HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

Address: 217 Park Ave., Takoma Park  
Meeting Date: 5/9/18

Resource: Outstanding Resource  
Report Date: 5/2/18
Takoma Park Historic District

Review: HAWP  
Public Notice: 4/25/18

Case Number: 37/03-18FF  
Tax Credit: n/a

Applicant: Daniel Mudd  
Staff: Dan Bruechert

Proposal: Building Addition

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the HPC approve the HAWP application.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Outstanding Resource to the Takoma Park Historic District
STYLE: Craftsman
DATE: c.1915-1925

The subject property is a one-and-a-half story Craftsman Bungalow. It has a side gable roof with a large hipped dormer and a front-facing gable roof over the porch. The house is clad in stucco on the first floor with shingles siding in all of the gables and has one-over-one sash windows throughout. The 1999 rear of the house has a large non-historic shed dormer and a non-historic 1st floor, shed roof addition.

To the left of the historic house is a shared concrete driveway that widens at the rear wall plane of the historic massing of the house. The wood frame single-bay detached garage is placed at the rear of the lot and is orientated toward the driveway.
BACKGROUND

On March 28, 2018 the applicant came before the HPC for a preliminary review for a rear deck, and two-story rear addition with a cantilevered second story. The current proposal was significantly revised based on the feedback presented at the meeting.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to construct a two-story, rear addition and deck at the rear of the house. 

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES:

When reviewing alterations and additions for new construction within the Takoma Park Historic District, decisions are guided by the Takoma Park Historic District Design Guidelines (Design Guidelines) and Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A).

Takoma Park Historic District Design Guidelines

There are two very general, broad planning and design concepts which apply to all categories. These are:

The design review emphasis will be restricted to changes that are at all visible from the public right-of-way, irrespective of landscaping or vegetation (it is expected that the majority of new additions will be reviewed for their impact on the overall district), and,

The importance of assuring that additions and other changes to existing structures act to reinforce and continue existing streetscape, landscape, and building patterns rather than to impair the character of the district.

Outstanding Resources have the highest level of architectural and/or historical significance. While they will receive the most detailed level of design review, it is permissible to make sympathetic alterations, changes and additions. The guiding principles to be utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission are the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
Specifically, some of the factors to be considered in reviewing HAWPs on Outstanding Resources:

- Plans for all alterations should be compatible with the resource’s original design; additions, specifically, should be sympathetic to existing architectural character, including massing, height, setback, and materials.

- Emphasize placement of major additions to the rear of existing structures so that they are less visible from the public right-of-way.

- While additions should be compatible, they are not required to be replicative of earlier architectural styles.

- Preservation of original building materials and use of appropriate, compatible new materials is encouraged.

- All changes and additions should respect existing environmental settings, landscaping, and patterns of open space.

_Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8(b)_

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

1. The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

2. The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter.

**STAFF DISCUSSION**

The applicant proposes to construct a rectangular, two-story, side gable addition to the rear of the historic house that projects to the right of the historic massing of the house. The proposal also includes a rear deck that is accessed by a ramp at the rear. The proposed construction will have minimal impact on the historic fabric of the house, and it is compatible in design and materials with the surrounding district.

**New Construction.**

The applicant proposes constructing a two-story addition that will encompass the 1999 addition and extend 19’ (nineteen feet) beyond the rear wall plane of the historic massing and will be approximately 23’ 6” (twenty-three feet, six inches) wide. The proposed addition will maintain the 1999 addition’s 4’ 6” (four feet, six inch) projection to the right of the historic massing while keeping most of the new construction to the rear out of view of the right-of-way.

