I.C

MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Address:</strong></th>
<th>10 Hickory Ave., Takoma Park</th>
<th><strong>Meeting Date:</strong></th>
<th>4/10/2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resource:</strong></td>
<td>Contributing Resource</td>
<td><strong>Report Date:</strong></td>
<td>4/3/2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Takoma Park Historic District</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Applicant:</strong></td>
<td>C.J. Rydberg and Katelin Chow</td>
<td><strong>Public Notice:</strong></td>
<td>3/27/2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Rick Vitullo, Architect)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Review:</strong></td>
<td>HAWP</td>
<td><strong>Tax Credit:</strong></td>
<td>Partial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Case Number:</strong></td>
<td>37/03-19Q</td>
<td><strong>Staff:</strong></td>
<td>Michael Kyne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROPOSAL:</strong></td>
<td>Building addition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the HPC **approve** the HAWP application.

**ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION**

**SIGNIFICANCE:** Contributing Resource within the Takoma Park Historic District

**STYLE:** Colonial Revival

**DATE:** c. 1900-1910

![Fig. 1: Subject property.](image)

**PROPOSAL**
The applicants propose the following work items:

- In-kind carpentry repairs to the front porch.
- Removal of the existing rear porch.
- Construction of a two-level rear addition (second-floor bedroom over a screened porch).
- Construction of a rear shed dormer.

**APPLICABLE GUIDELINES**

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Takoma Park Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the historic preservation review guidelines in the approved and adopted amendment for the *Takoma Park Historic District (Guidelines)*, *Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A)*, and *the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

**Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines**

There are two very general, broad planning and design concepts which apply to all categories. These are:

- The design review emphasis will be restricted to changes that are all visible from the public right-of-way, irrespective of landscaping or vegetation (it is expected that the majority of new additions will be reviewed for their impact on the overall district), and

- The importance of assuring that additions and other changes to existing structures act to reinforce and continue existing streetscape, landscape, and building patterns rather than to impair the character of the historic district.

A majority of structures in the Takoma Park Historic District have been assessed as being “Contributing Resources.” While these structures may not have the same level of architectural or historical significance as Outstanding Resources or may have lost some degree of integrity, collectively, they are the basic building blocks of the Takoma Park district. However, they are more important to the overall character of the district and the streetscape due to their size, scale, and architectural character, rather than for their particular architectural features.

Contributing Resources should receive a more lenient level of design review than those structures that have been classified as Outstanding. This design review should emphasize the importance of the resource to the overall streetscape and its compatibility with existing patterns rather than focusing on a close scrutiny of architectural detailing. In general, however, changes to Contributing Resources should respect the predominant architectural style of the resource.

The *Guidelines* that pertain to this project are as follows:

- All exterior alterations, including those to architectural features and details, should be generally consistent with the predominant architectural style and period of the resource and should preserve the predominant architectural features of the resource; exact replication of existing details and features is, however, not required.
- Major additions should, where feasible, be placed to the rear of existing structures so that they are less visible from the public right-of-way; additions and alterations to the first floor at the front of
a structure are discouraged but not automatically prohibited.

- While additions should be compatible, they are not required to be replicative of earlier architectural styles.
- Some non-original building materials may be acceptable on a case-by-case basis; artificial siding on areas visible from the public right of way is discouraged where such materials would replace or damage original building materials that are in good condition.
- Alterations to features that are not visible from the public right-of-way should be allowed as a matter of course.
- All changes and additions should respect existing environmental settings, landscaping, and patterns of open space.

Sec. 24A-8. Same-Criteria for issuance.

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or
(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or
(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or
(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or
(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; [emphasis added] or
(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.

(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59)

Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” Standards 2, 9, and 10 most directly apply to the application before the Commission:

#2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
#9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

#10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**STAFF DISCUSSION:**

Staff is fully supportive of the applicants’ proposal. The proposed two-level rear addition is modest in scale and massing, with a 4’-8” inset from the south (right, as viewed from the front) side elevation of the historic house and an 11’ inset from the north (left) side. The proposed shed dormer will be inset 6” from each side of the historic house, with further differentiation provided by the existing 1’ deep rake boards of the historic house. The proposed front porch carpentry work will consist of repairs and/or in-kind replacement of wood tongue and groove flooring, wood railings, wood framing, and PVC screening.

