MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 4415 Brookeville Rd., Brookeville
Meeting Date: 7/10/2019

Resource: Individually Listed Master Plan Site
Locust Hill (#23/59)
Report Date: 7/3/2019

Applicant: Jef Fuller
Public Notice: 6/26/2019

Review: HAWP
Tax Credit: Partial

Case Number: 23/59-19A
Staff: Dan Bruechert

Proposal: Rear Porch Enclosure, building repairs, and accessory structure reconstruction

STAFF RECOMMENDATION
Staff recommends that the HPC approve the HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION
SIGNIFICANCE: Individually Listed Master Plan Site (Locust Hill #23/59)
STYLE: Greek Revival/eclectic
DATE: 1868

From Places from the Past:
“This substantial stone dwelling is associated with the prominent Riggs family of upper Montgomery County. John Adams Riggs built the house in 1868 upon inheriting 260 acres from his father Remus Riggs. The construction date is carved in the wall of the main façade. The house is built of uncoursed fieldstone with corner quoins. Windows have granite lintels and sills. In style, the residence is transitional, with Greek Revival influence evident in the front doorway with rectilinear transom and sidelights, and shallow hipped roof, and Italianate influence in roofline with deep eaves, simple brackets, and corbeled chimney stacks. The farmstead has a notable collection of farm buildings including a bank barn and stone springhouse.”
PROPOSAL
The applicant is proposing to enclose the rear porch, repair the brick chimneys, and reconstruct the historic milk house.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES
Proposed alterations to individual Master Plan Sites are reviewed under Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A) and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8(b)
A HAWP permit should be issued if the Commission finds that:
1. The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of a historic site or historic resource within a historic district.
2. The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical archaeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which a
I.B

historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto of to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter.

**Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation**

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, space and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportions, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**STAFF DISCUSSION**

the scope of work for the HAWP is broken into two categories: repair/restoration work and the enclosure of the rear porch. Staff finds this work is compatible with the resource and the requisite guidance and recommends approval.

**Repair/Restoration Work**

The applicant proposes to undertake some work that is repair/restorative in nature. This work will be on the historic chimneys and the historic milk house. The milk house is a stone building, approximately, 10’ × 10’ (ten feet square), with a cedar shake roof. The roof has a hole in it and a portion of the wall has significantly degraded.

The applicant will stabilize and repoint the historic chimneys. This work is repair in kind and does not require HPC review and approval but is eligible for the County Historic Preservation Tax Credits.

The applicant also proposes to reconstruct the historic milk house. The roof has failed and one of the walls has partially collapsed. At the recommendation of the applicant’s stone mason, the applicant proposes to remove the exterior walls of the milk house and reconstruct them, backed in concrete blocks for added strength. This will not change the visual appearance of the structure and will add to its long-term stability. The applicant further proposes to replace the roof with one consistent in appearance with Brewster’s rust corrugated metal roofing. The applicant told Staff that this was the roofing material on prior to the installation of the cedar shake.

Staff finds that the milk house needs significant repair and that the work proposed will help to
ensure the stability of the structure for years to come. The masonry work will not result in an exterior visual change. Staff additionally finds that the proposed metal roof is consistent with an accessory building in an agricultural setting and finds it to be appropriate. Staff Recommends approval of the work on the milk house.

Enclosed Rear Porch
The applicant proposes to enclose the rear porch. The current porch is a non-historic addition to the house, with a standing seam metal shed roof. Due to the siting of the house the porch is minimally visible from an oblique angle from the public right-of-way. The left side of the porch was enclosed with wood siding and paired six-over-six windows. The right side of the porch is screened in. The porch is slightly inset from the historic wall planes.

The applicant proposes to remove the existing walls and roof on the existing porch and install a new entrance, windows, siding, and roof. This work will have little impact on the surrounding site, as this work is in the rear of the house and will not be visible from the public right-of-way.

The rear porch will be enclosed in clapboard siding with a central pair of doors. On the rear, there will be two pairs of windows on either side of the centrally located door. On the two sides of the porch, there will also be two pairs of casement windows. The applicant proposes to install Andersen 400 Series casement windows. The windows are proportioned to match the
dimensions of the historic windows, but in a casement configuration instead of the six-over-six sash windows. Instead of replicating the appearance of a screened-in porch, the applicant had additional aims in the enclosure of the porch that required a higher proportion of siding:

“The current rear porch is a non-historic feature of the house, and consists of a weather enclosed eastern porch and a screened western porch under one metal roof. The old porch is in disrepair and needs to be completely rehabilitated. I rarely have used the screen portion of the porch, so I’m electing to make the entire porch weather enclosed.

From a historic perspective, I want the porch to be distinct from the historic house. I had initially considered a very “light” almost all glass porch, but then my environmental side spoke up. My house doesn’t leak energy it is a river of wasted energy flooding out. I have done what I can to come close to carbon neutral, by adding roof insulation, PV Array’s and Geothermal Heat-Pumps, but the bottom line is it wastes energy. My intent is to have the skin of the porch built close to the requirements of the 2018 IeCC\(^1\), to marginally reduce the energy I waste, hence the majority of the skin is being proposed as opaque siding.”

