MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 4807 Dorset Ave., Chevy Chase  Meeting Date: 5/9/2018

Resource: Contributing (Secondary/Post-1915) Resource  Report Date: 5/2/2018
(Somerset Historic District)

Applicant: Maya Weil  Public Notice: 4/25/2018
(Adam Greene, Agent)  Tax Credit: No

Review: HAWP  Staff: Michael Kyne

Case Number: 35/36-18C

PROPOSAL: Pedestrian access construction, hardscape alterations, deck replacement, and other alterations

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the HPC approve with one (1) condition the HAWP application.

1. The proposed pedestrian access at Dorset Avenue is not approved.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Contributing (Secondary/Post-1915) Resource within the Somerset District
STYLE: Eclectic-Craftsman
DATE: c. 1918

The subject property is a c. 1918 Contributing Resource within the Somerset Historic District. The historic house was originally constructed as a “Siberian cedar log home,” and, while it has experienced additions and alterations throughout the years, it retains a high level of integrity and an eclectic architectural vocabulary that contributes to the significance of the Somerset Historic District. The front elevation of the house faces Dorset Avenue, which is more than 200’ from the house, with two side-by-side platted lots between the house and Dorset Avenue. The house is currently accessed via a long, shared driveway off of Surrey Street. According to the 1927 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map (see image in Staff Discussion), the subject property has always had a Dorset Avenue address.
Somerset Historic District Boundary (Subject Property Circled)

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes the following work items at the subject property:

- Construction of a pedestrian access gate with stone and concrete entry walls adjacent to the public sidewalk at Dorset Avenue.
- Replace the existing deck and stairs at the rear of the historic house.
- Construct a trash enclosure at the top of the existing driveway.
- Tree removal.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Somerset Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), the Somerset Historic District Guidelines (Guidelines), and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:
(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or

(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.

**Somerset Historic District Guidelines**

- Other important features which create and enhance the historic character of the Somerset community include: the spacing and rhythm of buildings, the uniform scale of existing houses, the relationship of houses to the street, the ample size lots and patterns of open space in the neighborhood, the mature trees and landscaping, and the grid system of streets with clearly defined streetscapes. These elements should be retained and preserved as the area continues to grow and develop.

**Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation**

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The Standards are as follows:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.
STAFF DISCUSSION:

1927 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map (Subject Property Circled in Red)

The applicant proposes the following work items at the subject property:

- Construction of a pedestrian access gate with stone and concrete entry walls adjacent to the public sidewalk at Dorset Avenue.

The proposed pedestrian access will be 10'-4" W x 12'-6" L and will consist of bluestone pavers set on concrete, with a 3'-2" H concrete wall at its left side and a 3'-3" H stacked stone wall at its right side. There will be a pivoting gate constructed from horizontal steel rods and wood slats between the two walls. A backlit address plate will be installed on the concrete wall facing Dorset Avenue. The pedestrian access is designed to take cues from the historic house and a 2014 left-side addition, which was approved by the HPC. As noted above, the historic house is more than 200' from Dorset Avenue, with two side-by-side platted lots between the historic house and Dorset Avenue, and, at 12'-6" in length, the proposed pedestrian access will terminate a great distance from the historic house.

Currently, there is a temporary aluminum arbor with gate and a small walkway consisting of widely spaced flagstone pavers set on dirt in the location of the proposed pedestrian access. The existing walkway is of average width (approximately 3’) and only extends a short distance from the sidewalk. There are also temporary address signs for the subject property staked in the ground in the same location.
At staff’s request, the applicant has provided photographic examples of similar features located within the historic district; however, the submitted photographs depict stone retaining walls and/or masonry piers that flank traditional walkways or driveways that extend from the sidewalk or street to the front of the house. The applicant has not provided any examples of similar features to demonstrate compatibility with the streetscape, and staff could not locate any similar features within the historic district.

Staff finds that proposed pedestrian access is incompatible with the streetscape of the historic district in design, location, and material. The proposed pedestrian access will be located adjacent to the public sidewalk not far removed from Dorset Avenue, which serves as the primary entrance to the historic district, and it has the potential to detract from the character-defining features of the streetscape and historic district as a whole. Staff recommends that the proposed pedestrian access not be approved.

