MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 2 Magnolia Ave., Chevy Chase Village

Meeting Date: 03/22/17

Resource: Non-Contributing

Report Date: 03/15/17

Chevy Chase Village Historic District

Applicant: Burt Braverman

Public Notice: 03/08/17

Review: HAWP

Tax Credit: Yes

Case Number: 37/13-17G

Staff: Dan Bruechert

Proposal: Roof Repair and Skylight Replacement

STAFF RECOMMENDATION
Staff recommends that the HPC approve the HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION
SIGNIFICANCE: Non-Contributing Resource to the Chevy Chase Village Historic District
STYLE: Victorian Revival
DATE: c.1892-1916 w/ 1993 alterations/enlargement

The subject property is a two-story, shingle-sided, front-gable house with side gable additions. The historic, central, massing of the house is three bays wide with a one-story, shed-roofed porch and wood casement windows. The modern additions to the house extend to the southeast, away from the street, are decorated using Arts and Crafts and Victorian elements. The southernmost addition is one story with a flat roof and skylights to provide natural light to the spaces below.

PROPOSAL:
The applicant is proposing to replace portions of the non-historic built-up flat roof with TPO rolled-type roofing and to remove four skylights and cover them with new roofing.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES
When reviewing alterations and additions for new construction to Non-Contributing Resources within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District, decisions are guided by the Chevy Chase Village Historic District Design Guidelines (Design Guidelines) and Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A).

Chevy Chase Village Historic District Design Guidelines
Non-Contributing or Out-of-Period Resources:
Non-contributing/out-of-period resources are either buildings that are of little or no architectural and historical significance to the historic district or newer buildings constructed outside the
district's primary period of historic importance. HAWP applications for exterior alterations, changes, and/or additions to these types of resources should receive the most lenient level of design review.

Most alterations and additions to non-contributing/out-of-period resource should be approved as a matter of course. The only exceptions would be major additions and alterations to the scale and massing of the structure, which affect the surrounding streetscape and/or landscape and could impair the character of the historic district as a whole.

The design review emphasis will be restricted to changes that are at all visible from the public right-of-way, irrespective of landscaping or vegetation (it is expected that the majority of new additions will be reviewed for their impact on the overall district), and,

The importance of assuring that additions and other changes to existing structures act to reinforce and continue existing streetscape, landscape, and building patterns rather than to impair the character of the district.

Alterations to features that are not visible from the public right-of-way should be allowed as a matter of course

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8(b)
A HAWP permit should be issued if the Commission finds that:

1. The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of a historic site or historic resource within a historic district.
2. The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical archaeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which a historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto of to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter.

STAFF DISCUSSION
The proposed work to the subject property will be undertaken on the 1993 addition. This work will only be visible from the inside the house and is exclusive to the new construction. Additionally, this work will not be visible from the surrounding district and will not impact the massing or scale of the building and as identified in the Design Guidelines should be approved as a matter of course.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION
Staff recommends the HPC approve the HAWP application;

and with the general condition applicable to all Historic Area Work Permits that the applicant will present 3 permit sets of drawings to HPC staff for review and stamping prior to submission for permits (if applicable). After issuance of the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) permit, the applicant will arrange for a field inspection by calling the DPS Field Services Office at 240-777-6370 prior to commencement of work and not more than two weeks following completion of work.
APPENDIX A: INFORMATION REQUIRED FOR CONSTRUCTION PERMIT APPLICATION

1. Name of Owner: [Name]
2. Address: [Address]
3. Phone Number: [Phone]
4. Date: [Date]
5. Description of Work: [Description of Work]
6. Applicable Codes: [Codes]
7. Contact Information: [Contact]
8. Certification: [Certification]
9. Signature: [Signature]
10. Approvals: [Approvals]

This application is subject to review by the appropriate agency and must be submitted with all required information and approvals. It is a condition of the issuance of this permit.
THE FOLLOWING ITEMS MUST BE COMPLETED AND THE REQUIRED DOCUMENTS MUST ACCOMPANY THIS APPLICATION.