In addition to the siding, the applicant proposes to construct a new concrete block foundation, faced in brick around the porch. This will differentiate the new construction from the historic. Finally, the applicant proposes to install a new standing seam metal roof. The new steps at the rear will be centrally-located, simply detailed wood stairs with a simple wood handrail. Finally, the applicant proposes changing the configuration of the roof from a shed to a hipped roof. Staff finds the proposal appropriate and recommends approval.

While a more open character may be a more desirable appearance to expose more of the historic fabric, Staff nonetheless finds that the proposed changes will not have a significant impact on the historic character of the house or surrounding site, per 24A-8(b)(2). The enclosure is occurring within the dimensions of the existing non-historic rear porch, so the massing at the rear of the house will not change significantly. Staff finds the materials (i.e. wood siding, metal roofing, etc.) are compatible with the historic materials found throughout the house, without replicating the historic materials and forms. Additionally, as this work is proposed for the rear of the house so it will have less impact than a side porch. Staff finds that the applicant’s proposed rehabilitation of the non-historic rear porch is in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for rehabilitation, specifically Standards 9 and 10, and Chapter 24A-8(b)(2) and recommends approval of this HAWP.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends the HPC **approve** the HAWP application; and with the general condition applicable to all Historic Area Work Permits that the applicant will present 3 permit sets of drawings to HPC staff for review and stamping prior to submission for permits (if applicable). After issuance of the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) permit, the applicant will arrange for a field inspection by calling the DPS Field Services Office at 240-777-6370 prior to commencement of work and not more than two weeks following completion of work.

---

\(^1\) International Energy Conservation Code.
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
301/563-3400
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Person: Jef Fuller
Daytime Phone No.: 301-840-1105

Tax Account No.: 02645563

Name of Property Owner: John Fuller
Daytime Phone No.: 301-840-1105

Address: 4415 Brookeville Rd, Brookeville, MD 20833

Contractor: Not Yet Selected

Contractor Registration No.: Same

Agent for Owner: Same

Daytime Phone No.: Same

LOCATION OF BUILDING/PREMISE

House Number: 4415
Street: Brookeville Road
Town/City: Brookeville
Nearest Cross Street: Zion RD
Lot: 2188
Block: 534
Subdivision: BrookeGrove502, Parcel P060

PART ONE: TYPE OF PERMIT ACTION AND USE

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:
☐ Construct ☐ Extend ☑ Alter/Remodel
☐ Move ☐ Install ☑ Wreck/Raze
☐ Revision ☑ Repair ☐ Revocable

1B. Construction cost estimate: $ 80,000

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit #

PART TWO: COMPLETE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION AND EXTEND/ADDITIONS

2A. Type of sewage disposal:
   01 ☐ WSSC 02 ☐ Septic  03 ☐ Other:

2B. Type of water supply:
   01 ☐ WSSC 02 ☐ Well  03 ☐ Other:

PART THREE: COMPLETE ONLY FOR FENCE/RETAINING WALL

3A. Height: feet inches

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
   ☐ On party line/property line ☐ Entirely on land of owner ☐ On public right of way/lease

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

August 20, 2018

Approved: For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproved: Date

Application/Permit No.: 849241 Date Filed: 8/24/18 Date Issued

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:
      Locust Hill is a Historic two story stone farm house that was built in 1868 by the Riggs Family. The house sits prominently on a small hill overlooking Brookeville Road. There is an open lawn between the house & Brookeville Rd, Woods to the west & north, and fields to the east. There is a Spring/Milk house that is a contributing feature to the SW near Brookeville Road.

   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:
      There are two parts to this application. 1) There was a partially enclosed partially screened porch added to the rear of the house in the 1950-1960 time frame. It is in bad condition so I'm looking to repair/replace as necessary to end up with a slightly smaller fully enclosed porch, that will be completely behind and inset from the main house. 2) The spring/milk house is not in good condition, the roof had deteriorated, and the walls are bowing. Two walls and the roof need to be rebuilt.

2. SITE PLAN
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plat. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.
   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resource(s) and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (facades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context. All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS
   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the dripline of any tree 8" or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS
   For all projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. The list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lots or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT (IN BLUE OR BLACK INK) OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDELINES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.
# HAWP APPLICATION: Mailing Addresses for Notifying

[Owner, Owner’s Agent, Adjacent and Confronting Property Owners]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner’s mailing address</th>
<th>Owner’s Agent’s mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jef Fuller</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locust Hill</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4415 Brookeville Rd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brookeville, MD 20833</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jane C Maller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PO Box 709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olney MD, 20830-0709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bob Stabler</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4401 Brookeville Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brookeville, MD 20833</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve White &amp; Lynn Fields</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4410 Brookeville Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brookeville, MD 20833</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our House</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19715 Zion Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brookeville MD 20833</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Martin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4615 Brookeville Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brookeville, MD 20833</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

See the photos in the attached drawing package

Detail:__________________________________________________________

See the photos in the attached drawing package

Detail:__________________________________________________________

Applicant:______________________________

Page:__
LOCUST HILL
RENOVATION PROJECTS
4415 Brookville Road
Brookeville, MD 20833
5-20-19

