Preliminary Consultation
MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 10915 Kenilworth Ave., Garrett Park  
Meeting Date: 2/8/2017

Resource: Non-Contributing Resource  
(Garrett Park Historic District)  
Report Date: 2/1/2017

Applicant: Patrick Keating  
(Luke Olson, Architect)  
Public Notice: 1/25/2017

Review: Preliminary Consultation  
Tax Credit: N/A

Case Number: N/A  
Staff: Michael Kyne

PROPOSAL: Demolition of Non-Contributing resource and construction of new two-story house

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the applicants make any revisions based on the HPC’s recommendations and return for a HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Non-Contributing Resource within the Garrett Park Historic District
DATE: 1964

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to remove the existing c. 1964 two-story house, which is a Non-Contributing resource within the Garrett Park Historic District, and construct a new two-and-a-half-story house in its place.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural; or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter.

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation:

The Secretary of the Interior defines “rehabilitation” as “the act or process of making possible a
compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.”

#2: The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alterations of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

**STAFF DISCUSSION**

The applicant proposes to remove the existing c. 1964 two-story house, which is a Non-Contributing resource within the Garrett Park Historic District, and construct a new two-and-a-half-story house in its place. The footprint of the existing house is approximately 946 sf, while the footprint of the proposed house is 1,650 sf. At this time, the applicant is exploring two different options for the proposed new house—Option 1, which includes a 264 sf garage and 184 sf rear porch, and Option 2, which includes a 448 sf garage. Both options have a total footprint of 2,098 sf.

Staff notes that the proposed rear porch shown in the elevations differs from that shown in the 3D models, with the 3D models depicting a more contemporary porch with flat roof and deck above. Staff has no preference for either porch design, but does prefer Option 1, finding that a one-story porch properly terminates the telescoping effect of the overall design. Staff also prefers the smaller 264 sf garage, finding that, with a rear porch, a larger garage could result in lot crowding.

As noted, the subject property is a Non-Contributing resource within the historic district. The two adjacent properties to the right (10911 and 10913 Kenilworth Avenue) are also c. 1964 Non-Contributing resources, while the adjacent property to the left is a c. 1892 Queen Anne-style Outstanding resource. The properties on the opposite side of Kenilworth Avenue are all outside of the boundaries of the historic district. 10909 Kenilworth Avenue is a c. 1891 Queen Anne-style Outstanding resource, and 10903 (at the intersection of Strathmore Avenue and Kenilworth Avenue) is a c. 1926 one-story, one-bedroom cottage, commonly known as a “Chevy House.”

The house to be removed is roughly rectangular, with its broad side parallel to Kenilworth Avenue, while the front section of the proposed new house is square, with a series of squares telescoping in the rear. The proposed new house includes several projections and bays, with a recessed front porch under a two-and-a-half-story bay with cross gable, which takes cues from the turrets and towers of the Queen Anne-style houses in the historic district.

When reviewing proposals within the Garrett Park Historic District, the Commission is instructed to use the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards Rehabilitation*. The relevant *Standard* in this case is *Standard #2*, as referenced above.

*Standard #2* states that “[t]he historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alterations of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.” In this case, the “property” is the designated resource, or the Garrett Park Historic District. The features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize the historic district include lot coverage, the distance between houses, and the view from house to house.

The proposal will result in approximately double the lot coverage and a house with a different shape and orientation to the street; however, the proposed new house will retain the same approximate front setback, and staff suggests that the proposed design is more compatible with the size and design of neighboring Outstanding resources, such as the Queen Anne-style houses at 10925 and 10909 Kenilworth Avenue.
Staff recommends that the applicant provide a streetscape study, showing the proposed house as it relates to the neighboring Outstanding resources, so that the Commission can reach a fully informed finding regarding the compatibility of scale.

As noted in Places from the Past, “Garrett Park reflects nearly a century of diverse architectural styles.” These diverse styles include the lavish Queen Anne houses, such as those at 10925 and 10909 Kenilworth Avenue, and the modest Chevy Houses, such as that at 10903 Kenilworth Avenue.

The c.1964 house to be removed is a Non-Contributing resource, which does not contribute to the historic character of the streetscape. In accordance with the Standards and preservation best practices, new construction in the Garrett Park Historic District should be compatible with the houses that do contribute to the historic streetscape. Due to the diversity of architectural styles, compatible new construction could take cues from either the modest Chevy Houses or the lavish Queen Anne houses, as in this case.

Staff asks the Commission to provide any guidance that could make the proposed new construction more compatible with the Garrett Park Historic District. Specifically, staff asks the Commission to provide guidance on the following details: the projecting bays on each side elevation, with the appearance of stacked pediments in the gable ends of the main house; the overall design of the projecting bay at the front of the house, which will be its most prominent feature; and the cantilevered bay on the second-floor of the left-side elevation, which will also serve as a canopy for the entrance below. Staff notes that, with its brackets and ornamentation, the cantilevered bay appears inconsistent with the overall design of the house, which is a contemporary and simplified approach to a more traditional form.