The proposed addition will have a side gable roof with three-tab asphalt shingles that sits 18” (eighteen inches) below the ridgeline of the historic roof. The shingles will match the appearance of the historic house. Staff finds this is an appropriate treatment. While similar in
slope to the historic roof, the proposed roof will be less steep than the historic. The historic roof
slope is 7.5 to 12 while the historic is slightly flatter at 6.5 to 12. The slope of the historic
dormer is 3.5 to 10 compared to the flatter 2.5 to 12 slope of the proposed dormer. Under the
gable, the applicant proposes to add a more modest version of the decorative trim found in the
historic house. The wall dormer proposed at the rear also echoes the form of the rear shed
dormer in the historic massing to create adequate living space in the upper floor to the rear. Staff
finds that this form is compatible with the historic house while having a minimal impact on the
surrounding streetscape.

The applicant proposes to clad the addition in smooth Hardi panels on the ground floor that will
cover the foundation and Hardi shingles in the upper floor. Staff finds that the smooth materials
successfully differentiate the new construction with the historic stucco while simultaneously
tyning together the design of the historic building’s original design with the Hardi shingles above
(per the Guidelines).

The applicant proposes to install Weather Shield, wood, double hung windows on the first floor
and under the gables in the addition. There are two windows proposed for the north elevation
and a single window and a pair of windows on the south elevation. The applicant proposes to
install four windows and a pair of wood French doors at the rear. Staff finds that the wood
windows and doors are of a compatible material and in a configuration that is consistent with the
historic house and Staff supports approval. The applicant proposes installing wood casement
windows in the wall dormer at the rear. These single-lite windows create a consistent
appearance with the windows in the shed dormer on the massing of the historic house. Staff
finds that this window uses an appropriate material in an acceptable configuration per the
Guidelines.

Staff finds that the form and design of the proposed addition are consistent with this Outstanding
resource and supports its approval.

Deck
The applicant proposes to construct a triangular deck to the rear that will be approximately 18’
(eighteen feet) deep by 19’ (nineteen feet) wide and will have a ramp at the rear. The applicant
has indicated that this ramp will be built out of cedar and will only be 18” (eighteen inches) tall.
A railing is not required for a deck of this height. The applicant proposes a simple steel pipe
handrail up the ramp. This feature will be at the rear of the property and will be obscured by the
house and will not be visible from the public right-of-way. Staff supports approval of the deck,
ramp, and railing.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**
Staff recommends the HPC approve the HAWP application;

and with the general condition applicable to all Historic Area Work Permits that the applicant
will present 3 permit sets of drawings to HPC staff for review and stamping prior to
submission for permits (if applicable). After issuance of the Montgomery County Department
of Permitting Services (DPS) permit, the applicant will arrange for a field inspection by calling
the DPS Field Services Office at 240-777-6370 prior to commencement of work and not more
than two weeks following completion of work.
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
301/583-3400

APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Person: Jackie Braithman

Tax Account No.: 01078630

Name of Property Owner: Daniel H. Mudd

Address: 217 Park Ave, Takoma Park, MD 20912

Contractor: Braithman Design Studio, Inc.

Contractor Registration No.: HIC# 125976

Agent for Owner: Jackie Braithman

Employee Phone No.: 301-891-3800

Facsimile No.: 301-891-3800

Permit No.: 2I-07-25

Type: Park Ave

Town/City: Takoma Park

Nearest Cross Street: Carroll Ave

Lot: P25

Subdivision: 0025

Use: Residential

Date: 3/5/18

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:

- [ ] Construct
- [ ] Extend
- [ ] Alter/Remodel
- [ ] Additions
- [ ] Roof
- [ ] Porch
- [ ] Deck
- [ ] Shed
- [ ] Other:

1B. Total cost estimate: $400,000

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved permit, see Exhibit:

2A. Type of sewage disposal:

- [ ] Septic
- [ ] Waste Water System
- [ ] Other:

2B. Type of water supply:

- [ ] Waste Water System
- [ ] Well
- [ ] Other:

3A. Height:

3B. Foundation:

3C. Indicate whether the sewer or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:

- [ ] Property line
- [ ] Entirely on land of owner
- [ ] On public right of way/abutters