The proposed materials for the additions include fiber cement panels with rough stucco, fiber cement 1 x 4 corner boards, field-turned standing seam metal roofing (as necessitated by the 2:12 roof slopes), single-lite wood casement and awning windows in the second-floor of the two-level rear addition, and wood one-over-one double hung windows and wood awning windows in the shed dormer. The proposed materials for the first-floor screened porch will be wood framing and PVC screening, with wood railings and inset wood balusters.

Other work items include repair/restoration of the existing double-hung wood windows in the historic house and replacement of the two-over-two basement-level wood double-hung window at the rear with a new wood one-over-one double-hung window. The Commission typically exercises greater leniency when reviewing proposed alterations to basement-level fenestration on secondary elevations, and staff finds that the proposed window replacement will not detract from character-defining features of the historic house or the surrounding streetscape.
Fig. 2: Rear basement-level window to be replaced.

The proposed carpentry repairs to the front porch and repairs of the existing windows in the historic house are eligible for the County’s 25% Historic Preservation Tax Credit, and staff recommends that the applicants submit a tax credit application by April 1, 2020.

After full and fair consideration of the applicant’s submission staff finds the proposal as being consistent with the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-(b) 1 and 2, having found the proposal is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines outlined above.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), having found that the proposal is consistent with the Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines identified above, and therefore will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2, 9, and 10;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the 3 permit sets of drawings, if applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;
and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make **any alterations** to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
301/563-3400

APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Person: RICK VITULLO MIA
Address: 10 HICKORY AVE, TAKOMA PARK MD 20912

Tax Account No. 

Name of Property Owner: C.R. PAIBERS/KEATING CHOW
Address: 10 HICKORY AVE, TAKOMA PARK MD 20912
Daytime Phone No. 

Contractor: T.B.D.

Construction Registration No. 

Agent for Owner: RICK VITULLO MIA
Daytime Phone No. 301-806-6477

LOCATION OF PROPOSED WORK

House Number: 10
Lot: 8

Street: HICKORY AVE.

City: TAKOMA PARK

Near Cross Street: COLUMBIA AVE.

Block: 20

Subdivision: B.E. GILBERT'S ADD'N TO T.P.

PART ONE: TYPE OF IMPROVEMENT

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:

☐ Ext. ☑ Add/Remodel ☑ A/C ☑ Sbl ☑ Room Addition
☐ More ☑ Install ☑ W/O Doors ☑ Deck ☑ Shed
☐ Revision ☑ Repair ☑ W/Smoke ☑ Single Family

1B. Construction cost estimate: $300,000.00

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved permit, see Permit # 

PART TWO: COMPLETE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION OR EXTENSION/ADDITIONS

2A. Type of sewage disposal: 

☐ On Site, WSSC 01 ☑ Septic 02 ☑ W/Toilet ☑ Other 03 ☑ Other

2B. Type of water supply: 

☐ On Site, WSSC 01 ☑ W/Toilet 02 ☑ Wall 03 ☑ Other

PART THREE: COMMENT ON VARIOUS DEVICES OR WALLS

3A. Height: 

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:

☐ On party line/property line ☑ Entirely on land of owner ☑ On public right of way/assessment

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by the agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Signature of owner or authorized agent: RICK VITULLO MIA

Date: 3-15-19

Approved: 

Disapproved: 

Signature: 

Date: 

APPLICATION/PERMIT NO.: 301-806-6477

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS

Eden 5/21/98
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE
REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:
      
      
      
   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:
      
      
      
2. SITE PLAN
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plot. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11” x 17”. Plans on 1/2” x 11” paper are preferred.
   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resource(s) and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (facade), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, contact. All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS
   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the dripline of any tree 6” or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS
   For all projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lots or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT IN BLUE OR BLACK INK OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY INTO MAILING LABELS.
OWNERS:
10 Hickory Avenue, LLC
(Katelin Chow & C.J. Rydberg)
10 Hickory Ave.
Takoma Park, MD 20912