- Replace the existing deck and stairs at the rear of the historic house.

The applicant proposes to replace the existing non-original wood deck, stairs, and railing at the rear of the property. The proposed new deck will consist of wood decking and stairs, with a steel cable banister and railing. The proposed deck will be located at the rear of the historic house and is generally compatible with terrace with steel cable banister and railing at the front of the house (approved by the HPC in 2014). The proposed deck and stair replacement will not alter or remove character-defining features of the subject property or surrounding historic district.

- Construct a trash enclosure at the top of the existing driveway.

The applicant proposes to construct a trash enclosure at the top of the existing shared driveway, which is accessed from Surrey Street. The proposed trash enclosure will be 9'-2" W x 9'-2" L x 4' H, with horizontal wood panel walls and double gates on the front and rear. The rear (the side facing Dorset Avenue) will be used as a bicycle storage area.

A 14'-7 ¼" L x 4' H concrete site wall be constructed to the west of the enclosure (to the left of the enclosure when viewing the house from Dorset Avenue). Staff was initially concerned with a freestanding concrete site wall; however, because the proposed site wall will be far removed from the public right-of-way of Dorset Avenue and Surrey Street, staff finds that it will not detract from the streetscape or surrounding historic district. The proposed trash enclosure and concrete site wall will be constructed in a location where they will not obscure the front of the historic house when viewing it from Dorset Avenue.

- Tree removal.

The applicant proposes to remove one 8” DBH Mimosa tree from the rear of the subject property and one 8” DBH Hemlock tree from the front of the subject property. The subject property is moderately forested, and staff finds that the removal of these two 8” DBH trees will not detract from the character-defining features of the subject property or surrounding historic district.

- Other.

The applicant has elected to remove the in-kind fence replacement and removal of an 18” DBH Tulip tree from their current proposal.

After full and fair consideration of the applicants’ submission, staff finds the proposal, as modified by the condition, as being consistent with the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-(b) 1 and 2, and having found
the proposal is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation outlined above.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the Commission **approve with the condition specified on Circle 1** the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), having found that the proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of the resource and is compatible in character with the resource and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #2, 9, and 10;

and with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #2, 9, and 10;

and with the **permit sets of drawings, if applicable, to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping** prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff's discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make **any alterations** to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will **contact the staff person** assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: AGREENE@BONSTRA.COM
Contact Person: ADAM GREENE

Tax Account No.: 00537256
Daytime Phone No.: 202-328-5715

Name of Property Owner: MAYA WEIL
Daytime Phone No.: 703-409-3832

Address: 4807 DORSET AVE., CHEVY CHASE MD 20815

Contractor: TBD

Contractor Registration No.: 

Agent for Owner: 

Daytime Phone No.: 

LOCATION OF BUILDING/PREMISES

House Number: 4807
Street: DORSET AVENUE
Town/City: SOMERSET/CHEVY CHASE
Nearest Cross Street: SURREY STREET
Lot: 36 Block: 2 Subdivision: 0044
Liber: 15135 Folio: 0061 Parcel: N/A

PART ONE: PROJECT SUMMARY

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE: 
☐ Construct ☐ Extend ☐ Alter/Renovate ☐ A/C ☐ Stab ☐ Room Addition ☐ Porch ☐ Deck ☐ Shed
☐ Move ☐ Install ☐ Wreck/Raze ☐ Solar ☐ Fireplace ☐ Woodburning Stove ☐ Single Family
☐ Revision ☐ Repair ☐ Reversible ☐ Fence/Wall (complete Section 4) ☐ Other:

1B. Construction cost estimate: $ 50,000

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit # N/A

PART TWO: COMPLETE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION AND EXTERIOR ADDITIONS

2A. Type of sewage disposal: 01 ☐ WSSC 02 ☐ Septic 03 ☐ Other:

2B. Type of water supply: 01 ☐ WSSC 02 ☐ Well 03 ☐ Other:

PART THREE: COMPLETE ONLY FOR FENCE/RETAINING WALL

3A. Height _______ feet _______ inches

FRONT WALL: 39" FROM GRADE TO T.O. WALL
WALL AT TOP OF DRIVEWAY: 48" FROM GRADE TO T.O. WALL

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
☐ On property line/property line ☐ Entirely on land of owner ☐ On public right of way/easement

