MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 34 West Kirke St., Chevy Chase
Resource: Contributing Resource
Chevy Chase Village Historic District
Applicant: Thomas Dann
(Derek Binsted, Architect)
Review: HAWP
Case Number: 35/13-16GG REVISION
PROPOSAL: Rear addition, window replacement, and garage alterations

Meeting Date: 2/21/2018
Report Date: 2/14/2018
Public Notice: 2/7/2018
Tax Credit: N/A
Staff: Michael Kyne

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:
Staff recommends that the HPC approve the HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION:
SIGNIFICANCE: Contributing Resource within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District
STYLE: Bungalow
DATE: c. 1892-1916

BACKGROUND:
The applicant’s proposal for rear addition, window replacement, and garage alterations was previously approved by the Commission at the October 26, 2016 HPC meeting.

PROPOSAL:
• Extend the depth of the previously approved rear addition by 3'-6".

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES:
In accordance with section 1.5 of the Historic Preservation Commission Rules, Guidelines, and Procedures (Regulation No. 27-97) ("Regulations"), in developing its decision when reviewing a Historic Area Work Permit application for an undertaking at a Master Plan site the Commission uses section 24A-8 of the Montgomery County Code ("Chapter 24A"), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation ("Standards"), and pertinent guidance in applicable master plans. [Note: where guidance in an applicable master plan is inconsistent with the Standards, the master plan guidance shall take precedence (section 1.5(b) of the Regulations).] The pertinent information in these documents, incorporated in their entirety by reference herein, is outline below.
Sec. 24A-8. Same-Criteria for issuance.

(a) The commission shall instruct the director to deny a permit if it finds, based on the evidence and information presented to or before the commission that the alteration for which the permit is sought would be inappropriate, inconsistent with or detrimental to the preservation, enhancement or ultimate protection of the historic site or historic resource within an historic district, and to the purposes of this chapter.

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

1. The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or
2. The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or
3. The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or
4. The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or
5. The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; [emphasis added] or
6. In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any period or architectural style.

(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. *(Ord No. 9-4, § 1; Ord No. 11-59)*

Chevy Chase Historic District Guidelines

The guidelines break down specific projects into three levels of review – Lenient, Moderate and Strict Scrutiny.

“Lenient Scrutiny” means that the emphasis of the review should be on issues of general massing and scale, and compatibility with the surrounding streetscape, and should allow for a very liberal interpretation of preservation rules. Most changes should be permitted unless there are major problems with massing, scale and compatibility.

“Moderate Scrutiny” involves a higher standard of review than “lenient scrutiny.” Besides issues of massing, scale and compatibility, preserving the integrity of the resource is taken into account. Alterations should be designed so that the altered structure still contributes to the district. Use of compatible new materials, rather than the original building materials, should be permitted. Planned changes should be compatible with the structure’s existing design, but should not be required to replicate its architectural style.
“Strict Scrutiny” means that the planned changes should be reviewed to ensure that the integrity of the significant exterior architectural or landscaping features and details is not compromised. However, strict scrutiny should not be “strict in theory but fatal in fact” i.e. it does not mean that there can be no changes but simply that the proposed changes should be reviewed with extra care.

The Guidelines state three basic policies that should be adhered to, including:

Preserving the integrity of the contributing structures in the district. Alterations to contributing structures should be designed in such a way that the altered structure still contributes to the district.

Design review emphasis should be restricted to changes that will be visible from the front or side public right-of-way, or that would be visible in the absence of vegetation or landscaping.

Alterations to the portion of a property that are not visible from the public right-of-way should be subject to very lenient review. Most changes to rear of the properties should be approved as a matter of course.

The Guidelines that pertain to this project are as follows:

**Major additions** should, where feasible, be placed to the rear of the existing structure so that they are less visible from the public right-of-way. Major additions which substantially alter or obscure the front of the structure should be discouraged but not automatically prohibited. For example, where lot size does not permit placement to the rear, and the proposed addition is compatible with the street scape, it should be subject to moderate scrutiny for contributing resources, but strict scrutiny for outstanding resources.

**Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**STAFF DISCUSSION:**

The subject property is a bungalow-style Contributing Resource, which was constructed c. 1892-1916. The property is on a corner lot, with its driveway and garage accessed via Cedar Parkway. The property has experienced some renovations over the years, including fenestration alterations and the removal of a garage dormer.

The applicant’s proposal for a rear addition, window replacement, and garage alterations was previously approved by the Commission at the October 26, 2016 HPC meeting. The current application is for a revision to the previously approved application. Specifically, the applicant proposes to extend the length of the rear addition by 3'-6". The proposed revision is generally consistent with the previous approval and will not detract from the subject property or surrounding streetscape.

After full and fair consideration of the applicant’s submission staff finds the proposal as being consistent with the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-(b) 1 and 2, having found the proposal is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation* and *Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines* outlined above.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends that the Commission approve the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), having found that the proposal is consistent with the *Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines* identified above, and therefore will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the 3 permit sets of drawings, if applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make any alterations to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
APPLICATION FOR HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: derek@thomsoncooke.com
Contact Person: Derek Binsted
Tax Account No.: 00457848
Daytime Phone No.: 202-686-6583

Name of Property Owner: Thomas Dann
Daytime Phone No.: 202-288-6780

Address: 34 W Kirke St
City: Chevy Chase, MD
20815

Contractor: TBD

Contractor Registration No.: Thomson & Cooke Architects
Agent for Owner: TBD

Location of Public Works:
House Number: 34
Street: W Kirke
Town/City: Chevy Chase
Nearest Cross Street: Cedar Parkway
Lot: P7 Block: 32 Subdivision: Chevy Chase Village
Lot: 2 Block: 106 Parcel:

Part One: Type of Permit Application and Use
1A. Check All Applicable:
- [ ] Construct
- [ ] Extend
- [ ] Alter/Renovate
- [ ] Add
- [ ] Install
- [ ] Video/Utilize
- [ ] Repair
- [ ] Rebuild
- [ ] Fence/Wall (complete Section 4)
- [ ] Other:

1B. Construction cost estimate: $ 500,000

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit # 800991

Part Two: Complete for New Construction and Extension Additions
2A. Type of sewage disposal:
- [ ] Septic
- [ ] WSSC
- [ ] Other:

2B. Type of water supply:
- [ ] Septic
- [ ] WSSC
- [ ] Other:

Part Three: Complete Only for Fences/Retaining Wall
3A. Height
- [ ] Feet
- [ ] Inches

18. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
- [ ] On party line/property line
- [ ] Entirely on land of owner
- [ ] On public right of way/assessment

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

[Signature]
[Date]

826611

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE
REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:
      The existing single family home, built between 1892 & 1916, occupies a corner lot in Chevy Chase Village. The masonry structure exhibits identifying features of the Craftsman style: a large front porch supported by sloping brick piers, front and rear gabled dormers, and deep roof overhangs with exposed rafter tails and knee braces. A detached garage constructed in a similar style to the principle structure is present in the rear corner of the lot.

   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:
      The proposed project consists of a complete interior renovation, a two-story rear addition, and renovation of the detached garage. New window and door locations, as well as replacement units are proposed. The existing asphalt shingle roofing is to be replaced with cedar shakes throughout. The proposed addition is an extension of the existing structure and seeks to be compatible with the form and detailing of the historic resource due to the high visibility of this addition on this corner lot. A new dormer is proposed on the garage, as there is evidence an existing one was once removed.

