MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 30 West Kirke St., Chevy Chase

Meeting Date: 2/12/2020

Resource: Contributing Resource

Report Date: 2/5/2020

(Chevy Chase Village Historic District)

Public Notice: 1/29/2020

Tax Credit: N/A

Applicant: Tony Marra and Mary Sheehan

Staff: Michael Kyne

(Janet Conroy, Agent)

Case Number: 35/13-20C

PROPOSAL: Hardscape and landscape alterations

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the HPC approve the HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Contributing Resource within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District

STYLE: Colonial Revival

DATE: c. 1927-1941

Fig. 1: Subject property.
PROPOSAL

The applicants propose the following work items at the subject property:

- Construct a new brick walkway and landing at the front of the property.
- Replace the existing brick asphalt and brick driveway with an interlocking concrete block driveway in the same location.
- Install a new random rectangular flagstone patio at the rear of the subject property.
- Install a new Azek-wrapped lamppost at the left side of the driveway.
- Install new Azek arbor at the end of the driveway.
- Install a new 42" high cedar trash enclosure at the rear/right (southwest) corner of the house.
- Construct a low boulder wall at the rear of the property.
- Install steppingstones from the driveway to proposed rear patio.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the historic preservation review guidelines in the approved and adopted amendment for the Chevy Chase Village Historic District (Guidelines), Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to ensure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or

(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.
(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.

(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

**Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines**

The guidelines break down specific projects into three levels of review – Lenient, Moderate and Strict Scrutiny.

“Lenient Scrutiny” means that the emphasis of the review should be on issues of general massing and scale, and compatibility with the surrounding streetscape, and should allow for a very liberal interpretation of preservation rules. Most changes should be permitted unless there are major problems with massing, scale and compatibility.

“Moderate Scrutiny” involves a higher standard of review than “lenient scrutiny.” Besides issues of massing, scale and compatibility, preserving the integrity of the resource is taken into account. Alterations should be designed so that the altered structure still contributes to the district. Use of compatible new materials, rather than the original building materials, should be permitted. Planned changes should be compatible with the structure’s existing design, but should not be required to replicate its architectural style.

“Strict Scrutiny” means that the planned changes should be reviewed to ensure that the integrity of the significant exterior architectural or landscaping features and details is not compromised. However, strict scrutiny should not be “strict in theory but fatal in fact” i.e. it does not mean that there can be no changes but simply that the proposed changes should be reviewed with extra care.

The *Guidelines* state three basic policies that should be adhered to, including:

Preserving the integrity of the contributing structures in the district. Alterations to contributing structures should be designed in such a way that the altered structure still contributes to the district.

Design review emphasis should be restricted to changes that will be visible from the front or side public right-of-way, or that would be visible in the absence of vegetation or landscaping.

Alterations to the portion of a property that are not visible from the public right-of-way should be subject to very lenient review. Most changes to rear of the properties should be approved as a matter of course.

The *Guidelines* that pertain to this project are as follows:

**Driveways** should be subject to strict scrutiny only with regard to their impact on landscaping, particularly mature trees. In all other respects, driveways should be subject to lenient scrutiny. Parking pads and other pacing front yards should be discouraged.

**Gazebos and other garden structures** should be subject to moderate scrutiny if they are visible from the public right-of-way, lenient scrutiny if they are not.

**Lampposts and other exterior lights** should be subject to moderate scrutiny if they are visible from the
public right-of-way, lenient scrutiny if they are not.

**Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation**

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The Standards are as follows:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

**STAFF DISCUSSION**

The subject property is a c. 1927-1941 Colonial Revival-style Contributing Resource within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District. The front of the house faces West Kirke Street to the north and has a moderate setback from the street. The house has experienced previous alterations, including front porch replacement, the installation of aluminum siding, and the construction of a c. 1991 rear addition. Staff notes that the Commission approved the applicants’ proposal for front porch alterations at the May 21, 209 HPC meeting, and the front porch depicted in the proposed site plan reflects those alterations.

The applicants propose the following work items at the subject property:

- Construct a new brick walkway and landing at the front of the property.
- Replace the existing brick asphalt and brick driveway with an interlocking concrete block driveway in the same location.
- Install a new random rectangular flagstone patio at the rear of the subject property.
- Install a new Azek-wrapped lamppost at the left side of the driveway.
- Install new Azek arbor at the end of the driveway.
- Install a new 42” high cedar trash enclosure at the rear/right (southwest) corner of the house.
- Construct a low boulder wall at the rear of the property.
- Install steppingstones from the driveway to proposed rear patio.

Staff finds the proposal to be compatible with the subject property and surrounding streetscape. In accordance with the Guidelines, the proposed alterations are designed so that the property will continue to contribute to the historic district. Additionally, the proposal will not remove or alter character-defining features of the subject property, in accordance with Standards #2 and #9.

