II.E

Preliminary Consultation

MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

Address: 213 Ethan Allen Ave., Takoma Park

Meeting Date: 10/10/2018

Resource: Contributing Resource

Report Date: 10/3/2018

Takoma Park Historic District

Public Notice: 9/26/2018

Applicant: Chris and Seema Meighan

Tax Credit: No

(Eric Saul, Architect)

Review: Preliminary Consultation

Case Number: N/A

Staff: Michael Kyne

PROPOSAL: Rear addition

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the applicants make any revisions based on the HPC’s recommendations and return for a HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Contributing Resource within the Takoma Park Historic District

STYLE: Bungalow

DATE: c. 1910-20s

The subject property is a c. 1910-20s 1 ½-story bungalow-style Contributing Resource within the Takoma Park Historic District. The house has a central front porch with front-facing gable roof and decorative brackets. There is a centered shed dormer at the rear. The front (north) of the house faces Ethan Allen Avenue, and its east side (left, as viewed from the front) coincides with the boundary of the historic district.
PROPOSAL

The applicants propose to construct a one-story modern style rear addition.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Takoma Park Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the historic preservation review guidelines in the approved and adopted amendment for the Takoma Park Historic District (Guidelines), Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or
(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.

Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines

There are two very general, broad planning and design concepts which apply to all categories. These are:

- The design review emphasis will be restricted to changes that are all visible from the public right-of-way, irrespective of landscaping or vegetation (it is expected that the majority of new additions will be reviewed for their impact on the overall district), and

- The importance of assuring that additions and other changes to existing structures act to reinforce and continue existing streetscape, landscape, and building patterns rather than to impair the character of the historic district.

A majority of structures in the Takoma Park Historic District have been assessed as being “Contributing Resources.” While these structures may not have the same level of architectural or historical significance as Outstanding Resources or may have lost some degree of integrity, collectively, they are the basic building blocks of the Takoma Park district. However, they are more important to the overall character of the district and the streetscape due to their size, scale, and architectural character, rather than for their particular architectural features.

Contributing Resources should receive a more lenient level of design review than those structures that have been classified as Outstanding. This design review should emphasize the importance of the resource to the overall streetscape and its compatibility with existing patterns rather than focusing on a close scrutiny of architectural detailing. In general, however, changes to Contributing Resources should respect the predominant architectural style of the resource.

The Guidelines that pertain to this project are as follows:

- All exterior alterations, including those to architectural features and details, should be generally consistent with the predominant architectural style and period of the resource and should preserve the predominant architectural features of the resource; exact replication of existing details and features is, however, not required.
- Major additions should, where feasible, be placed to the rear of existing structures so that they are less visible from the public right-of-way; additions and alterations to the first floor at the front of the structure are discourage but not automatically prohibited.
- While additions should be compatible, they are not required to be replicative of earlier architectural styles.
- Some non-original building materials may be acceptable on a case-by-case basis; artificial siding on areas visible from the public right-of-way is discouraged where such materials would replace
or damage original building materials that are in good condition.
• Alterations to features that are not visible at all from the public right-of-way should be allowed as a matter of course.
• All changes and additions should respect existing environmental settings, landscaping, and patterns of open space.

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation:

#2: The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alterations of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

#9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

#10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF DISCUSSION

The applicants propose a one-story rear addition at the subject property, with the following specifications:

• Replaces an existing non-historic deck in the same approximate location.
• Moderately-scaled modern-style rear addition.
• Inset 1’ from the east (left) side of the historic house.
• Projects beyond the west (right) side of the historic house.
• Has a shed roof, which slopes back toward the historic house.
• Built above grade on 6 x 6 posts, with a 7’-8” high steel post in the southeast (rear/left) corner to accommodate a steep drop off and existing basement walkout.
• Materials include large aluminum-clad windows, Hardie Plank and Hardie Panel Siding, cable railings, and modified bitumen or EPDM roofing.

Staff finds that the location of the proposed addition is appropriate, as, according to the Guidelines, all major additions should be located at the rear. Staff is concerned about the proposed projection of the addition on the west (right) side, and the Commission typically strives to minimize the visibility of new additions by requiring them to be entirely inset from each side of the historic house. Overall, the addition will project 4.9’ on the west (right) side; however, due to an existing inset at the rear, it will only project 2’ beyond the west (right) side of the historic house, as viewed straight on. Staff notes that, due to the house’s shallow rear setback and the presence of a mature 36” dbh tree, there may be some site restrictions.

