MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 16101 Oak Hill Road., Silver Spring
Meeting Date: 11/13/2019

Resource: Master Plan Site 15/52
Edgewood II
Report Date: 11/6/2019

Applicant: Steven Gudelsky
Public Notice: 10/30/2019

Case Number: 15/52-19A
Tax Credit: n/a

Review: HAWP
Staff: Dan Bruechert

Proposal: Door Replacement and other Alterations

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the HPC approve with one (1) conditions the HAWP application:
1. Because the proposed foundation work is to match the historic appearance, Staff should be directed to field-verify that the new foundation match the appearance and materials of the historic.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Individual Master Plan Site (15/52 Edgewood II)
STYLE: Vernacular
DATE: c.1860

Originally built c1858, Edgewood has strong historical associations with the Stablers, a prominent Quaker family associated with the settlement and agricultural development of Eastern Montgomery County in the 1800s. Robert Stabler built Edgewood about 1858 when he married. His father, Caleb of Drayton, gave him the land. Robert was a prosperous farmer active in the Grange and one of the incorporators of the Sandy Spring Bank. The original dwelling was the 2½-story block, two rooms wide with a rear kitchen ell. Later, probably in the late 1800s, a new kitchen wing was added and the old kitchen converted into a dining room. About 1903, another rear wing was built (seen at far left), giving the house a roughly U-shaped plan. The dwelling is set within a grove of hardwood trees from which the property obtained its name.
PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes a variety of small alterations and restorations to the house including:
- Door replacement;
- Storm window installation;
- Installation of new porch railing;
- Foundation repairs;
- Chimney repairs/alterations; and
- Burial of utilities

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

Proposed alterations to individual Master Plan Sites are reviewed under Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A) and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (the Standards). Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code, Chapter 24A Historic Resources Preservation

(a) The commission shall instruct the director to deny a permit if it finds, based on the evidence and information presented to or before the commission that the alteration for which the permit is sought would
be inappropriate, inconsistent with or detrimental to the preservation, enhancement or ultimate protection of the historic site or historic resource within an historic district, and to the purposes of this chapter.

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

1. The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or
2. The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or
3. The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied;

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, space and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportions, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF DISCUSSION

The applicant proposes to convert the vacant historic building into a residence with a separate office. The work involves a variety of minor alterations that Staff finds are consistent with the Standards and Chapter 24A and supports approval the HAWP.

There are areas of proposed work to the whole house that Staff finds will only enhance the historic character of the house. First, the applicant proposes to bury all of the utility lines that service the house. Staff is unsure if this work requires a HAWP, however, this change will only enhance the historic appearance and Staff finds this to be an appropriate modification to the site. Second, the applicant proposes to reinstall and, where necessary, fabricate replacement shutters to match the historic configuration. There are extant examples of the shutters in select locations and historic photographs that show the widespread use of shutters. The new shutters will be traditionally installed wood shutters that will be remain fixed in the open position. As the result of this work will change the existing appearance, it requires a HAWP, however, Staff finds this work is a restoration and should be approved as a matter of course. The last change applied to the whole house is the installation of custom constructed wood storm windows. The wood storm windows will be constructed so that the horizontal divider matches the meeting rail of the historic windows to better blend with the window design. Storm windows are a preservation best practice, both to preserve the historic wood windows and improve the thermal performance of the whole house and Staff recommends approval under 24A-8(b)(1) and (2).

There is other work proposed in repair historic windows, repainting the house, and replacement in-kind of deteriorated features that do not require a HAWP, but Staff would like to remind the HPC and the applicant that this work is eligible for County Historic Preservation Tax Incentives.
For the sake of clarity, Staff has elected to discuss the remaining changes by elevation.

**South Elevation**
The south elevation is the historic front of the house. Most of the work identified in the work notes is restoration, however, there are few details of work that require a HAWP. The applicant proposes removing and replacing the front door. At a site visit Staff determined that the extant door is not historic, due to the fact that there are hinge marks on the inside of the door jamb indicating that the door’s swing has been altered, and the door jamb has been shrunk with one-by lumber pieces installed. In place of the existing door, the applicant proposes to remove the one-bys, change the door swing, and install a a new wood door to fully fill the historic jamb. The new wood door will match the four-panel configuration of the existing door, which Staff finds to be period appropriate and compatible with the house architecture, per 24A-8(b)(1).