Staff asks the Commission to provide guidance regarding the compatibility and preference of Options 1 and 2, noting staff’s discussion above. If the Commission has a preference for the design of the proposed rear porch – either that shown in the elevations, or that shown in the 3D models – staff asks them to voice their preference.

The applicant has stated that the proposed materials include: HardiePlank siding, Azek trim, clad-wood windows, and asphalt shingles. The proposed materials are typical of what the Commission approves for new construction, but staff does ask the Commission to provide any guidance regarding materials that could make the proposal more compatible with the Garrett Park Historic District.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the applicants make any revisions based on the HPC’s recommendations and return for a HAWP application.
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: Jonson@stnarchitects.com  Contact Phone: Luke Olson

Daytime Phone No.: 400-333-2021

Tax Account No.: ____________________________

Name of Property Owner: PATRICK KEATING  Daytime Phone No.: 301-949-1706

Address: PO BOX 61 GARRETT PARK MD 20896

Contractor: T.B.D.  Phone No.: ____________________________

Contractor Registration No.: ____________________________

Agent for Owner: LUKE Olson / COM ARCHITECTS  Daytime Phone No.: 400-333-2021

LOCATION OF BUILDING PROJECT:

House Number: 10915  Street: KENELWORTH AVE

Town/City: GARRETT PARK  Nearest Cross Street: STRANDPLAGE AVE

Lot: ____________________________  Block: ____________________________  Subdivision: ____________________________

Floor: ____________________________  Parcel: ____________________________

PART ONE: TYPE OF PERMIT ACTION AND USE

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:

☐ Construct  ☐ Alter/Renovate  ☐ Single Family
☐ Move  ☐ Install  ☐ Single Family
☐ Revision  ☐ Repair  ☐ Single Family

1B. Construction cost estimate: $700,000

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit # ____________________________

PART TWO: COMPLETE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION AND EXTRAS/ADDITIONS

2A. Type of sewage disposal: 01 Sewer 02 Septic 03 Other: ____________________________

2B. Type of water supply: 01 Sewer 02 Septic 03 Other: ____________________________

PART THREE: COMPLETE ONLY FOR FENCE/RETAINING WALL

3A. Height: ____________________________ feet  ____________________________ inches

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:

☐ On property line/property line  ☐ Entirely on land of owner  ☐ On public right of way/ easement

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

__________________________
Signature of owner or authorized agent

01-18-17

Date

Approved: ____________________________  For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproved: ____________________________  Signature: ____________________________  Date: ____________________________

Application/Permit No.: ____________________________  Date Filed: ____________________________  Date Issued: ____________________________

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE
REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACcompany THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:

   DEMO EXISTING NON-CONTRIBUTIVE STRUCTURE & CONSTRUCT
   NEW 2-STORY SINGLE FAMILY HOME AND DETACHED
   GARAGE WITH A TOTAL FOOTPRINT OF 4,207 SF.

   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:

   SEE ABOVE

2. SITE PLAN
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plot. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred:
   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resource(s) and the proposed work;
   b. Elevations (façades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context. All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each façade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIAL SPECIFICATIONS
   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each façade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs;
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the dripline of any tree 5" or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that diameter.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS
   For all projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which abut the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lot(s) or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT IN BLUE OR BLACK INK OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.
FIRST FLOOR PLAN
OPTION #1
1,600 SF (includes front porch)

FIRST FLOOR PLAN
OPTION #2
1,650 SF (includes front porch)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner's mailing address</th>
<th>Owner's Agent's mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PAT KEATING</td>
<td>LUXE CLEW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Po Box 61</td>
<td>GTM ARCHITECTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GARRETT PARK, MD 20896</td>
<td>7755 OLD GEORGETOWN RD 1000 BETHESDA, MD 20814</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hazel Chapman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Po Box 85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GARRETT PARK, MD 20896</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Michael Casassa                                              | Cameron & Kelly Oslavik                                    |
| 10914 Kenilworth Ave                                         | 10908 Kenilworth Ave                                      |
| GARRETT PARK, MD 20896                                       | GARRETT PARK, MD 20896                                   |

| Patrick & Jessica Jordan                                      | Michelle Lipsan & John Poisson                            |
| 10913 Kenilworth Ave                                         | Po Box 255                                                |
| GARRETT PARK, MD 20896                                       | GARRETT PARK, MD 20896                                   |

| Barbara Jackson & William Riester                           |                                                        |
| Po Box 378                                                   |                                                        |
| GARRETT PARK, MD 20896                                       |                                                        |