Preliminary Consultation
MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 5710 Surrey St., Chevy Chase  Meeting Date: 6/14/2017
Resource: Primary (Pre-1915) Resource  Report Date: 6/7/2017
          (Somerset Historic District)  Public Notice: 5/31/2017
Applicant: Brian Reilly and Gayle Horn  Tax Credit: N/A
          (Luke Olson, Architect)
Review: Preliminary Consultation  Staff: Michael Kyne
Case Number: N/A

PROPOSAL: Rear addition and garage

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the applicants make any revisions based on the HPC's recommendations and return for a HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Primary (Pre-1915) Resource within the Somerset District
STYLE: Shingle/Craftsman w/ Colonial Revival Addition
DATE: c. 1903 w/ c. 1959-1966 Front/Right Side Addition

PROPOSAL

The applicants are proposing to the following work items at the subject property:

- Remove existing rear sunroom, screened porch, and deck.
- Construct 2 ½-story rear addition.
- Relocate existing garage to be behind proposed rear addition.
- Remove existing chimney from right side of historic house.
- Construct new shed dormer on right side of historic house.
- Siding infill.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Somerset Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), the Somerset Historic District Guidelines (Guidelines), and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(a) The commission shall instruct the director to deny a permit if it finds, based on the evidence and information presented to or before the commission that the alteration for which the permit is
sought would be inappropriate, inconsistent with or detrimental to the preservation, enhancement or ultimate protection of the historic site or historic resource within an historic district, and to the purposes of this chapter.

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or

(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any period or architectural style.

(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

**Somerset Historic District Guidelines**

- The earliest portion of the Town of Somerset was founded in the late 19th Century as a trolley suburb. This area is significant as one of the first trolley suburbs in Montgomery County and is representative of the beginnings of suburbanization.

- Somerset was developed in 1890 by the Somerset Heights Colony Company. This group purchased approximately 50 acres of farmland with the goal of creating a clean, safe, residential community—far enough away from the dangers and dirt of the city, but close enough to commute to work by trolley.

- Five of the original partners of the Somerset Heights Colony Company were associated with the U.S. Department of Agriculture. By 1895, four of these five men had built large homes for
themselves within the new community. Three of these houses are still standing.

- From the beginning, sales were brisk and, by 1910, there were 173 residences in Somerset.

- Of particular interest are a number of houses built by Richard and William Ough between 1900 and 1915. These structures were an early examples of standardization—they exhibit a number of common characteristics: mitred bay corner towers, wrap-around porches, and hipped roofs with a gable peak visible on the front façade.

- Houses which were built in Somerset during its primary period of architectural importance (1890 to 1915) represent a wide variety of Victorian styles: Carpenter Gothic, Queen Anne, and Italianate. In addition, there are some good examples of the Bungalow style. As a group, the early houses in Somerset represent one of the best concentrated collections of Victorian residential architecture in the County.

- Other important features which create and enhance the historic character of the Somerset community include: the spacing and rhythm of buildings, the uniform scale of existing houses, the relationship of houses to the street, the ample size lots and patterns of open space in the neighborhood, the mature trees and landscaping, and the grid system of streets with clearly defined streetscapes. These elements should be retained and preserved as the area continues to grow and develop.

- A map of the boundaries of the boundaries of the Somerset Historic District is included at the end of this amendment. Important contributing resources built before 1915 are noted on this map. The later structures in the district are mainly mid-20th Century architectural styles—many are Colonial Revival—although some very recent houses have replicated the Victorian styles of the original buildings. As specified in the Historic Preservation Ordinance, applications for new construction in the district or for work on structures in the district which are of little historical or design significance shall be judged leniently, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the district.

**Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The Standards are as follows:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of
deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in
design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of
missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials
shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the
gentlest means possible.

8. Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such
resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials
that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be
compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity
of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that
if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its
environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF DISCUSSION

The subject property is a circa 1903 Shingle/Craftsman-style structure within the Somerset Historic
District. There is an existing c. 1959-1966 Colonial Revival-style addition at the front/right side of the
historic house. The applicants propose to remove existing rear structures (sunroom, screened porch, and
deck) and to construct a new 2 ½-story rear addition in their place. Information regarding the age and/or
date of construction of the existing rear structures has not been provided. The existing garage at the
rear/left side of the historic house will be relocated to be behind the historic house.

Staff asks for the Commission’s guidance regarding the following aspects of the applicants’ proposal:

Addition

As noted, no information has been provided regarding the age and/or date of construction of the structures
to be removed; however, given their location, the removal of these structures has minimal potential to
detract from the streetscape. Staff asks for the Commission’s guidance as to whether the removal of these
structures would alter or remove features that characterize the resource.