2. SITE PLAN

   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plot. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, pools, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS

   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.
   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resources and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (façades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, contact. All materials and finishes proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each façade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS

   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS

   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each façade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY

   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the drip line of any tree 9" or larger in diameter (at approximately) 4 feet above the ground, you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS

   For ALL projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lot(s) or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT IN BLUE OR BLACK INK OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY UNTO MAILING LABELS.
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT APPLICATION

REVISION TO APPROVED CASE NUMBER 35/13-16GG & BUILDING PERMIT #800901

34 WEST KIRKE STREET
CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815

PROJECT SCOPE:
EXISTING 1 1/2 STORY SINGLE FAMILY HOME WITH BASEMENT & ATTACHED GARAGE. INTERIOR RENOVATION ON ALL LEVELS. NEW WINDOW BAY AT FIRST FLOOR, NEW CHIMNEY, AND 2ND FLOOR ADDITION OVER EXISTING 1ST FLOOR BAY. REBUILT REAR INFILL PORCH AREA OVER NEW EXTENDED FOUNDATION. REBUILD CHASE DOOR AT REAR OF HOUSE. DORMER ADDITION ON GARAGE SECOND LEVEL ROOF.

ZONING DATA:

| BLOCK | 32 |
| LOT NO. | P1. 76B |
| ZONING DISTRICT | R-60 |
| ZONING OVERLAY | NONE |
| HISTORIC AREA | CHEVY CHASE VILLAGE |
| SITE AREA | 11,678 SF |
| LOT COVERAGE | 2,013 SF / 11,678 SF = 17.3% EXIST
| | 2,013 SF / 11,678 SF = 25.8% PROPOSED |

SQUARE FOOTAGE:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>EXISTING:</th>
<th>PROPOSED:</th>
<th>NEW:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Basement Floor Area</td>
<td>2,030 SF</td>
<td>2,143 SF</td>
<td>113 SF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Floor Area</td>
<td>2,242 SF</td>
<td>2,395 SF</td>
<td>153 SF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Floor Area</td>
<td>1,747 SF</td>
<td>1,849 SF</td>
<td>82 SF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Floor Area</td>
<td>6,059 SF</td>
<td>6,407 SF</td>
<td>348 SF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garage 1st Floor</td>
<td>357 SF</td>
<td>357 SF</td>
<td>0 SF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garage 2nd Floor</td>
<td>357 SF</td>
<td>357 SF</td>
<td>0 SF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area of Interior Renovation</td>
<td>4,335 SF</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This revised design reflects an extension of the approved & permitted footprint by 3'-6" to the rear of the house. All previously approved materials, replacement windows, & general form of the approved addition are to remain as approved.

Existing Perspective
1 Existing Front Elevation
1/8" = 1'-0"

2 Proposed Front Elevation
1/8" = 1'-0"
1. Existing Rear Elevation
   1/8" = 1'-0"

2. Proposed Rear Elevation
   1/8" = 1'-0"
1 Existing Front Elevation
1/8" = 1'-0"

3 Garage Right Elevation
1/8" = 1'-0"

2 Proposed Front Elevation
1/8" = 1'-0"

4 Proposed Right Elevation
1/8" = 1'-0"
This door and window configuration are not original to the house. The stone steps were also an addition from the previous owner.

The existing windows at the front of the house under the porch were replaced by the previous owner. The opening was 'glazed' with acrylic sheet and a wood grill was made for the interior of each window. See Sheet A3-4 for replacement window specification.
THE EXISTING WINDOWS PICTURED ARE NOT ORIGINAL TO THE HOUSE AS EVIDENCED BY THE MASONRY INFILL AND REPAIR AS WELL AS THEIR METAL-CLADDED NATURE. FOR SPECIFICATION OF NEW FRENCH DOOR AT THIS LOCATION SEE SHEET A3-7 FOR SPEC.

THE EXISTING DOOR PICTURED WAS ADDED BY THE PREVIOUS OWNER ALONG WITH THE STONE STEPS.
PRODUCT FEATURES

STYLES
- Traditional, Mission®, French Push-Out models, Quarter Round, Full Radius and Camber Top options.

STANDARD FEATURES
- Natural, clear Douglas Fir interior (no visible finger joints)
- 4 9/16" [115 mm] jamb construction
- Low E insulated glazing with 1/2" [13 mm] airspace
- Rate gear operator and concealed sash locks
- Extended aluminum cladding is a variety of standard colors, primed wood/or clear for exterior
- Flexible continuous weatherstrip system
- Insect screen with High Transparency mesh option
- Metal handle, cover, and locks

HARDWARE
- Multiple hardware type and finish choices are available. See the Hardware in section A for more information.

