HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

Address: 217 Park Ave., Takoma Park  
Meeting Date: 07/25/2018

Resource: Outstanding Resource  
Report Date: 07/18/2018

Takoma Park Historic District

Review: HAWP  
Public Notice: 07/11/2018

Case Number: 37/03-18FF  
Tax Credit: n/a

Applicant: Daniel Mudd  
Staff: Michael Kyne

Proposal: Revision to a Previously Approved Building Addition

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the HPC approve the HAWP application.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Outstanding Resource to the Takoma Park Historic District
STYLE: Craftsman
DATE: c.1915-1925

The subject property is a one-and-a-half story Craftsman Bungalow. It has a side gable roof with a large hipped dormer and a front-facing gable roof over the porch. The house is clad in stucco on the first floor with shingles siding in all of the gables and has one-over-one sash windows throughout. The 1999 rear of the house has a large non-historic shed dormer and a non-historic 1st floor, shed roof addition.

To the left of the historic house is a shared concrete driveway that widens at the rear wall plane of the historic massing of the house. The wood frame single-bay detached garage is placed at the rear of the lot and is orientated toward the driveway.
BACKGROUND

On March 28, 2018 the applicant came before the HPC for a preliminary review for a rear deck, and two-story rear addition with a cantilevered second story. The applicants returned with a HAWP application at the May 9, 2018 meeting, and the application was approved.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes alterations to the fenestration and the door location of the previously approved rear addition.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Takoma Park Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the historic preservation review guidelines in the approved and adopted amendment for the Takoma Park Historic District (Guidelines), Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines

There are two very general, broad planning and design concepts which apply to all categories. These are:

- The design review emphasis will be restricted to changes that are all visible from the public right-of-way, irrespective of landscaping or vegetation (it is expected that the majority of new additions will be reviewed for their impact on the overall district), and

- The importance of assuring that additions and other changes to existing structures act to reinforce and continue existing streetscape, landscape, and building patterns rather than to impair the character of the historic district.
Outstanding Resources – Residential

The Guidelines characterize Outstanding Resources as those

… which [are] of outstanding significance due to [their] architectural and/or historical features. An Outstanding Resource may date from any historical period and may be representative of any architectural style. However, it must have special features, architectural details and/or historical associations that make the resource especially representative of an architectural style, it must be especially important to the history of the district, and/or it must be especially unique within the context of the district.

These resources have the highest level of architectural and/or historical significance. While they will receive the most detailed level of design review, it is permissible to make sympathetic alterations, changes and additions to Outstanding Resources.

As a set of guiding principles for design review of Outstanding Resources, the Historic Preservation Commission will utilize the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.

The Guidelines that pertain to this project are as follows:

- Plans for all alterations should be compatible with the resource’s original design; additions, specifically, should be sympathetic to existing architectural character, including massing, height, setbacks, and materials.
- Emphasize placement of major additions to the rear of existing structures so that they are less visible from the public right-of-way.
- While additions should be compatible, they are not required to be replicative of earlier architectural styles.
- Preservation of original and distinctive architectural features, such as porches, dormers, decorative details, shutters, etc. is encouraged.
- Preservation of original building materials and use of appropriate, compatible new materials is encouraged.
- All changes and additions should respect existing environmental settings, landscaping, and patterns of open space.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or
(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or

(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.

**Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation:**

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The Standards are as follows:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

**STAFF DISCUSSION**

The applicant proposes the following revisions to the fenestration of the previously approved rear addition:

*North Elevation*

As previously approved, there were two 1-over-1 double-hung wood windows on the first-
floor of the north elevation of the rear addition. As revised, the applicant proposes to install paired 1-over-1 double-hung wood windows, which will be offset closer to the rear.

**South Elevation**

The applicant is proposing to shift the location of a window on the first floor of the south elevation of the previously approved rear addition, moving it closer to the historic house. A new window is also proposed in the approximate center of the first floor, south elevation of the rear addition.

**Rear (East) Elevation**

The applicant proposes to revise the location of the French door on the rear elevation of the previously approved rear addition. As approved, the French door was justified to the right (as viewed from the rear), while, as revised, the French door will be justified to the left. The adjacent ganged windows will shift accordingly.

