUNG WINDOWS, OLD
   TEAK & SDD. CEDAR SHINGLE SIDING

   
   
   

   
   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:

   REPLACE MUL-TWEEDER SLIDING WINDOWS TO NEW
   FLUSH SUNKEN / SLEEPING PORCH WITH NEW CHA-LO
   WOOD SOL WINDOWS

   

   
   

   

2. SITE PLAN
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plat. Your site plan must include:
   a. The scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. Dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. Site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.
   a. Schematics, construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resource(s) and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (facades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context. All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS
   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the dripline of any tree 6" or larger in diameter (at approximately 6 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS
   For ALL projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lot(s) or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT IN BLUE OR BLACK INK OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner’s mailing address</th>
<th>Owner’s Agent’s mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DAVID &amp; DANIELLE AGLIERE</td>
<td>GM ARCHITECTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8412 RITTENHOUSE ST, NW</td>
<td>7735 OLD GEORGETOWN RD STE 700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WASHINGTON, DC 20015</td>
<td>BETHESDA MD 20814</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THOMAS LOGAN &amp; SHELA LYNCH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 NEWLANDS ST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHEVY CHASE MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PATRICK &amp; LANDSAY CONWAY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 E MELROSE ST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHEVY CHASE MD 20815</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SCOPE OF WORK: REPLACEMENT OF EXG. NON-HISTORIC SLIDER WINDOWS IN 2ND FLOOR SLEEPING PORCH WITH NEW CLAD-WOOD SDL WINDOWS
NEWLANDS STREET
(60' R/W PER PLAT)

LOCATION DRAWING
PART OF LOT 7, BLOCK 47
SECTION II
CHEVY CHASE
MONTGOMERY COUNTY, MARYLAND

NOTES:
1. Setback distances as shown to the principal structure from property lines are approximate. The level of accuracy for this drawing should be taken to be no greater than plus or minus 1 foot.
2. Fences, if shown, have been located by approximate methods.
3. No Property Covenants Confirmed.

SURVEYOR’S CERTIFICATE
THE INFORMATION SHOWN HEREON HAS BEEN
BASED UPON THE RESULTS OF A FIELD INSPECTION
PENDING TO THE BEST OF USER’S KNOWLEDGE.
STRUCTURES SHOWN HAVE BEEN FIELD LOCATED BASED
UPON MEASUREMENTS FROM PROPERTY MARKERS FOUND
ON FREE SURFACE OF LAND OF APPARENT OCCUPATION.

M. W. Irwin
Surveyor

REFERENCES
PLAT BK: B
PLAT NO: 80

DATE OF LOCATIONS: 19-07-2021
SCALE: 1" = 20'

SNYDER & ASSOCIATES
LAND SURVEYORS
19544 Amerside Drive
Germantown, Maryland 20874
301/340-5100 Fax: 301/340-1256
www.snyderassociates.com

19.0627 AGUIRRE RESIDENCE
2 NEWLANDS ST., CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815

COPYRIGHT 2020, GTM ARCHITECTS, INC.
7735 OLD GEORGETOWN ROAD, SUITE 700, BETHESDA, MD 20814 - TEL: (240) 333-2000 - FAX: (240) 333-2001
Demo existing non-historic slider windows.

New clad wood SDL casement windows, center on windows/doors below.

Exterior front elevation.

Proposed front elevation.
Here's how to make our windows uniquely yours. Personalize them with the classic charm of our wood grilles. Add the authentic styling of our updated divided lites. Or you might choose to warm your dining room with our beaded or streamlined glass windows.

**SIMULATED DIVIDED LITE**

Our simulated divided lites give you the classic appeal of traditional true divided lites, but without the energy loss caused by individual glass panes. Extruded aluminum outside, natural wood inside, and optional spacers between the glass. Also available in all-wood version.

**REMOVABLE WOOD GRILLE**

Our removable wood grille is the affordable, convenient alternative to divided lites. Simply pop out the grille, wash the window, and pop it back in. Available as full surround in select pine or optional wood species.

**GRILLES BETWEEN THE GLASS**

We seal the grille between the panes of glass, so you get the visual appeal you want without the grille ever getting in your way.

Grilles between the glass come in your choice of profiles: 11/16" or 1" contour or 5/8" flat. Two-tone grilles also available.

**GRILLE CONFIGURATIONS**

Your grilles can be as traditional or as unique as you choose. Our standard configurations include rectangular and Prairie. But with our custom configurations, we're ready to transform your inspiration into reality.

**SIMULATED DIVIDED LITE PROFILES**