AGENT FOR OWNER:
Richard J. Vitullo AIA
Vitullo Architecture Studio, PC
7016 Woodland Ave.
Takoma Park, MD 20912

Adjoining Property Owners

Kenneth Norkin
14 Hickory Ave.
Takoma Park, MD 20912

Lorraine Gilbert
Laurence Fischel
6 Hickory Ave.
Takoma Park, MD 20912

Teresa Smith
7 Hickory Ave.
Takoma Park, MD 20912

Karl & Ruth Pitt
23 Columbia Ave.
Takoma Park, MD 20912
DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPOSED PROJECT AND ITS EFFECT ON THE HISTORIC RESOURCE:
10 Hickory Ave., Takoma Park, MD 20912

Front Porch: The front porch shall have new T & G wood flooring to replace the dilapidated wood flooring. The existing dilapidated wood posts and railings will be restored, as possible, or replaced in kind. The existing screen porch at front will be restored, using new wood framing and new PVC screening.

Rear Additions:
  a. A new 14'-0" x 20'-0" (280 sf) 2-level addition (Master Bedroom over Screen Porch) will be constructed at the rear of the house and inset from the house 4'-8" away from the south side and 11'-0" away from the north side. This addition will have a shallow gable roof (2:5:12 slope).
  b. There will also be a gabled shed dormer addition (2:12 slope) added to the existing house at the rear which will be set back from the plane of the house below by 6" on each side and also separated from the original roof and house below by an existing 1'-0" deep rake, which shall remain.

This will be built using the following materials/details:

1) Siding: painted fiber cement panels, with a rough stucco, on all façades, with a 1 x 4 fiber cement trim at the corners.

2) Roofing: Membrane or standing seam metal roofing (TBD).

3) Windows and Doors: The existing wood double hung windows on the house shall be restored, as possible; a deteriorated wood double hung window in the rear wall of the basement (2'-8" x 5'-5") will be replaced with a painted wood and laminated-glass double hung window (for security). The new rear addition windows will be painted wood casement and awning windows, with no muntins; the new windows in the shed dormer addition will be painted wood double hung at the rear and awning at the two sides. There will be painted 1 x 4 fiber cement trim at all windows.

4) Screen Porch and Wood Stoop/Stairs: This will be constructed of wood frame with PVC screening in between; the stoop will be wood frame, with wood railings and balusters. There will be a stair to grade.
DESCRIPTION OF EXISTING STRUCTURE,
ENVIRONMENTAL SETTING AND HISTORICAL FEATURES
AT:
10 Hickory Ave., Takoma Park, MD 20912

This is an "Contributing Resource" Colonial Revival-style house, built in 1903,
and it is located in the Takoma Park Historic District. It is a 1 1/2-story house,
rectangular in shape, approx. 24' x 36', with a large front porch and a left-side
screen porch. It has a 1450 S.F. footprint, with a full walk-out basement at the
rear of the sloping site.

a. **Original House Structure:** The main house structure is wood framed
and is gabled (10:12 slope), with the ridge parallel to Hickory Ave..

b. **Exterior Finish:** The exterior finish is rough stucco.

c. **Windows/Doors:** The windows of the house are typically painted
wood double hung: 1-over-1. There are original fully operable wood
shutters.

d. **Roof:** The roofing is asphalt shingles.
WOOD ULTIMATE DOUBLE HUNG

CONSTRUCTION DETAILS

HEAD JAMB AND SILL

ROUGH OPENING

FRAME SIZE

MASONRY OPENING

1/2" (13)

1/4" (6)

1/2" (13)

1/4" (6)

ROUGH OPENING

FRAME SIZE

MASONRY OPENING

VERTICAL MULLION

JAMB
4x4 wood post
cap
2x4 wood top
cap
rail (P.T.)
L.H.M. 237 @ 5' 6",
(rail or P.T.)

Wood decking
2x4 wood bot
rail, P.T.

4x4 P.T. post
on abu-44 base

Railing detail
1" = 1' 0"