PHASE A - CHIMNEYS
1. SW CHIMNEY: REMOVE AND REBUILD VENEER BRICK (SECTION ABOVE ROOFLINE WRAPPING CHIMNEY CORE, 7 COURSES 80 BRICK).
2. SE CHIMNEY: REPOINT ALL MORTAR JOINTS ALONG VENEER BRICK SECTION OF CHIMNEY.
3. NW CHIMNEY: REPOINT FRACATURE MORTAR THROUGHOUT CHIMNEY ABOVE ROOFLINE (VERY MINOR ONLY WHERE NECESSARY.)
4. NE CHIMNEY: REBUILD VENEER SECTION OF CHIMNEY AS NEEDED, REPOINT ENTIRE CHIMNEY ABOVE ROOFLINE.

PHASE B - REAR PORCH
1. REPLACE WALLS AND ROOF.
2. REMOVE EXTERIOR STAIRS AND REPLACE WITH NEW EXTERIOR STAIR.
3. NEW DOOR FOR ENTRANCE.
4. NEW WINDOWS.

PHASE C - SPRING HOUSE
1. REMOVE DALIATED ROOF ON SPRING HOUSE.
2. TAKE DOWN ALL FOUR WALLS OF SPRING HOUSE TO APPROXIMATELY ONE FOOT BELOW GRADE.
3. BUILD INTERIOR SHELF OUT OF 8" CINDER BLOCK TIED TOGETHER WITH CONCRETE Poured CORNERS WITH REBAR.
4. BUILD TO EXISTING DIMENSIONS.

SCOPE OF WORK
WILL REINFORCE FOOTER AS NEEDED WITH STEEL TO MINIMIZE POTENTIAL FOR CRACKING DUE TO SETTLING. REPAIR OUTER VENEER ON ALL FOUR SIDES WITH EXISTING STONE AND MORTAR ALL JOINTS. APPROXIMATELY 12 DAYS TO COMPLETION. WILL REQUIRE ACCESS TO POWER.

**EXISTING STRUCTURE IS COMPRISED OF TWO LAYERS STACKED STONE, AS OPPOSED TO REBUILDING TO EXISTING SPECIFICATIONS, FOR OPTIMAL STRENGTHS AND INSURED DURABILITY IT IS STRONGLY RECOMMENDED TO HAVE THE SUPPORTING INNER STRUCTURE COMPRISED OF CINDER BLOCK REINFORCED WITH REBAR. THIS WILL CARRY THE LOAD OF THE STRUCTURE AND ALLOW THE OUTER STONE TO ACT MORE AS A VENEER. THE EXISTING AESTHETIC WILL REMAIN AS IT IS WHILE SIMULTANEOUSLY PROVIDING MUCH NEEDED SUPPORT TO MITIGATE POTENTIAL ISSUES IN THE FUTURE.**

PROJECT PHASES
A. CHIMNEY REPAIR
B. PORCH REPAIR/REPLACEMENT
C. SPRING HOUSE REPAIR/REBUILD

CONSULTANT
LOCUST HILL BACKPORCH
DNC PROJECT NUMBER
17003-000

SCOPE OF WORK
- REPLACE WALLS AND ROOF
- REMOVE EXTERIOR STAIRS AND REPLACE WITH NEW EXTERIOR STAIR
- NEW DOOR FOR ENTRANCE
- NEW WINDOWS

SEE DRAWINGS IN THIS PACKAGE FOR DETAILS.
BUILDING PERMIT #: 84929

CS1
PHASE B: 1ST FLOOR PLAN - EXISTING

SCALE: 1/8" = 1'-0"

NOT IN SCOPE

SCREENED PORCH
STAIR TO CELLAR
ENCLOSED PORCH

LOCUST HILL BACK PORCH
FIRST FLOOR PLAN - EXISTING
PHASE B: 1ST FLOOR PLAN - PROPOSED

SCALE: 1/8"=1'-0"
PHASE B: PERSPECTIVE
PHASE B: NORTH ELEVATION

A501
SCALE: 3/16"=1'-0"

15" ON CENTER, TYP.
STANDING SEAM METAL ROOF
ALL WINDOWS TO BE PLACED ON CENTER OF WINDOW (DIRECTLY ABOVE)
4"X6" WOOD SIDING
6" BRICK MASONRY
STAIRS TO BE CONSTRUCTED ON CENTER OF DOOR

REPAIRS REQUIRED PART A

2.5 3.5 3.5 4.0 5.5 4.0 5.5 6.0 5.5 4.0 5.5 6.0 5.5 4.0 5.5 6.0
6.0 4.0 5.5 4.0 5.5 6.0 5.5 4.0 5.5 6.0 5.5 4.0 5.5 6.0

6.0" 6.0"
EXISTING STAIR WINDOW SILL

EXISTING CONCRETE STAIR TO REMAIN

4x4" POST W/3" HANDRAIL

CONCRETE STEPS TO BE REMOVED

PHASE B: SECTION THROUGH DOOR

SCALE: 3/8"=1'-0"