The other change visible from the south elevation is the removal and reconstruction of the central chimney. The central chimney is one of five on the historic house and is constructed out of brick. The applicant will remove this chimney to the basement and construct a CMU chimney faced with historic bricks on a new frame in the attic. The chimney will maintain the existing appearance but will not be functional. Staff finds this will not alter the appearance of the house and its approval is supported by 24A-8(b)(1) and Standard 2.

**North Elevation**
From the north elevation both the original massing of the house and the c.1903 addition are visible. The applicant proposes modifying the porch in the northeast corner of the north elevation. Currently, there is a stoop, with an east facing door in the northeast corner. The applicant proposes constructing a new metal shed roof, supported by wood columns, with a new porch and wood stairs. This porch will access the house through a newly created doorway with a half-lite wood door.

Staff finds that these proposed changes are minor alterations to the building and are in keeping with the simple vernacular design of the building (24A-8(b)(1) and (2)). Additionally, Staff finds that the metal shed roof and largely wood construction is consistent with the traditional house construction (24A-8(b)(2)). Finally, Staff finds that the placement of this new porch, at what is effectively the least visible portion of the building, the new construction will have a minimal impact on the historic character of the house and Staff recommends approval under Chapter 24A and Standards 9 and 10.

The other alteration proposed for the north elevation involves the repair of the foundation supporting the original massing of the house. This foundation is constructed on stone piers that have begun to degrade and need to be repaired and/or replaced. The applicant proposes constructing a new foundation faced in stone to match the appearance of the historic continuous foundation found in other areas of the house. Staff finds that this repair is necessary to support the floors and to keep the house from settling further. Because of the rustic, vernacular construction of the house and foundation, a specification sheet for this product cannot be provided by the applicant. While Staff recommends approval for this work under 24A-8(b)(2) and (4), Staff recommends the HPC include a condition for approval of the foundation repairs that the foundation work be field verified by Staff to ensure that the new stone veneer matches the materials, texture, and appearance of the historic stone foundation.

**East Elevation**
No work is proposed for the east elevation that requires a HAWP.

**West Elevation**
The view from the west shows mostly the c.1904 addition that has been heavily modified. Originally, the
addition was only two bays wide, with a porch that wrapped around the north. The second floor was later modified to enclose what was likely a sleeping porch. This change is seen both in changes to the foundation and to the interior framing of the house (observed by Staff on site). For reasons Staff cannot figure out, a second door was installed in the central bay of the house. The applicant proposes removing the central door, which was a later modification, and installing a window and repairing the clapboard siding below in its place and restoring the left door. The applicant also proposes installing a simply detailed wood railing around the left and right ends of the porch.

The historic photos included in the application showing the “View from West, Oak Hill Rd.” and “View from South West” show the west porch enclosed with two different configurations. The earlier photo shows a simple vertical picket design, while the later photo shows a more decorative, Chippendale railing design. As there is a historical precedent for a railing in this porch, Staff finds that either design would be acceptable, but supports approval of the installation of the simple wood railing proposed under 24A-8(b)(1). Additionally, Staff supports removing the central door and converting that opening into a window with siding repairs below. The proposed window will match the materials and appearance of the historic wood windows and Staff finds this work to be largely restorative and recommends approval under 24A-8(b)(1).

Staff recommends approval of this HAWP with the added condition to field verify the foundation work.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the HAWP application with one condition;

1. Because the proposed foundation work is to match the historic appearance, Staff should be directed to field-verify that the new foundation matches the appearance and materials of the historic foundation;

under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), having found that the proposal, as modified by the condition, is consistent with and compatible in character with the Master Plan Site and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2, #9, and #10;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the 3 permit sets of drawings, if applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits; and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make any alterations to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or dan.bruechert@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
301/583-3400
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Person: Steven Gudelsky
Daytime Phone No.: cell 301-980-5960

Tax Account No.: 51-0561930

Property Owner: Edgewood Inn LLC
Daytime Phone No.: office 301-622-6272

Address: 12071, Suite B
Silver Spring
Tech Road
20904

Contractor:

Contractor Registration No.: 

