MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 23 Primrose St., Chevy Chase
Resource: Contributing Resource
(Chevy Chase Village Historic District)
Applicant: Elizabeth McGrann
(Michael Egnor, Architect)
Review: HAWP
Case Number: 35/13-18K
PROPOSAL: Garage alterations

Meeting Date: 5/23/2018
Report Date: 5/16/2018
Public Notice: 5/9/2018
Tax Credit: N/A
Staff: Michael Kyne

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the HPC approve the HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Contributing Resource within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District
STYLE: Colonial Revival
DATE: c. 1916-1927

PROPOSAL:

The applicant proposes to alter the opening of the two-car garage at the rear of the subject property.
APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District, several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the historic preservation review guidelines in the approved and adopted amendment for the Chevy Chase Village Historic District (Guidelines), Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or

(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any one period or architectural style.

Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines

The guidelines break down specific projects into three levels of review – Lenient, Moderate and Strict Scrutiny.

“Lenient Scrutiny” means that the emphasis of the review should be on issues of general massing and scale, and compatibility with the surrounding streetscape, and should allow for a very liberal interpretation of preservation rules. Most changes should be permitted unless there are major problems with massing, scale and compatibility.
“Moderate Scrutiny” involves a higher standard of review than “lenient scrutiny.” Besides issues of massing, scale and compatibility, preserving the integrity of the resource is taken into account. Alterations should be designed so that the altered structure still contributes to the district. Use of compatible new materials, rather than the original building materials, should be permitted. Planned changes should be compatible with the structure’s existing design, but should not be required to replicate its architectural style.

“Strict Scrutiny” means that the planned changes should be reviewed to insure that the integrity of the significant exterior architectural or landscaping features and details is not compromised. However, strict scrutiny should not be “strict in theory but fatal in fact” i.e. it does not mean that there can be no changes but simply that the proposed changes should be reviewed with extra care.

The Guidelines state three basic policies that should be adhered to, including:

Preserving the integrity of the contributing structures in the district. Alterations to contributing structures should be designed in such a way that the altered structure still contributes to the district.

Design review emphasis should be restricted to changes that will be visible from the front or side public right-of-way, or that would be visible in the absence of vegetation or landscaping.

Alterations to the portion of a property that are not visible from the public right-of-way should be subject to very lenient review. Most changes to rear of the properties should be approved as a matter of course.

The Guidelines that pertain to this project are as follows:

**Garages and accessory buildings** which are detached from the main house should be subject to lenient scrutiny, but should be compatible with the main building.

**Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation**

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The Standards are as follows:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

**STAFF DISCUSSION**

The subject property is a c. 1916-1927 Colonial Revival-style Contributing Resource within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District. There is a two-car garage at the rear/right (as viewed from the front) corner of the subject property, which is depicted in the 1949 Kline Property Atlas (see below) and likely dates to when the main house was constructed. The garage currently has two openings at the front separated by a 1’ wide section of exterior framing. Each opening has a wooden rollup garage door, which may be original.
The applicant proposes to remove the 1' wide section of exterior framing from the front of the garage and replace the two existing wooden rollup garage doors with a single wooden rollup carriage-style garage door. Lantern-style lights will be installed on either side.

In accordance with the Guidelines, the HPC should review the applicant’s proposal with lenient scrutiny, and the proposal should be permitted unless there are major concerns with massing, scale and compatibility. Staff finds that the proposed replacement garage door and lights are compatible with the subject property and the surrounding historic district, and the proposal will not detract from the character-defining features of the streetscape.

After full and fair consideration of the applicant’s submission staff finds the proposal as being consistent with the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-(b) 1 and 2, having found the proposal is consistent with the Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2 and #9 outlined above.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), having found that the proposal is consistent with the Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines identified above, and therefore will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation #2 and #9;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the 3 permit sets of drawings, if applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make any alterations to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: mihee@overmyerarchitects.com

Name of Property Owner: Elizabeth McGreevy
Daytime Phone No.: 847-363-1310
Address: 23 Primrose St. Chevy Chase MD 20815
Contractor: PETERSON + COLENS, INC.
Phone No.: 202-234-4500
Contractor Registration No.: 
Agent for Owner: mihee@overmyerarchitects.com
Daytime Phone No.: 202-385-5596 x103

