

**MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**  
**STAFF REPORT**

<b>Address:</b>	15215 Barnesville Rd., Boyds	<b>Meeting Date:</b>	3/8/2017
<b>Resource:</b>	Primary Resource Boyds Historic District	<b>Report Date:</b>	3/1/2017
<b>Applicant:</b>	Montgomery Department of Parks (Julie Mueller, Agent)	<b>Public Notice:</b>	2/22/2017
<b>Review:</b>	HAWP	<b>Tax Credit:</b>	N/A
<b>Case Number:</b>	18/8-17B	<b>Staff:</b>	Michael Kyne

**PROPOSAL:** Demolition of non-historic accessory structures and other alterations

---

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the HPC **approve** the HAWP application.

**ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION**

**SIGNIFICANCE:** Primary Resource within the Boyds Historic District  
**STYLE:** Gothic Revival  
**DATE:** c. 1866

**PROPOSAL**

The applicant proposes the following work items at the subject property:

- Remove four (4) non-historic outbuildings.
- Remove a non-historic swimming pool.
- Remove a non-historic timber wall.

**APPLICABLE GUIDELINES**

When reviewing proposals for alterations and new construction within the Boyds Historic District, several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include *Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A)*, and *the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards)*. The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

***Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8***

- (a) The commission shall instruct the director to deny a permit if it finds, based on the evidence and information presented to or before the commission that the alteration for which the permit is sought would be inappropriate, inconsistent with or detrimental to the preservation, enhancement or ultimate protection of the historic site or historic resource within an historic district, and to the purposes of this chapter.

- (b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:
- (1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or
  - (2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or
  - (3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or
  - (4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or
  - (5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or
  - (6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.
- (c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.
- (d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

#### *Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The *Standards* are as follows:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## **STAFF DISCUSSION**

### *Outbuildings*

The four (4) outbuildings to be removed include two sheds, a gambrel roof barn, and a truck shelter, all of which are attached to a c. 1958 garage (the truck shelter being attached to the left side and all others being attached to the rear). According to the applicant, the outbuildings to be removed are non-historic, with only the garage appearing in historic photographs.

While the outbuildings to be removed are consistent with the rural characteristics of the Boyds Historic District, they do not contribute to the Gothic Revival-style historic house. Staff finds that, in accordance with the *Standards*, the outbuildings can be removed without altering the features and spaces that characterize the resource. Because the majority of outbuildings to be removed are attached at the rear of the garage, the overall visual impact to the subject property from the public right-of-way will likely be minimal.

### *Swimming Pool*

The swimming pool to be removed is non-historic, at grade, and at the rear of the property. The swimming pool does not contribute to the historic character of the property and is inconsistent with the rural characteristics of the Boyds Historic District. In accordance with the *Standards*, the swimming pool can be removed without altering the features and spaces that characterize the resource. Staff suggests that the removal of the non-historic, historically incompatible swimming pool will enhance the preservation of the subject property and surrounding historic district.

### *Timber Wall*

The timber wall to be removed is non-historic and at the rear/right side of the subject property. Although the timber wall appears to be at least 3' tall, it is not a visually prominent feature of the subject property, due to its location and the depth of the lot. Overall, the timber wall is consistent with the rural characteristics of the Boyds Historic District and the subject property, but, because the wall is non-historic, it can be removed without altering the features and spaces that characterize the resource, in accordance with the *Standards*.

After full and fair consideration of the applicant's submission staff finds the proposal as being consistent with the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-(b) 1 and 2, having found the proposal is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation outlined above.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Commission **approve** the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), having found that the proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the **3 permit sets of drawings, if applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping** prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff's discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make **any alterations** to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will contact the staff person assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
301/563-3400

DPS - #8

# APPLICATION FOR HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: Julie.Mueller@montgomeryparks.org Contact Person: Julie Mueller  
Tax Account No.: \_\_\_\_\_ Daytime Phone No.: 301-650-4890  
Name of Property Owner: MNCPPC Daytime Phone No.: \_\_\_\_\_  
Address: 9500 Brunnet Ave Silver Spring 20901  
Street Number City State Zip Code  
Contractor: Dept. of Parks Phone No.: \_\_\_\_\_  
Contractor Registration No.: \_\_\_\_\_  
Agent for Owner: \_\_\_\_\_ Daytime Phone No.: \_\_\_\_\_

## LOCATION OF BUILDING/PREMISE

House Number: 15215 Street: Barnesville Rd.  
Town/City: Boyd's Nearest Cross Street: Rt. 121  
Lot: \_\_\_\_\_ Block: \_\_\_\_\_ Subdivision: \_\_\_\_\_  
Liber: \_\_\_\_\_ Folio: \_\_\_\_\_ Parcel: P919

## PART ONE: TYPE OF PERMIT ACTION AND USE

### 1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:

☐ Construct ☐ Extend ☐ Alter/Renovate  
☐ Move ☐ Install ☒ Wreck/Raze  
☐ Revision ☐ Repair ☐ Revocable

### CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:

☐ A/C ☐ Slab ☐ Room Addition ☐ Porch ☐ Deck ☒ Shed  
☐ Solar ☐ Fireplace ☐ Woodburning Stove ☐ Single Family  
☐ Fence/Wall (complete Section 4) ☐ Other: \_\_\_\_\_

1B. Construction cost estimate: \$ TBD

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit # \_\_\_\_\_

## PART TWO: COMPLETE FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION AND EXTEND/ADDITIONS

2A. Type of sewage disposal: 01 ☐ WSSC 02 ☐ Septic 03 ☐ Other: \_\_\_\_\_  
2B. Type of water supply: 01 ☐ WSSC 02 ☐ Well 03 ☐ Other: \_\_\_\_\_

## PART THREE: COMPLETE ONLY FOR FENCE/RETAINING WALL

3A. Height \_\_\_\_\_ feet \_\_\_\_\_ inches

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:

☐ On party line/property line ☐ Entirely on land of owner ☐ On public right of way/easement

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Julie Mueller  
Signature of owner or authorized agent

2/7/17  
Date

Approved: \_\_\_\_\_ For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission

Disapproved: \_\_\_\_\_ Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Application/Permit No.: \_\_\_\_\_ Date Filed: \_\_\_\_\_ Date Issued: \_\_\_\_\_

Edit 6/21/99

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS

789725

(5)

## 1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT:

a. *Description of existing structural and environmental setting, including historic features and significance.* The Boyd-Maughlin House, located at 15215 Barnesville Road, is listed as a primary resource in the Boyd's Historic District (18/8-1). The district is comprised mostly of frame, vernacular Gothic Revival commercial and residential structures initially erected to house laborers laying the Metropolitan line of the B&O. The Boyd-Maughlin house, constructed in 1866 by David Maughlin, is among the eldest and predates the 1873 establishment of the village.

The house sits on a 2.0 -acre parcel surrounded by parkland on a gentle rise overlooking Barnesville Road. The only historic structure on the site is the house. The site is leased for residential use.

b. *General description of project and its effect on the historic resources and environmental setting.*

The project seeks to rehabilitate the buildings and grounds.

### Buildings:

1. The historically contributing house (Photo 1) will be repainted to match historic colors revealed during a historic paint analysis conducted in 2016. No other exterior alterations are proposed.
2. The non-contributing garage/outbuilding appears to have been built in five phases. Historic aerial photographs indicate that the one-story, cinderblock vehicular garage (Photo 2) was the first component, built circa 1958. Behind the garage, connected on its north elevation, is a small one-story, board-and-batten shed which appears to be the second phase of construction (Photo 3). Also attached to the garage is a frame, gambrel roof barn (Phase 3; Photos 4-5). It has been altered over time by the insertion of large rectangular windows on its south elevation. The partially enclosed, frame run-in shed to the east of the barn addition is the 4<sup>th</sup> addition. Elevations that had once been open, are now sided with wide planks and corrugated plastic (Photos 6-7). Phases 2-4 appear to have been partially constructed from salvaged materials. The 5<sup>th</sup> and final construction phase was the erection of a tall, aluminum-sided truck shelter attached to the cinderblock garage (Photos 1 and 8). It extends along the garage's north elevation and over the board-and-batten addition.

The project seeks to retain the cinderblock garage, and demolish the other four phases of construction. The additions are in poor condition and do not contribute to the historic significance of the site.

### Site: Site work will include the following:

1. Remove non-historic swimming pool behind house. Fill with soil and grass to match existing yard (Photo 9)
2. Remove non-historic timber wall (Photo 10). Fill, grade and seed to match existing yard.

The project will not have an Adverse Effect on the historic integrity of the contributing resource or the historic district.

2. **SITE PLAN:** see attached

3. **PLANS AND ELEVATIONS:** N/A

4. **MATERIAL SPECIFICATIONS:** N/A

5. **PHOTOGRAPHS:** see attached

6. **TREE SURVEY:** N/A

**7. ADDRESS OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS**

Adjacent: the adjacent, separate legal parcels are owned by MNCPPC. There are no adjacent private property owners.

Confronting:

- 15203 Barnesville Road (US Post Office
- 15189 Barnesville Road (private residence).





Site Plan





Photo 1: Boyd-Maughlin House



Photo 2: Garage with Truck Shed Addition





Photo 3: 1<sup>st</sup> Addition (board and batten section to rear of cinderblock garage (on right))



Photo 4: 2<sup>nd</sup> Addition (to right of cinderblock garage)





Photo 5: 2<sup>nd</sup> Addition (cinderblock garage on left)



Photo 6: 3<sup>rd</sup> Addition (Run-in Shed on right)





Photo 7: 3<sup>rd</sup> Addition, Run-In Shed Rear



Photo 8: Truck Shed





Photo 9: Pool



Photo 10: Timber wall