After full and fair consideration of the applicant’s submission staff finds the proposal as being consistent with the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-(b) 1 and 2, having found the proposal is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2 and #9, and Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines outlined above.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Commission **approve** the HAWP application only for alterations to the main house under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), (c), and (d), having found that the proposal is
consistent with the *Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines* identified above, and therefore will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for *Rehabilitation #2* and #9;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the **3 permit sets of drawings, if applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping** prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make **any alterations** to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
301/563-3400
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: janet@everettkanddesigns.com

Contact Person: Janet Conroy
Daytime Phone No.: 202-494-1361

Tax Account No.:

Name of Property Owner: Tony Morris, Mary Sheehan
Daytime Phone No.: 301-652-5726

Address: 30 West Kirke St, Chevy Chase, MD 20815

Contractor: TBD
Phone No.:

Contractor Registration No.:

Agent for Owner: Everett Garden Designs, LLC
Daytime Phone No.: 202-494-1361

LOCATION OF WORK

House Number: 30
Street: West Kirke Street

Town/City: Chevy Chase
Nearest Cross Street: Magnolia Parkway

Lot: 10 Block: 32
Subdivision: Section 2
Zone: R-60

PART ONE: TYPE OF PERMIT/PERMITTED USE

1A. Check all applicable:

☐ Construct ☐ Extend ☐ Add/Alter/Remove
☐ AC ☐ Slab ☐ Room Addition ☐ Porch ☐ Deck ☐ Shed
☐ Move ☐ Install ☐ Wreck/Removal
☐ Solar ☐ Fireplace ☐ Woodburning Stove ☐ Single Family
☐ Revision ☐ Repair ☐ Renovate
☐ Fence/Wall (complete Section 4) ☐ Other:

1B. Construction cost estimate: $ 40,000

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved permit, see Permit #

PART TWO: CURRENT CONSTRUCTION AND EXTENSIONS

2A. Type of sewage disposal: ☑ 01 WSC 02 Septic 03 Other:

2B. Type of water supply: ☑ 01 WSC 02 I Well 03 Other:

PART THREE: COMPLETED OR CONSTRUCTION OF RETAINING WALL

3A. Height feet inches

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:

☐ On party line/property line ☐ Entirely on land of owner ☐ On public right of way/assessment

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Signature of owner or authorized agent

1/21/20

Approved: For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproved: Signature: Date:

Applications/Permit No.: Data Filed: Date Issued:

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS

Edit 5/19/99
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:
      1) Construction of new brick walk and landing in front of residence. Existing stoop and steps to remain.
      2) Replace brick pad and asphalt driveway with Tech-Bloc Village pavers. Onyx cut sheet is attached.
      3) Build new RR flagstone patio at grade in rear yard.
      4) Master plan includes, lamp post, arbor, trash corral and free-standing decorative boulder wall.
   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resources, the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district.

The landscape design is in keeping with the style of neighboring homes and follows the general aesthetic of the Chevy Chase Village, Section 2.

2. SITE PLAN
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plot. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and data;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.
   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resources and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (facades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context.
      All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS
   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the drip line of any tree 6" or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS
   For all projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lots(s) or parcel(s) which tie directly across the street/way from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT (IN BLUE OR BLACK INK) OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.
### HAWP Application: Mailing Addresses for Notifying

[Owner, Owner’s Agent, Adjacent and Confronting Property Owners]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner’s mailing address</th>
<th>Owner’s Agent’s mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tony Harrington &amp; Mary Sheehan</td>
<td>Janet Conroy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 West Kirke Street</td>
<td>Everett Garden Designs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD</td>
<td>3 Newlands Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20815</td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bryan and Katie Anderson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 West Kirke Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Donna Evers</th>
<th>John and Lenora Lynham</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>28 West Kirke Street</td>
<td>32 West Kirke Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Robert Rowner</th>
<th>Charles Hobbs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>31 West Irving Street</td>
<td>33 West Kirke Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FRONT STOOP & LANDING

EXISTING FRONT YARD
Existing brick pad to be replaced with pavers to match new driveway.
Site of new patio

Site of new patio (asphalt lifted)
New England Outdoors Lamp post
Avon - SKU 795431
5½" SQ, 76½" H

New England Outdoors Arbor SKU 79610X
4" SQ Posts
Villagio

DESCRIPTION: Paver TEXTURE: Beveled

The Villagio paver allows for gentle curves and winding pathways, eliminating the need for cuts.

NOTES

* Colors only available in half-pallets.

See page 51 for more technical information and page 93 to 95 when used as a permeable pavement application.

Patterns are for design inspiration only. The installer is responsible to calculate & purchase the correct amount of material.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pattern</th>
<th>Linear pattern</th>
<th>Modified Herringbone pattern</th>
<th>Modified Herringbone pattern</th>
<th>Modified Herringbone pattern</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Specifications per pallet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specifications</th>
<th>Imperial</th>
<th>Metric</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cubing</td>
<td>FULL Pallet 117 ft²</td>
<td>10.88 m²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*HALF-Pallet 53.18 ft²</td>
<td>4.94 m²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weight</td>
<td>FULL Pallet 3,029 lbs</td>
<td>1,374 kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*HALF-Pallet 1,354 lbs</td>
<td>614 kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of rows</td>
<td>FULL Pallet 11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*HALF-Pallet 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coverage per row</td>
<td>10.64 ft²</td>
<td>0.99 m²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear coverage per row</td>
<td>24.94 lin. ft</td>
<td>7.61 lin. m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Void space</td>
<td>8.0 %</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint Depth</td>
<td>3/8&quot; to 9/16&quot;</td>
<td>9 to 15 mm</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Unit dimensions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Units/pallet</th>
<th>Height</th>
<th>Depth</th>
<th>Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 3/8&quot;</td>
<td>5 3/8&quot;</td>
<td>5 3/8&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 3/8&quot;</td>
<td>5 3/8&quot;</td>
<td>6 5/16&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 3/8&quot;</td>
<td>5 3/8&quot;</td>
<td>7 5/16&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 3/8&quot;</td>
<td>5 3/8&quot;</td>
<td>8 7/16&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PREFERED COLOR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Color</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>sandstone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>slate grey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mojave beige</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>champain grey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>harvest gold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chestnut brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>oreg. black*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chocolate brown*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>