LOCATION OF DEMOLITION, ALTERATION, OR ADDITION
House Number: 23
Street: Primrose St.
Town/City: Chevy Chase
Nearest Cross Street: Brookville Rd.
Lot: P16 Block: SB Subdivision: 009

PART ONE: TYPE OF PERMIT, LOCATION, AND USE
1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE: 
☐ Construct ☐ Extend ☐ Alter/Remodel ☐ Add: Gas/Plumbing
☐ Move ☐ Install ☐ Work/Renovate ☐ Solar ☐ Replace ☐ Woodburning Stove ☐ Garage Door
☐ Revision ☐ Repair ☐ Reroofable ☐ Fence/Wall (complete Section 4) ☐ Other: GARAGE DOOR
1B. Construction cost estimate: $15,000
1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit #

PART TWO: COMMENTS OR REQUESTS FOR CONSTRUCTION AND REMOVAL OF WALLS
2A. Type of sewage disposal: ☐ 01 WSSC ☐ 02 Septic ☐ 03 Other:
2B. Type of water supply: ☐ 01 WSSC ☐ 02 Well ☐ 03 Other:

PART THREE: COMMENTS OR REQUESTS FOR FOUNDATION OR WALLS
3A. Height: feet inches

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
☐ On party line/property line ☐ Entirely on land of owner ☐ On public right of way/encroachment

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept that as a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Signature of owner or authorized agent

4/24/18

Approved: ____________________________ For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproved: ____________________________ Date:

Application/Permit No.: ____________________________ Date Filed: ____________________________ Date Issued:

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:
      Existing 3-story traditional single family house built in 1911, with 2-car garage at rear. Separate from house, two separate openings exit with 1" wide of wall between no existing lights at garage.

   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:
      New garage openings to be turned into one opening. Two lintels added to garage. A structure, one on each side of new garage door.

2. SITE PLAN
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plot. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and date; ✓
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and ✓
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping. ✓

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.
   ✓ Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resource(s) and the proposed work.
   ✓ Elevations (facades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context. All materials and features proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS
   ✓ General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   ✓ Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   ✓ Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
   ✓ If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the dripline of any tree 6" or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONCERNING PROPERTY OWNERS
   ✓ For ALL projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and concerning property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lot(s) or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT (IN BLUE OR BLACK INK) OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.
# McGrann Garage

**23 Primrose Street**  
**Chevy Chase, MD 20815**

## Applicable Codes

- 2015 NFPA 70 ELECTRICAL CODE
- 2016 IBC ENERGY CONSERVATION CODE
- WDIE PLUMBING CODE
- 2016 IGC INTERNATIONAL RESIDENTIAL CODE
- 2015 NFC NEC NATIONAL ELECTRICAL CODE

## Project Scope

- **Garage Work to Include:**
  - Remove (3) garage doors, and center post.
  - Replace with (3) 12'0" garage door.
  - Add upstairs wall, gutter, lap siding, flanging new garage door.

## Vicinity Plan

![Vicinity Plan](image)

Scale: Not to Scale

## Drawing Index

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Architectural</th>
<th>C001</th>
<th>COVER SHEET</th>
<th>A001</th>
<th>SITE PLAN</th>
<th>A002</th>
<th>GARAGE PLAN AND ELEVATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

## Existing Photographs

**Existing Garage Elevation**

**View from Public Right of Way**
NOTES:
1. CUSTOMER TO SELECT WOOD SPECIES, TRACK, COUNTERBALANCE & FINISH OPTIONS WHEN PLACING ORDER.
2. NOMINAL DOOR THICKNESS TO VARY BASED ON WOOD MATERIALS CHOSEN AT TIME OF ORDER.
3. STANDARD DOOR CONFIGURATION INCLUDES NO LOCK HOLE. OTHER LOCK OPTIONS ARE AVAILABLE.

