MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 42 Columbia Ave., Takoma Park
Meeting Date: 3/13/2019

Resource: Outstanding Resource
Takoma Park Historic District
Report Date: 3/6/2019

Applicant: Joan Meier
(Rick Vitullo, Architect)
Public Notice: 2/27/2019

Review: HAWP
Tax Credit: Partial

Case Number: 37/03-19M
Staff: Michael Kyne

PROPOSAL: Window replacement

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the HPC approve the HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Outstanding Resource within the Takoma Park Historic District
STYLE: Craftsman
DATE: 1926

Fig. 1: Subject property.
PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to replace three (3) non-historic windows and repair one (1) historic window at the subject property.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Takoma Park Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the historic preservation review guidelines in the approved and adopted amendment for the Takoma Park Historic District (Guidelines), Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines

There are two very general, broad planning and design concepts which apply to all categories. These are:

- The design review emphasis will be restricted to changes that are all visible from the public right-of-way, irrespective of landscaping or vegetation (it is expected that the majority of new additions will be reviewed for their impact on the overall district), and

- The importance of assuring that additions and other changes to existing structures act to reinforce and continue existing streetscape, landscape, and building patterns rather than to impair the character of the historic district.

Outstanding Resources – Residential

The Guidelines characterize Outstanding Resources as those

… which [are] of outstanding significance due to [their] architectural and/or historical features. An Outstanding Resource may date from any historical period and may be representative of any architectural style. However, it must have special features, architectural details and/or historical associations that make the resource especially representative of an architectural style, it must be especially important to the history of the district, and/or it must be especially unique within the context of the district.

These resources have the highest level of architectural and/or historical significance. While they will receive the most detailed level of design review, it is permissible to make sympathetic alterations, changes and additions to Outstanding Resources.

As a set of guiding principles for design review of Outstanding Resources, the Historic Preservation Commission will utilize the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.

The Guidelines that pertain to this project are as follows:

- Plans for all alterations should be compatible with the resource’s original design; additions, specifically, should be sympathetic to existing architectural character, including massing, height, setbacks, and materials.
- Preservation of original windows and doors, particularly those with specific architectural importance, and of original size and shape of openings is encouraged.
- Preservation of original building materials and use of appropriate, compatible new materials is
The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

1. The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or
2. The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or
3. The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or
4. The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or
5. The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or
6. In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.

In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The Standards are as follows:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

STAFF DISCUSSION

The subject property is a c. 1926 Craftsman-style Outstanding Resource within the Takoma Park Historic District. There is an existing kitchen addition at the north side (right) of the historic house. There are currently 1-over-1 vinyl double-hung windows in the kitchen addition. The historic house retains its original 6-over-1 wood double-hung windows.
The applicant proposes the following:

- Replace two 1-over-1 vinyl double-hung windows on the east elevation (front) of the kitchen addition with wood awning windows.
- Replace one 1-over-1 vinyl double-hung window on the north elevation (right side) of the kitchen addition with a wood awning window.
- Repair an original 6-over-1 wood double-hung window on the north elevation (front/right in front of the kitchen addition) of the historic house.

Staff fully supports the applicant proposal. The existing windows in the kitchen are vinyl, which is incompatible with the historic house, while the proposed replacement windows are wood, which is compatible. Staff finds that the proposed wood awning windows are appropriate for a kitchen addition, and they are generally comparable with, yet clearly differentiated from, the original windows in the historic house. Staff supports the repair of the original 6-over-1 wood double-hung window in the historic house, as this is consistent with the Guidelines for Outstanding Resources, which state that original windows and original building materials should be preserved. Staff notes that this repair work is eligible for the County’s Historic Preservation Tax Credit.

After full and fair consideration of the applicant’s submission staff finds the proposal as being consistent with the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-(b) 1 and 2, having found the proposal is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and Takoma Park Guidelines outlined above.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), having found that the proposal is consistent with the Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines identified above, and therefore will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2 and #9;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the 3 permit sets of drawings, if applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make any alterations to the approved plans.

Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
301/563-3400
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Person: RICK VITULLO
Contact Email: RV@VITULLOSTUDIO.COM
Daytime Phone No: 301-806-6447

Tax Account No: 010674-54

Name of Property Owner: JOAN MEIER
Daytime Phone No: 301-502-8921

Address: 42 COLUMBIA AVE. TAKOMA PARK MD 20912

Street Number: 42 City: 

Contractor: (TBD)

Contractor Registering No: 

Agent for Owner: RICK VITULLO AIA
Daytime Phone No: 301-806-6447

LOCATION OF BUILDING PACKET

House Number: 42 Street: COLUMBIA AVE.

Town/City: TAKOMA PARK Nearest Cross Street: POPLAR AVE.
Loc: 13 Block: 19 Subdivision: B.F. GILBERT'S ADDN TO TAKOMA PARK

FACING THE SOUTH, FACE FRONT AND BACK

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:
☐ Construct ☐ Extend ☐ Alter/Renovate
☐ Move ☐ Install ☐ Wind/Blaze
☐ Repair ☐ Remove

1B. Construction cost estimate: $40,070.00

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved work permit, see Permit #

PART TYPE: COMPLETE RECONSTRUCTION AND EXTENSIONS/ADDITIONS

2A. Type of material proposed: ☑ ☐ 1X6 5/8GC 01 ☐ Repairs 03 ☐ Other:

2B. Type of water supply: ☑ ☐ 2X4 5/8GC 02 ☐ Well 03 ☐ Other:

PART THREE: COMPLETE AN WALL, FENCE OR RETAINING WALL

3A. Height: feet inches

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
☐ On party line/property line ☐ Entirely on land of owner ☐ On public right of way/assessment

I hereby certify that I have met the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed in the certificate of names and hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

RICK VITULLO
Signature of owner or authorized agent

2/4/19 Date

Approved:

For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproved:

Signature:

Date:

Application/Permit No:

Data Filed:

Date Issued:

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:
      CATEGORY: 1 HOUSE, WITH 3 VINYL REPLACEMENT WINDOWS IN KITCHEN AND 1 WOOD WINDOW IN DINING ROOM THAT IS DILAPIDATED. (SEE PHOTOS)

   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:
      AS PART OF A SEPARATE KITCHEN RENOVATION PROJECT, THE 3 VINYL REPLACEMENT WINDOWS IN THE KITCHEN AND 1 WOOD WINDOW IN THE DINING ROOM ARE TO BE REPLACED WITH PAINTED WOOD WINDOWS. AWNING WINDOWS IN KITCHEN AND DINING ROOM TO BE REPAIRED/RESTORED. (SEE ACCOMPANYING DRAWINGS)

2. SITE PLAN
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plot. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.
   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resource(s) and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (facades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context.
      All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS
   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHY
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the drip line of any tree 6" or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS
   For ALL projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lot(s) of parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT IN BLUE OR BLACK INK OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjoining Property Owners</th>
<th>HAWP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Roland Weiss & Helen Alexander**  
44 Columbia Ave.  
Takoma Park, MD 20912 | |
| **Diana Bradley**  
40 Columbia Ave.  
Takoma Park, MD 20912 | |
| **James Suntum**  
7125 Poplar Ave.  
Takoma Park, MD 20912 | |
| **Anne Olesen**  
7116 Poplar Ave.  
Takoma Park, MD 20912 | |
PROPOSED FRONT ELEVATION
FRONT-FACING VINYL WINDOWS
IN KITCHEN
DETERIORATED WOOD WINDOW IN DINING RM.