While the Guidelines stress that new additions are not required to be replicative of earlier architectural styles and the Standards state that new work shall be differentiated from the old, staff finds that the design of the proposed rear addition is incompatible. Primarily, staff is concerned about the fenestration pattern and roof form of the proposed addition.

On the west (right) elevation, the wall of the addition is void of fenestration, which is incompatible with the historic house. Because this side of the addition projects beyond the west (right) side of the historic
house and will be clearly visible from the public right-of-way, the lack of fenestration has the potential to detract from the surrounding streetscape.

The east (left) elevation has two large modern-style windows offset to the outer edges of the wall plane. This is an irregular fenestration pattern, which is incompatible with the historic house. Due to a larger side setback on the east (left) side, this elevation will be visible from Ethan Allen Avenue, despite the 1’ inset; however, staff does note that any view of the east (left) elevation from the public right-of-way will likely be from outside the historic district.

The historic house has side gables with a long sloping roof, and the proposed front-sloping shed roof of the addition may be disruptive to the directionality and overall form of the house. Because the form and massing are clear distinguishable features of the bungalow style, the front-sloping roof of the addition has the potential to detract from character-defining features, which is inconsistent with the Standards. Staff is also concerned about that the front-sloping roof will direct water back toward the historic house, which could ultimately result in the deterioration of original building materials. This feature should be eliminated.

Staff finds that the proposal is ultimately incompatible with the architectural character of the historic house, and, more broadly, it is incompatible with the character of the historic district. Both the roof form and fenestration pattern of the proposed addition are incompatible with the character-defining features of the historic house and have the potential to detract from the surrounding streetscape. In summary, staff asks the Commission to provide guidance regarding the following:

- The appropriateness of the proposed west (right) side projection; and
- The appropriateness of the proposed architectural style and detailing, specifically the fenestration pattern and roof form.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends the following:

- Staff recommends that the applicants make any revisions based on the HPC’s and staff’s recommendations and return for a HAWP application.
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: INFO@SAULARCHITECTS.COM  Contact Person: ERIC SAUL  Daytime Phone No.: 301-270-0395
Tax Account No.: ________________________________  Daytime Phone No.: 617-775-5978
Name of Property Owner: CHRIS & SEEMA MEHAN
Address: 213 ETHAN ALLEN AVE, TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912
Contractor: N/A  Phone No.: ________________________________
Contractor Registration No.: ________________________________
Agent for Owner: ERIC SAUL  Daytime Phone No.: 301-270-0395

LOCATION OF BUILDING/PREmise
House Number: 213  Street: ETHAN ALLEN
Town/City: TAKOMA PARK  Nearest Cross Street: SYCAMORE AVE
Lot: 3  Block: 22  Subdivision: B.F. GIBBST'S ADDITION TO TKPR
Liber: 3032  Folio: 613  Parcel:

PART ONE: TYPE OF PERMIT ACTION AND USE

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:
☐ Construct  ☐ Extend  ☐ Alter/Renovate  ☐ A/C  ☐ Stab  ☐ Boom Addition  ☐ Porch  ☐ Deck  ☐ Shed
☐ Move  ☐ Install  ☐ Wreck/Rez  ☐ Solar  ☐ Fireplace  ☐ Woodburning Stove  ☐ Single Family
☐ Revision  ☐ Repair  ☐ Revocable  ☐ Fence/Wall (complete Section 4)  ☐ Other: ________________________________

1B. Construction cost estimate: $ ________________________________

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved site permit, see Permit # ________________________________

PART TWO: COMPLETE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION AND ADDITIONS/ADDITIONS

2A. Type of sewage disposal:  01 ☐ WSSC  02 ☐ Septic  03 ☐ Other: ________________________________

2B. Type of water supply:  01 ☐ WSSC  02 ☐ Well  03 ☐ Other: ________________________________

PART THREE: COMPLETE ONLY FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION, RETAINING WALL

3A. Height _______ feet _______ inches

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
☐ On property line/property line  ☐ Entirely on land of owner  ☐ On public right of way/assessment

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby accept and agree to be a condition of the issuance of this permit.

