Preliminary Consultation

MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 5813 Surrey St., Chevy Chase  
Meeting Date: 9/19/2017

Resource: Secondary (Post-1915) Resource  
(Somerset Historic District)  
Report Date: 9/12/2017

Applicant: Paul Lewis  
(Tahani Share, Architect)  
Public Notice: 9/5/2017

Review: Preliminary Consultation  
Tax Credit: N/A

Staff: Michael Kyne

Case Number: N/A

PROPOSAL: Side and rear additions and hardscape alterations

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the applicant make any revisions based on the HPC’s recommendations and return for a second preliminary consultation.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Secondary (Post-1915) Resource within the Somerset Historic District
STYLE: Colonial Revival
DATE: c. 1933

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes the following work items at the subject property:

- Enlarge an existing one-story addition and below grade garage at the right side of the subject property.
- Construct a second-story expansion over the enlarged right-side addition and garage.
- Construct a second-story expansion over the leftmost side of an existing one-story rear addition.
- Enlarge the existing driveway at the front of the subject property.
- Construct a new central walkway/steps at the front of the subject property.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Somerset Historic District several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.
Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(a) The commission shall instruct the director to deny a permit if it finds, based on the evidence and information presented to or before the commission that the alteration for which the permit is sought would be inappropriate, inconsistent with or detrimental to the preservation, enhancement or ultimate protection of the historic site or historic resource within an historic district, and to the purposes of this chapter.

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or

(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.

(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

8. Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**STAFF DISCUSSION**

The subject property is a circa 1933 Colonial Revival-style Secondary Resource within the Somerset Historic District. The house is located on a corner lot, with its front facing Surrey Street and its left side facing Cumberland Avenue. There is a driveway at the front/right side of the house, which leads to a below grade single-car garage under an existing one-story sunroom addition. There is an L-shaped walkway that leads from Cumberland Avenue to the front entrance of the house. The rear of the house is less than 20' from the rear property line, while the right side of the house is more than 67' from the right-side property line.

The applicant proposes the following work items at the subject property:

- Enlarge an existing one-story addition and below grade garage at the right side of the subject property.
- Construct a second-story expansion over the enlarged right-side addition and garage.
- Construct a second-story expansion over the leftmost side of an existing one-story rear addition.
- Enlarge the existing driveway at the front/right side of the subject property.
- Construct a new central walkway/steps at the front of the subject property.

Staff expresses the following concerns about the applicant’s proposal and seeks the Commission’s guidance:
Right Side Addition/Expansion

The Commission typically requires additions to be at the rear, which is in accordance with preservation best practices. Due to the house's orientation and the County's setback requirements, the applicant is limited in their ability to construct additional living space at the rear. Because of this, the applicant proposes to enlarge and expand an existing one-story sunroom addition at the right side of the house. The proposal will result in a two-and-a-half story right-side addition.

The existing one-story right-side sunroom addition is compatible with the historic house and is a typical feature found on Colonial Revival-style houses throughout the County. The proposed two-and-a-half story right-side addition will significantly alter the perceived massing of the subject property and has the potential to detract from and overwhelm the historic house.

The applicant proposes a series of gables and a low-pitched first-story shed roof to break up the perceived massing of the right-side addition and to provide differentiation from the historic house; however, staff finds that the shape and form of the proposed right-side addition is too complex and incompatible with the simple symmetrical features and straight lines of the historic house.

Staff suggests that the applicant explore alternatives for the proposed right-side addition, which may be more compatible with the historic house and reduce the perceived massing. Some alternatives might include:

- Widening the proposed second-story rear addition/extension, creating some additional living space at the rear and allowing the size of the proposed right-side addition to be reduced.
- A right-side addition with a lower flat roof and more fenestration, taking cues from the existing sunroom addition.
- Constructing a detached garage, allowing below grade living space to be created in the location of the existing garage and for the overall height of the proposed right-side addition to be lowered. This option would require an additional curb cut and may present zoning issues, as a detached garage on this lot would likely have to be in the side yard and forward of the rear plane of the house.

Hardscaping

The applicant proposes to widen the existing driveway at the front of the subject property, going from 8'-4" to 20' wide. In addition, the applicant proposes to construct a new central walkway/steps from Surrey Street, connecting to the existing L-shaped walkway from Cumberland Avenue.

Typically, the Commission strives to preserve open space and reduce the amount of hardscaping, particularly at the front of a property. In this case, the Commission may find that the unique circumstances—specifically, the house's orientation and the rather large open space at the right side of the house—allow for a more lenient review of the proposed hardscaping alterations.