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Signature of owner or authorized agent

4/18/2018

Date

For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission

Approved: ____________________________ Disapproved: ____________________________

Signature: ____________________________ Date: ____________________________

Application/Permit No.: ____________________________ Date Filed: ____________________________ Date Issued: ____________________________

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:

   RECENTLY COMPLETED RENOVATION AND ADDITION TO HISTORIC HOME BUILT IN 1919. PROPERTY INCLUDES A LARGE LAWN FRONTING DORSET AVENUE WITH EXISTING STONE WALL FEATURES AT THE SHARED DRIVEWAY ENTRANCE AND THE SIDE YARD TO THE WEST OF THE HOUSE.

   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:

   THIS WORK IS PART OF A LARGER MASTER PLAN FOR LANDSCAPING THE PROPERTY. THE WORK SEEKING APPROVAL INCLUDES REPLACING FENCES IN KIND ON THE WEST AND NORTH SIDES OF THE PROPERTY (AS NEEDED), NEW STONE AND CONCRETE ENTRY WALLS AND GATE (LIGHTING, ADDRESS PLACARD AND LANDSCAPING TO BE COMPLETED AS PART OF THIS WORK OUTSIDE OF APPROVALS), REPLACEMENT DECK AND STAIR AT REAR OF HOUSE, NEW CONCRETE WALL WITH WOOD WASTE BIN ENCLOSURE AT TOP OF DRIVEWAY.

2. SITE PLAN
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plot. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.
   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resource(s) and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (facades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context. All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS
   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the dripline of any tree 6” or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS
   For all projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lot(s) or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT (IN BLUE OR BLACK INK) OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.
The property shown hereon is not within Zone A Special Flood Hazard Area per F.E.M.A. Flood Insurance Rate Maps.

SURVEYOR'S CERTIFICATES:

I hereby certify that the position of the existing improvements on the above described property has been carefully established by a transit - tape survey and that unless otherwise shown, there are no visible encroachments.

DATE: 30th May 2014

I hereby certify that I have carefully surveyed the property as shown by this plat and that all improvements are in place as shown.

DATE:

W. L. MEEKINS, INC.
3101 RITCHIE ROAD
FORESTVILLE, MD 20747
TEL: 301-736-6987 / 7118
4807 DORSET AVE. - WASTE BIN ENCLOSURE

HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

HAWP APPROVAL
APRIL 25, 2018

COVER SHEET

DRAWING INDEX

CS0.3
A1.3
A2
A3
A4
A5
A6

WASTE BIN ENCLOSURE DRAWINGS

NOT USED
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Detail: EXISTING SHARED DRIVEWAY ENTRY @ SURREY STREET

Detail: FRONT PARKING COURT, LANDSCAPING & HOME ADDITION/ RENOVATION

Applicant: ____________________________
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Detail: **REAR PORCH AND BACK YARD**

Detail: **SIDE YARD RETAINING WALL**
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Detail: ORIGINAL SIDE YARD RETAINING WALL

Detail: FRONT PARKING COURT AND LANDSCAPING

Applicant: ________________________
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Detail: REAR DECK AND STAIR

Detail:

Applicant: ________________________________

Page: ___
EXITING ENTRY DRIVE ON SURREY STREET
LOCATION OF PROPOSED WALL, ADDRESS PLATE, AND TRASH ENCLOSURE
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner's mailing address</th>
<th>Owner's Agent's mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maya Weil</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4807 Dorset Ave</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maya Weil</td>
<td>Jody and Rodd Macklin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4807 Dorset Ave</td>
<td>4817 Dorset Ave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patricia and Robert Gage</td>
<td>Dabney and James Goold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4805 Dorset Ave</td>
<td>5812 Surrey St</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leslie and Phyllis Wiesenfelder</td>
<td>David Brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4812 Cumberland Ave</td>
<td>4814 Cumberland Ave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Megan Spellacy and Perry Urken</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4816 Cumberland Ave</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jay Klug and Jamie Hechinger</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4816 Dorset Ave</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nancy Galler</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5712 Surrey St</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase MD 20815</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>