The proposed 2 ½-story rear addition will be entirely inset behind the historic house and existing
front/right side addition, and it will include a small hyphen on the right side. The ridge of the proposed
rear addition will be tiered, with each tier being lower than the ridge of the historic house. The addition
will include a cross gable on the right side, with a roof pitch to match the cross gable on the right side of
the existing front/right side addition. A brick chimney is also proposed on the right side of the proposed
rear addition. The proposed rear addition materials include Hardie Plank siding, with a reveal to match the
historic house, asphalt shingle roofing, clad wood SDL windows, and a brick foundation.

The proposed rear addition is generally compatible with the subject property and surrounding historic
district, and it is unlikely to detract from any of the important features of the historic district noted in the
Guidelines; however, staff asks the Commission to provide any guidance that may make the proposed
addition more compatible with the historic house.
Garage

The existing one-story, single bay garage is proposed to be relocated behind the proposed rear addition. No information has been provided regarding the age and/or date of construction of the existing garage. In accordance with preservation best practices, historic buildings should generally not be moved from their original location without proper justification; however, the Guidelines note the importance of open space and the rhythm and spacing of buildings in the Somerset Historic District, and moving the garage behind the proposed addition may preserve these features.

Staff asks the Commission to determine if the existing garage is historic and whether it would be appropriate to relocate it.

Other

The applicants propose to remove an existing chimney from the right side of the historic house and to construct a shed dormer in the same approximate location. Staff asks for the Commission’s guidance as to whether the removal of the existing chimney and/or construction of a new shed dormer on a secondary elevation of the historic house has the potential to alter character-defining features of the resource.

Windows in the cross gable of the existing front/right side addition are proposed to be removed and infilled with wooden siding to match the existing.

LAP Comments

The Town of Somerset reviewed the applicants’ proposal at their June 5, 2017 meeting and recommended approval (see Circle 2).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the applicants make any revisions based on the HPC’s recommendations and return for a HAWP application.
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: LOLS5@GMAIL.com
Contact Person: Luke Olson
Daytime Phone No.: 240-333-2021

Tax Account No.:

Contract Purchasers

Name of Property Owner: Brian Ralley & Gailly Horn
Daytime Phone No:

Address:

Server Number:
City:
State:
Zip Code:

Contractor:
T.B.D.

Contractor Registration No.:

Agent for Owner:
Luke Olson
Daytime Phone No.: 240-333-2021

LOCATION OF HISTORICAL PREMISES:

House Number: 5710
Street: Scarsely Street

Town/City: Chevy Chase
Nearest Cross Street: Dobson Ave.
Lot: PIA#3
Block: 4
Subdivision: Somerset

PART ONE - THE GENERAL INFORMATION

18. Check all applicable:

☐ Construct
☐ Expand
☐ Alter/Renovate
☐ W/C
☐ Side
☐ Roof Addition
☐ Porch
☐ Deck
☐ Shed
☐ Move
☐ Install
☐ Wreck/Remove
☐ Solar
☐ Fireplace
☐ Woodburning Stove
☐ Single Family
☐ Revision
☐ Repair
☐ Revocable
☐ Fence/Wall (complete Section 4)
☐ Other:

GARAGE

19. Construction cost estimate: $ ________

10. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit

PART TWO - CONSTRUCTION AND ALTERATION

24. Type of sewage disposal:
01 Septic
02 Other: ______

28. Type of water supply:
01 W/C
02 V/H
03 Other: ______

PART THREE - COMPLETE DETAIL OF FENCE RETAINING WALL

34. Height ______ feet ______ inches

38. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
☐ On party lines/property line
☐ Entirely on land of owner
☐ On public right of way/assessment

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

________________________________________
Signature of owner or authorized agent
Date: 5/24/17

Approved: ____________________
For Chairman, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproved: ____________________
Signature:
Date:

Application/Permit No.:
Date Filed:
Date Issued:

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
5710 SURREY STREET - TOWN OF SOMERSET

PROPOSED SCOPE OF WORK: DEMOLITION OF THE EXISTING REAR SUNROOM, SCREENED PORCH & DECK AND CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW 2-1/2 STORY ADDITION ENTIRELY TO REAR OF EXISTING HISTORIC RESOURCE.

5710 SURREY - PRELIMINARY REVIEW 06/14/2017
Mr. Kyne,

At its meeting on June 5, the Town Council, acting as the Local Advisory Panel to the HPC, recommended the following for 5710 Surrey Street:

- demolish the existing rear sun room, screened porch, and deck
- construct a new 2.5 story addition entirely at the rear of the historic resource
- relocate the garage in the rear yard

Please let the Town of Somerset know if you have any questions.

Thanks,

Rich Charnovich

--
Manager and Clerk-Treasurer
Town of Somerset
4510 Cumberland Avenue
Chevy Chase, Maryland 20815
301-657-3211
301-657-2773 (fax)
manager@townofsomerset.com