Materials

To date, no material specifications have been provided, although the submitted elevations suggest that the proposed right-side addition will have wood siding or similar. Wood shingles or similar are depicted in the gables, taking cues from an existing rear dormer. Due to the high degree of visibility of the proposed right-side addition, it is important that the proposed materials be compatible with, yet clearly differentiated from, the historic house. Staff asks for the Commission's guidance regarding appropriate
and compatible materials, with particular attention to the proposed right-side addition.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the applicant make any revisions based on the HPC’s recommendations and return for a second preliminary consultation.
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
301/563-3400
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: tahani@landisconstruction.com  Contact Person: Tahani Share/Chris Landis
chris@landisconstruction.com  Daytime Phone No.: 202-370-3410

Tax Account No.: __________________________________________

Name of Property Owner: Dan & Aviva Rosenthal  Daytime Phone No.: __________________________

Address: _____________________________________________________
Street Number: __________________________  City: __________________________  State: __________________________
Zip Code: __________________________

Contractor: Landis Architects/ Builders  Phone No.: __________________________

Contractor Registration No.: _______________________________________

Agent for Owner: Chris Landis  Daytime Phone No.: 202-489-1516

LOCATION OF BUILDING PREMISE
House Number: 5813  Street: Surrey St.

Town/City: Chevy Chase  Nearest Cross Street: Surrey St. & Cumberland Ave.
Lot: 13  Block: B-3  Subdivision: __________________________
Lot: __________________________  Block: __________________________  Parcel: __________________________

PART ONE: TYPE OF PERMIT/ACTIVITY AND USE

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:
☐ Construct  ☐ Extend  ☐ Alter/Renovate  ☐ A/C  ☐ Stab  ☐ Room Addition  ☐ Porch  ☐ Deck  ☐ Shed
☐ Move  ☐ Install  ☐ Wreck/Raze  ☐ Solar  ☐ Fireplace  ☐ Woodburning Stove  ☐ Single Family
☐ Revision  ☐ Repair  ☐ Revocable  ☐ Fence/Wall (complete Section 4)  ☐ Other: __________________________

1B. Construction cost estimate: $ __________________________ 1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit # __________________________

PART TWO: COMPLETE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION AND EXTENSIONS/ADDITIONS

2A. Type of sewage disposal: 01 ☐ WSSC 02 ☐ Septic 03 ☐ Other: __________________________

2B. Type of water supply: 01 ☐ WSSC 02 ☐ Well 03 ☐ Other: __________________________

PART THREE: COMPLETE ONLY FOR FENCE/RETAINING WALL

3A. Height 4 feet 0 inches

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
☐ On party line/property line  ☐ Entirely on land of owner  ☐ In public right of way/ easement

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Tahani Share  __________________________
Signature of owner or authorized agent  9/7/17  Date

Approved: __________________________  For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission
Disapproved: __________________________  Signature: __________________________
Date: __________________________
Application/Permit No.: __________________________  Date Filed: __________________________  Date Issued: __________________________

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:
   The existing house on 5813 Surney St was built in 1937. It sits on a corner lot with an area of 11,900 SF. It's comprised of 2 1/2 brick stories. The plan is a typical colonial house with stair in the center. The house has an existing non-historic one story addition built on a garage at the basement level. The house has two front setbacks (24F & 31°F) a side setback (19F) and a rear setback (67F).

b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resource(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:
The proposed addition includes a 2nd story addition over the exact footprint of the existing one story and an extension of 6F into the rear yard to enlarge the 1st floor and the existing 2F-wide garage. The proposed work also include 2nd floor addition at the rear, enlarge the existing driveway and add steps the front of the house.

2. SITE PLAN
Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plat. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.
   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resources and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (facades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context. All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS
General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY
If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the dripline of any tree 5" or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS
   For ALL projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lot(s) or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/secondary from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT (IN BLUE OR BLACK INK) OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.
ROSENTHAL RESIDENCE
5813 Surrey Street  Chevy Chase, MD
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Owner's mailing address</strong></th>
<th><strong>Owner's Agent's mailing address</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aviva and Dan Rosenthal</td>
<td>Landis Architects/ Builders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5813 Surrey St.</td>
<td>7059 Blair Road, NW #300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD</td>
<td>Washington, DC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>James Regan &amp; Sandra Riley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5809 Surrey St.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>