GLAZING
- Heat-Smart® Double, Heat-Smart® Triple, Tranquility® and StormForce®. StormForce® is not available on all products.

SIMULATED DIVIDED LITES [SDL]
- Ogee Profile — 3/4" [19 mm], 1 1/8" [30 mm], 2" [51 mm]
- Putty Profile — 1/4" [14 mm], 3/8" [10 mm], 1 1/6" [20 mm], 2" [51 mm]
- Square Profile (interior only) — 3/4" [19 mm], 7/8" [22 mm], 1 1/8" [30 mm], 1 1/4" [30 mm], 1 1/6" [20 mm]

CASING
- WOOD: 2" [51 mm] Brickmold, 3 1/2" [89 mm] Flat, 3 1/2" [89 mm] Flat, Adams and Williamsburg.
- METAL CLAD: 2" [51 mm] Brickmold, 3 1/2" [89 mm] Flat, Nose & Cove, Adams, Williamsburg and Contemporary.

METAL CLAD COLOR SPECTRUM
- Standard and Architectural Palette colors, including anodized finishes. Available in Olyplow Collection (see section A).

Loewen Wood Casement Window Spec.
Typ. Window Spec.

Exterior Bar Options

Loewen Wood Casement Window Spec.
Typ. Window Spec.

Window Specifications

- 10/24/14
- 11/29/14
- 1/14/17
- 2/11/17
- 1/13/18

Thomson & Cooke
4159 NIKKOHILL PARKWAY NW
Washington, DC 20016
202.826.5950
www.thomsonandcooke.com
PRODUCT FEATURES

STYLES
Traditional, French, Casement, Tok, Quarter Round and Full Radius options.

STANDARD FEATURES
- Natural Douglas Fir interior (see visible finger joints)
- Full Jamb - 4 9/16" (114 mm) construction is an option
- 6 mm Low E insulated tempered glazing
- Multi-point locking hardware, complete with solid brass core handle set, escutcheon and dead bolt
- Extruded aluminum cladding in a variety of standard colors,
  Archwood exterior finish: Interior
  Flexible weatherstrip system

HARDWARE
Multiple hardware type and finish choices are available. See the Hardware in section A for more information.

Loewen Wood French Door Spec.

Typ. Door Spec.
SIGNATURE TRUE SWING SERIES

Custom carriage house and entry doors tailored to your requirements
- Select hardwoods like Clear Spanish Cedar, Genuine Mahogany, or Cherry
- Mahogany
- Factory primed and/or finished to your choice of stains or paint
- Tongue and groove panels beaded, groove, square, or flush, solid panels, or paint finish only panels
- Z-buck/V-buck or V-buck trim boards
- True divided lite windows (square or arched) or solid top styles with insulated or specialty glass
- Decorative hardware for final accent
- Standard or custom sizes

1 Carriage Door
1/2" = 1'-0"
**HAWP APPLICATION: MAILING ADDRESSES FOR NOTIFYING**  
[Owner, Owner's Agent, Adjacent and Confronting Property Owners]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner's mailing address</th>
<th>Owner's Agent's mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>THOMAS DANN</strong></td>
<td><strong>THOMSON &amp; COOK ARCHITECTS</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34 WEST KIRKE STREET</td>
<td>5155 MACARTHUR BLVD NW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815</td>
<td>WASHINGTON, DC 20016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>JOHN LYNHAM</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 WEST KIRKE STREET</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **CHARLES HOBBS**                                        | **JOHN ELLIOT**                  |
| 33 WEST KIRKE STREET                                     | 37 WEST IRVING STREET            |
| CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815                                    | CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815            |

| **CLARE GILLIAM**                                        | **SASAN JACALI**                 |
| 5908 CEDAR PARKWAY                                       | 85 WEST IRVING STREET            |
| CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815                                    | CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815            |