Agent for Owner: Steven Gudelsky
Daytime Phone No.: cell 301-980-5960

LOCATION OF BUILDING/PREMISE

House Number: 16101
Street: OAK HILL ROAD

Town/City: SILVER SPRING / SPENCERVILLE
Nearest Coast Street: DRAYTON FARM

Lot: Block: Subdivision:

Liber: Folio: Parcel: 161

PART ONE: TYPE OF PERMIT ACTION AND USE

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:
- Construct
- Extend
- Alter/Renovate
- Add
- Sub
- Room Addition
- Porch
- Deck
- Shed
- Move
- Install
- Window/Door
- Solar
- Fireplace
- Woodburning Stove
- Single Family
- Revision
- Repair
- Reversible
- Fence/Wall (complete Section 4)
- Other:

1B. Construction cost estimate: $460,000.00

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit #

PART TWO: COMPLETE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION AND EXTEND/ADDITION

2A. Type of sewage disposal:
- 01 WSSC
- 02 Septic
- 03 Other:

2B. Type of water supply:
- 21 WSSC
- 02 Well
- 03 Other:

PART THREE: COMPLETE ONLY FOR FENCE RETAINING WALL

3A. Height: feet inches

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed in one of the following locations:
- On party line/property line
- Entire on land of owner
- On public right of way/ easement

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Signature: 
Date: 8/20/19

Approved:

For Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproved:

Signature:
Date:

Applications/Permit No. 
Date Filed: 
Date Issued:

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
Edgewood Inn, LLC - 16101 Oak Hill Road Silver Spring, MD 20905
Master Plan Site #15/52 Edgewood

The original dwelling was the 2 1/2 story block, two rooms wide with a rear kitchen ell. Later, probably in the late 1800’s, a new kitchen wing was added and the old kitchen converted into a dining room. About 1904, another rear wing was built, giving the house a roughly U-shaped plan. The dwelling is set within a grove of hardwood trees from which the property obtained its name. There was a double barn built c1866, with two haymows, with a driveway in the center, basement in the ground floor with several stalls. Other buildings existing today include an ice house with a root cellar, a blacksmith shop, a two-story tenant house, a corn house and a carriage house with loft. We rebuilt 5 structures in 2007.

Originally built c1858, Edgewood has strong historical associations with the Stablers, a prominent Quaker family associated with the settlement and agricultural development of Eastern Montgomery County in the 1800’s. Robert Stabler built Edgewood about 1858 when he married. His father, Caleb, of Drayton, gave him the land. Robert was a prosperous farmer active in the Grange and one of the incorporators of the Sandy Spring Bank. The buildings were originally built by the Stabler family for use in farming, their orchard, and raising cattle. The property was re-zoned Country Inn C-Inn in 1990 and was recently used by the Swans as a restaurant and for selling antiques.

We are looking to completely restore the existing main house keeping its historic effect on the property, to use as a private residence and property management office.

1. Replace South front door with a slightly larger one and returning it to interior swing
2. Replace 1 West side entry door with a window to match existing 2 over 2
3. Add Full wood storm windows white, removing all existing aluminum channels
4. Replace & enlarge 2nd West side entry door to become main entrance foyer with a similar glass and wood door
5. Put back original railing to sides of West porch and center the walkway with porch
6. Painting roof red, siding white, trim white and shutters black (most shutters will be new wood matching existing)
7. Add stone between piers on North foundation and add ventilation throughout foundation
8. Replace full wood doors on East of house with glass and wood doors
9. Add covered rear entrance to access office and new deck connecting to kitchen and living room
10. Rework stucco at back of SE fireplace to make it useable and up to code
11. Remove central chimney to allow more space in new kitchen area
12. Bury utilities on property
View from South, Spencerville Rd.

View from West, Oak Hill Road
II.G

View from South 2008 (shutters to be replaced)

View from South East corner
II.G

View from East

View from North East corner
View from North West corner

View from West entrance on Oak Hill Road
Front Door on South side of home

to be enlarged 2” & swing to interior
Window Types existing, remove alum. storm, install full wood storm
Custom Wood Storm Window with a sliding storm on interior channel to be installed on hinges and painted white
Existing Door on West side of home to become a window, matching existing

Existing Door on West side of home, replace with full size main entrance door
North side, Infill between existing piers with stone, recess 2"

Rear North East corner, Infill between existing piers with stone, recess 2"
Replace Rear Door with half glass door, maybe a double French door
Remove Chimney in the center of house