Staff supports the proposed revisions, finding that the proposed window and door alterations are generally compatible with the asymmetrical fenestration of the historic house. The proposed fenestration will be far removed from the street or on the rear of a non-historic rear addition, where it will not detract from the character-defining features of the historic house, in accordance with Standards #2 and #9.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), having found that the proposal is consistent with the Takoma Park Historic District Guidelines identified above, and therefore will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2 and #9;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the 3 permit sets of drawings, if applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make any alterations to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
301/883-3400
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Person: Jackie Braithman
Daytime Phone No.: 301-881-3800

Tax Account No.: 01076630
Name of Property Owner: Daniel H. Mudd
Address: 217 Park Ave, Takoma Park, MD 20912
Contractor: Braithman Design Studio, Inc.
Agent for Owner: Jackie Braithman

Phone No.: 301-881-3800

Name Number: 217
Street: Park Ave
Town/City: Takoma Park
Nearest Cross Street: Carroll Ave
Lot: P25 Block: 2 Subdivision: 0025

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:
☐ Roof ☐ Walls ☐ Windows/Doors ☐ Exterior/Interior Monumental
☐ Interior ☐ Elevator ☐ Accessible ☐ A/C ☐ Bath ☐ Room Additions ☐ Deck ☐ Shed
☐ Door ☐ Chimney ☐ Windows, Awnings ☐ Appliance ☐ Roofing ☐ Wood Burning Stone ☐ Single Family
☐ Exterior ☐ Storage ☐ Removable ☐ Fence/Well/Enclosure Section 11 ☐ Other:

13. Construction cost estimate: $400,000

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved minor permit, see Permit of

1D. PAYMENT OF REQUIRED FEES AND CHARGES

2A. Type of sewage disposal: ☐ Septic ☐ WESC:
2B. Type of water supply: ☐ Well ☐ Septic ☐ WESC:

3A. Indicate whether the house or existing wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
   ☐ On the party line property line ☐ Entirely on land of owner ☐ On public right of way/enclosure

I hereby certify that I have read the application form and have made the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with the rules and regulations approved by the Historic Preservation Commission and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Signature of owner or authorized agent:

3/5/8

Appraiser: For Chairman, Historical Preservation Commission

(All boxes must be checked)

Date:

Application/Permit No.: Date Filed: Date Issued:

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
As Approved
Current Design

1/16 in = 1 ft

1/8 in = 1 ft
Existing Shed Dormer
Repeat Gable Trim / Scaled Down to Size of Gable

HISTORIC MASSING

1999

Plus Proposed Addition

Wood Sash Windows 1-over-1
(See Weather Shield Specs)

Existing Window - to Remain

1/16 in = 1 ft

1/8 in = 1 ft

Perry-Mudd Residence
217 Park Ave
Takoma Park, MD 20912

SOUTH ELEVATION
Revision from Approved HAWP

06/28/18
As Approved

Current Design

1/16 in = 1 ft

1/8 in = 1 ft
Perspective View from Sidewalk at Left
Property Line
Addition Cannot Be Seen
WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW
Horizontal Stack Section - Transom Stack over DH

WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW (610)
Vertical Section

WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW (610)
Horizontal Section

WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW
Vertical Mull Section - DH / DH

Note: All dimensions are approximate. Weather Shield reserves the right to change specifications without notice.
View from Sidewalk

Photos of Existing Conditions

HAWP Application

20 of 20
03/05/18
# HAWP APPLICATION: MAILING ADDRESSES FOR NOTIFING

[Owner, Owner's Agent, Adjacent and Confronting Property Owners]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner’s mailing address</th>
<th>Owner’s Agent’s mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DANIEL H. MUDD</td>
<td>JACKIE BRAITMAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>217 PARK AVE</td>
<td>Braitman Design Studio, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
<td>120 PARK AVE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912-4311</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LAWSON COLLIN M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAWSON KATIE E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>117 PARK AVE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|                                              |                                                  |
| GARDNER STEVE B & ELIZABETH W               | LICKERMAN JON, DIANE IVES                        |
| 219 PARK AVE                                | 122 PARK AVE                                    |
| TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912                      | TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912                           |
|                                              |                                                  |

|                                              |                                                  |
| KARIYA JAMES P                              | AUGUSTIN GILBERT                                 |
| 218 PARK AVE                                | 16905 HARBOUR TOWNE DR                           |
| TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912                      | SILVER SPRING MD 20905-                         |