1. WRITTEN DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT
   a. Description of existing structure(s) and environmental setting, including their historical features and significance:

      SEE ATTACHMENT # 1A.1
      # 1A.2

   b. General description of project and its effect on the historic resources(s), the environmental setting, and, where applicable, the historic district:

      SEE ATTACHMENT # 1B

2. SITE PLAN  SEE # 2 ATTACHMENT
   Site and environmental setting, drawn to scale. You may use your plat. Your site plan must include:
   a. the scale, north arrow, and date;
   b. dimensions of all existing and proposed structures; and
   c. site features such as walkways, driveways, fences, ponds, streams, trash dumpsters, mechanical equipment, and landscaping.

3. PLANS AND ELEVATIONS  NA
   You must submit 2 copies of plans and elevations in a format no larger than 11" x 17". Plans on 8 1/2" x 11" paper are preferred.
   a. Schematic construction plans, with marked dimensions, indicating location, size and general type of walls, window and door openings, and other fixed features of both the existing resource(s) and the proposed work.
   b. Elevations (facades), with marked dimensions, clearly indicating proposed work in relation to existing construction and, when appropriate, context. All materials and fixtures proposed for the exterior must be noted on the elevations drawings. An existing and a proposed elevation drawing of each facade affected by the proposed work is required.

4. MATERIALS SPECIFICATIONS  SEE ROOF PROPOSAL
   General description of materials and manufactured items proposed for incorporation in the work of the project. This information may be included on your design drawings.

5. PHOTOGRAPHS
   a. Clearly labeled photographic prints of each facade of existing resource, including details of the affected portions. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.
   b. Clearly label photographic prints of the resource as viewed from the public right-of-way and of the adjoining properties. All labels should be placed on the front of photographs.

6. TREE SURVEY  NA
   If you are proposing construction adjacent to or within the dripline of any tree 6" or larger in diameter (at approximately 4 feet above the ground), you must file an accurate tree survey identifying the size, location, and species of each tree of at least that dimension.

7. ADDRESSES OF ADJACENT AND CONFRONTING PROPERTY OWNERS  SEE # 7 ATTACHMENT
   For ALL projects, provide an accurate list of adjacent and confronting property owners (not tenants), including names, addresses, and zip codes. This list should include the owners of all lots or parcels which adjoin the parcel in question, as well as the owner(s) of lot(s) or parcel(s) which lie directly across the street/highway from the parcel in question.

PLEASE PRINT (IN BLUE OR BLACK INK) OR TYPE THIS INFORMATION ON THE FOLLOWING PAGE.
PLEASE STAY WITHIN THE GUIDES OF THE TEMPLATE, AS THIS WILL BE PHOTOCOPIED DIRECTLY ONTO MAILING LABELS.

BRAYERMAN
Physical Description of Property

This house is located within a registered historic district. This Arts & Crafts style shingle house is a multi-gabled-roofed 2-storey structure with a 3rd floor attic that was converted into a bedroom suite. The house was constructed around 1910, according to county records. The original house underwent substantial renovation/additions in 1993. The original house still can be seen as the center structure with a new living room to the left that features a brick chimney, 2 double French doors facing the street and a bay with large true-divided-lite casement windows, and a new garage to the right side of the house with an octagonal office tower above it featuring multi-level true-divided-lite casement windows.

To the rear of the house was added a billiard room featuring French doors and more of the same type of windows described above, all with transoms above. Also added to the rear is a sunroom surrounding an Endless Pool—an exercise swimming machine.

The original living room survives as the entrance foyer and retains its original wood coffered ceiling and fireplace and pine floors. The original kitchen was enlarged to become the dining room that features a new, raised fireplace. A small bedroom was expanded to become the new modern kitchen. The new ceiling in the din/kitch continues the original from the foyer (the original living room). The second floor has 3 bedrooms and 2 baths and retains the original pine floors and a bay window was added to the front of the house. A closet and bath were added to convert third floor attic into a private bedroom suite. This room features the original beams that were exposed when the ceiling was raised.

There is a very attractive Victorian-like metal fence at the top of the living room chimney that is visible from the street.

Also added to the rear (in 1993) is a flagstone terrace w/ pergola & 5 sections of lattice.
# 1a 2

Statement of Significance

We believe this house contributes to the overall flavor of the neighborhood. Although the physical presence of the house is larger than the original, the new parts are compatible with the old and the entire street presence of this house enhances the beauty and old-world charm of Chevy Chase Village. Being located a tone of the major gateways into the village, this house is representative of the architecture that prevails throughout Chevy Chase Village.