TOP SECTION DESIGN: SQ24

FRONT ELEVATION DESIGN: CRD1
NOTES:
1. MOUNTING HARDWARE SUPPLIED BY OTHERS
2. FIXTURES ARE HANDCRAFTED. DIMENSIONS MAY VARY PLUS OR MINUS 1/8"
3. ELECTRIC LIGHTS SUPPLIED WITH 18/2 WIRE WITH GROUND
4. GAS LIGHTS SUPPLIED WITH 1/8" COPPER GAS LINE AND 3/8" x 1/4" GAS LINE ADAPTOR
   PLEASE NOTE: 10", 12" BRACKET MOUNT SIZES ARE NOT SOLD IN GAS.

BEVOLO GAS & ELECTRIC LIGHTS

LIGHT: WILLIAMSBURG 10", 12", 15", 18"

BRACKET: BRACKET MOUNT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SIZE</th>
<th>10&quot;</th>
<th>12&quot;</th>
<th>15&quot;</th>
<th>18&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A:</td>
<td>10 1/8&quot;</td>
<td>12 1/8&quot;</td>
<td>15 1/8&quot;</td>
<td>18 1/8&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B:</td>
<td>7 1/4&quot;</td>
<td>8 3/4&quot;</td>
<td>7 1/4&quot;</td>
<td>8 3/4&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C:</td>
<td>8 5/8&quot;</td>
<td>10 1/8&quot;</td>
<td>8 5/8&quot;</td>
<td>10 1/8&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D:</td>
<td>2 1/2&quot;</td>
<td>2 1/2&quot;</td>
<td>2 1/2&quot;</td>
<td>2 1/2&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E:</td>
<td>3 1/4&quot;</td>
<td>3 1/4&quot;</td>
<td>3 1/4&quot;</td>
<td>3 1/4&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F:</td>
<td>6 7/8&quot;</td>
<td>8 7/8&quot;</td>
<td>11 7/8&quot;</td>
<td>14 7/8&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DRW BY: JLG  COPYRIGHT 2009, BEVOLO GAS & ELECTRIC LIGHTS. DRAWINGS & DESIGNS ARE OWNED BY BEVOLO AND REMAIN THE SOLE AND EXCLUSIVE PROPERTY OF BEVOLO GAS & ELECTRIC LIGHTS. DRAWINGS AND DESIGNS SHALL NOT BE DUPLICATED IN WHOLE OR PART.
Municipality Letter for Proposed Construction Project

Subject Property: 23 Primrose Street, Chevy Chase, MD 20815
Property Owner: Elizabeth McGrann
Project Manager/Contractor: Dale Overmyer, Architect
Proposed Work: Alterations to existing garage

4/17/2018

Diane R. Schwartz Jones, Director
Department of Permitting Services of Montgomery County
255 Rockville Pike, 2nd floor
Rockville, MD 20850

Dear Ms. Jones,

This letter is to inform your department that the above homeowner/contractor has notified Chevy Chase Village that he or she plans to apply for both county and municipal permits for the above summarized construction project. Chevy Chase Village will not issue any municipal building permit(s) for this proposed project until Montgomery County has issued all necessary county permits and the applicant has provided Chevy Chase Village with copies of county-approved and stamped plans. We have advised the homeowner/contractor that a permit from Montgomery County does not guarantee a permit from this municipality unless the project complies with all our municipal rules and regulations.

If this homeowner/contractor later applies for an amended county permit, please do not approve that application until you have received a Municipality Letter from us indicating that the homeowner/contractor has notified us of that proposed amendment to the permit.

If you have any questions about this proposed project and the municipal regulation of it by Chevy Chase Village, do not hesitate to have your staff contact my office. The Village Permitting Coordinator can be reached by phone at 301-654-7300 or by e-mail at ecvpermitting@montgomerycountymd.gov

Sincerely,

Shana R. Davis-Cook
Chevy Chase Village Manager
### HAWP APPLICATION: MAILING ADDRESSES FOR NOTIFYING
[Owner, Owner’s Agent, Adjacent and Confronting Property Owners]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner’s mailing address</th>
<th>Owner’s Agent’s mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23 Primrose St.</td>
<td>3213 P St. NW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
<td>Washington, DC 20007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Josepha Faley</strong></td>
<td>25 Primrose St.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Robert Toth</strong></td>
<td>21 Primrose St.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Robert Stillman</strong></td>
<td>22 Primrose St.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shamrock Property Trust Agreement</strong></td>
<td>28 Primrose St.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bruce Baschuk</strong></td>
<td>36 Primrose St.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>