Signature of owner or authorized agent ________________________________
Date: 9/4/18

Approved: ________________________________  For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission
Disapproved: ________________________________

Application/Permit No.: ________________________________  Date Filed: ________________________________  Date Issued: ________________________________

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:

      EXISTING HOUSE IS LOCATED ON THE BORDER
      OF THE TAKOMA PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT. THE
      HOUSE IS A STANDARD BUNGALOW SET BACK 30'
      FROM THE FRONT PROPERTY LINE.

   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:

      OWNER PROPOSES A MODERN/CONTEMPORARY
      SINGLE STORY REAR ADDITION CONTAINING A
      FAMILY ROOM AND BEDROOM. ADDITION WILL BE
      VASTLY CONTRASTED WITH EXISTING HOUSE TO DEFINE
      THE ORIGINAL HISTORIC PORION.

2. SITE PLAN
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plat. Your site plan must include:

   a. the scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.

   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resource(s) and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (facades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context. All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS
   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the dripline of any tree 6" or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS
   For all projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lots(s) or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT (IN BLUE OR BLACK INK) OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner's mailing address</th>
<th>Owner's Agent's mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>213 ETHAN ALLEN AVE</td>
<td>ERIC SAUL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8114 CARROLL AVE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CHARLES &amp; GRACIELA HAYES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>215 ETHAN ALLEN AVE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| BADIA ALEXANDRA                                             |
| 211 ETHAN ALLEN                                             |
| TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912                                       |

| DARIUS D. SININ & HEATHER F. HURLBART                      |
| 211 MANOR CIRCLE                                            |
| TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912                                       |
CONSUMER INFORMATION NOTES:
1. This plan is a benefit to a consumer insofar as it is required by a lender or a title insurance company or its agent in connection with contemplated transfer, financing or re-financing.
2. This plan is not to be relied upon for the establishment or location of fences, garages, buildings, or other existing or future improvements.
3. This plan does not provide for the accurate identification of property boundary lines, but such identification may not be required for the transfer of title or securing financing or re-financing.
4. Building line and/or Flood Zone information is taken from available sources and is subject to interpretation of originator.
5. No Title Report furnished.

Notes:
1. Setback distances as shown to the principal structure from property lines are approximate. The level of accuracy for this drawing should be taken to be no greater than plus or minus 3 feet. No property corners confirmed.
2. Fences, if shown, have been located by approximate methods.

LOCATION DRAWING
PART OF LOT 3, BLOCK 22
B.F. GILBERT'S ADDITION TO
TAKOMA PARK
MONTGOMERY COUNTY, MARYLAND

SURVEYOR'S CERTIFICATE
"THE INFORMATION SHOWN HEREON HAS BEEN BASED UPON THE RESULTS OF A FIELD INSPECTION PURSUANT TO THE DEED OR PLAT OF RECORD. EXISTING STRUCTURES SHOWN HAVE BEEN FIELD LOCATED BASED UPON MEASUREMENTS FROM PROPERTY MARKERS FOUND OR FROM EVIDENCE OF LINES OF APPARENT OCCUPATION."

JEFFREY A. FRATTI
MARYLAND PROPERTY LINE SURVEYOR REG. NO. 587
EXPIRES: 04-02-2013

REFERENCES
| PLAT BK. | A |
| PLAT NO. | 2 |
| LIBER   | 30324 |
| FOLIO   | 613  |

DATE OF LOCATIONS
S 89°30'00"W 42.50'

ETHEREAL AVENUE

SNIDE & ASSOCIATES
LAND SURVEYORS
20270 Goldenrod Lane, Suite 110
Germantown, Maryland 20876
301/948-6100  Fax 301/948-1260

SCALE: 1" = 20'

WALL CHECK: DRAWN BY: E.H.
HSE. LOC.: 10-15-12 JOB NO.: 12-04203
PROPOSED FRONT ELEVATION

1/4" = 1'-0"
PROPOSED REAR ELEVATION

1/4" = 1'-0"
UNIT SECTIONS – WOOD COLLECTION
Aluminum-Clad Exterior

Douglas Fir Interior

Pine or Mahogany Interior

SILL

HEAD

JAMB

Douglas Fir

Solid Pine

Solid Mahogany or Pine

Not to Scale
VIEW FROM STREET - FRONT OF EXIST. HOUSE

VIEW FROM STREET - FRONT/WEST VIEW OF HOUSE
VIEW OF REAR OF EXIST. HOUSE

VIEW OF REAR/WEST SIDE OF HOUSE