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Signature of owner or authorized agent

Date

Appraiser: ____________ For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproval: ____________ Date:

Application/Permit No.: ____________ Date Filed: ____________ Date Issued: ____________

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner's mailing address</th>
<th>Owner's Agent's mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DANIEL H. MUDD</td>
<td>JACKIE BRAITMAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>217 PARK AVE</td>
<td>Braitman Design Studio, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
<td>120 PARK AVE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912-4311</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner's mailing address</th>
<th>Owner's Agent's mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LAWSON COLLIN M</td>
<td>WILLIAMSON DAVID 3RD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAWSON KATIE E</td>
<td>220 PARK AVE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>117 PARK AVE</td>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner's mailing address</th>
<th>Owner's Agent's mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GARDNER STEVE B &amp; ELIZABETH W</td>
<td>LICKERMAN JON, DIANE IVES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>219 PARK AVE</td>
<td>122 PARK AVE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner's mailing address</th>
<th>Owner's Agent's mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KARIYA JAMES P</td>
<td>AUGUSTIN GILBERT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>218 PARK AVE</td>
<td>16305 HARBOUR TOWNE DR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAKOMA PARK, MD 20912</td>
<td>SILVER SPRING MD 20905-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lot Coverage:
Lot Size: 5,493 Sq Ft
Garage: 180 sq ft
Historic Massing: 910 sq ft
Total All Additions: 505 sq ft
Proposed New Lot Coverage: 1505 sq ft / 20%
No Changes to Historic Details

2nd Floor Proposed Addition

1999 Existing 1-Story Addition

30.6' Historic Massing

4.6'

E1 - PROPOSED FRONT ELEVATION
1/8 in = 1 ft

PERRY-MUDD RESIDENCE
217 Park Ave, Takoma Park, MD 20912

PROPOSED ELEVATIONS
HAWP APPLICATION (Updated)

Braitman Design Studio
MHIC License #125978
120 Park Ave
Takoma Park, MD 20912
Phone: 301-891-3800

04/02/18

www.BraitmanDesign.com
E2 - PROPOSED BACK ELEVATION
1/8 in = 1 ft
E3 - PROPOSED NORTH ELEVATION
1/8 in = 1 ft
E4 - PROPOSED SOUTH ELEVATION
1/8 in = 1 ft

Repeat Gable Trim / Scaled Down to Size of Gable
Hardi-Shingle
Repeat Wood Brackets
Carry Wood Trim Boards Around House
Hardi-Vertical Panel (Smooth)

Smooth Foundation to Coordinate with Original Foundation
Low Deck / No Railings
Wood Lattice Under Deck

1999 Plus Proposed Addition
Wood Sash Windows 1-over-1 (See Weather Shield Specs)
Existing Window - to Remain

HISTORIC MASSING

PERRY-MUDD RESIDENCE
217 Park Ave, Takoma Park, MD 20912

PROPOSED ELEVATIONS
HAWP APPLICATION (Updated)

04/02/18

Braitman Design Studio
MHC License #125678
120 Park Ave
Takoma Park, MD 20912
Phone: 301-891-3800
www.BraitmanDesign.com
WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW
Horizontal Stack Section - Transom Stack over DH

WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW (610)
Vertical Section

WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW (610)
Horizontal Section

WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW
Vertical Mull Section - DH / DH

Note: All dimensions are approximate. Weather Shield reserves the right to change specifications without notice.
Weather Shield®
Weather Shield Series™

Double Hung Windows
CROSS SECTION DETAILS

WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW
Horizontal Stack Section - Transom Stack over DH

WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW (610)
Vertical Section - 6-6/16" jamb

WEATHER SHIELD DOUBLE HUNG WINDOW
Horizontal Section - 6-9/16" jamb

Note: All dimensions are approximate. Weather Shield reserves the right to change specifications without notice.

www.weathershield.com  Weather Shield Windows and Doors

REV 7/17
Right Facade