The front door is the original and the side-lites are the same design and size of the originals. Although the front porch was enlarged, the new brackets were designed to imitate the original ones that were moved to the terrace to a more prominent position. The original handrails remain on the front porch.

All original pine floors were left in tact and matching antique pine floor boards were acquired to patch into certain areas.

The original living room was left in tact, but now is used as the entrance foyer. Its original coffered ceiling was stripped and stained to return it to its original appearance. The original fireplace, hearth and ornamental eagle emblem above the mantel remain in original condition.

All original lighting fixtures were re-wired, stripped of paint and polished and then reused. All additional interior and exterior lighting purchased is antique, period lighting. There are NO recessed lights in this house. [An aside: there are 2 stained glass hanging fixtures hand made by Edwin Morse, who was the nephew (we think nephew) of Samuel Morse.]

All heat registers have antique decorative grills.

The French doors that led to the original (screen porch) (to the left of the house was replaced by the current new living room) were moved to the attic bedroom suite. (All exterior glass needed to be double-paned.)

All original door hardware was removed, restored and reused on natural wood panel doors similar to the originals that had been painted many times over the years.

The new ceiling in the kitchen and dining room were coffered to match the original ceiling in the foyer (former living room) which was retained.

The original bath tub was re-porcelained for the guest bath and pedestal sinks (antique reproductions) were used in the guest bath and powder room.
Scope of Work:

Re-roof all flat roofs

On the rear of our house (South facing), and on the West side of our house are two flat roofs that have developed leaks that are allowing water to enter the house in several places. The walls in the laundry room are stained from water leaking in from the flat roof on the West side of the house. The larger flat roof at the rear/South face of the house leaks into the pool – there are stains on the white trim boards of the pool room, and also there are leaks on the kitchen window & around the through-the-roof drain on the East wall of the covered terrace. Water is ponding on the large roof. Pls refer to the attached photos.

The original roofing material is referred to as a “built-up” roof, onto which small white gravel was added as a sun reflector. This type of roof covering is not available to us, and would be both a fire hazard and a safety concern according to our roofing contractor.

They will remove all of this gravel and tar, down to the plywood sheathing, and then apply a rolled type of roofing: TPO which is solid white to reflect the sunlight. There is no need for the gravel on the new roof material.

Removal and elimination of the 4-pod skylight

For 23 years, I have patched the skylight over the pool with silicone on smaller cracks, and silicone plus duct tape on the larger breaks, and it is time to replace it. As you can see from the attached photos, it is a horrible eyesore. My neighbor has an enormous walnut tree in her back yard that has dropped walnuts and branches onto our roof and onto the skylight for the past 23 years. The solid walnuts are like missiles when tossed by high winds, and there is no way for us to prevent this from happening. Two years ago, at great expense to us, (and with our neighbor’s permission), we had a very large limb removed to eliminate the fear of the entire branch from this ancient tree falling onto the house and causing great damage. It is not possible to replace this skylight with an exact replica. After many years of consultations with roofers and skylight manufacturers, we have concluded that our only choice is to remove the skylight permanently and cover the opening with a solid flat roof that will match the new roof on the flat roof deck surrounding the skylight.

Our carpenter plans to remove the four skylight pods, and then build a solid deck over the opening with 3/4 inch plywood with a slight slope for drainage onto the surrounding flat roof deck. The roofing contractor will then be able to run the new roll of TPO roofing material continuously up and over the raised area where the skylight currently resides. There is about a 4 inch raised curb surrounding the skylight opening onto which the skylight frame was installed. The curb will remain. Therefore, the new proposed flat roof over the current skylight opening will be about 5 inches higher than the surrounding roof deck, but lower than the current skylight height.
The flat roofs and the skylight were new construction when the house was renovated in 1991 (all renovations were completed before Chevy Chase Village became a historic district); these are not historic features.

None of this area is visible from the street in front of our house: Magnolia Parkway. And since it is lower than the current height of the skylight, it will not be visible from the views of the neighbors’ houses as it will be behind the small 4 – 5” parapet wall or curb that surrounds the entire roof, and it will blend into the appearance of the entire roof.
TO: Kathleen Meredith  
2 Magnolia Pkwy  
Chevy Chase MD 20815

HOME
WORK
CELL 202-368-7169

We hereby submit Specifications and Estimate for:

1. Remove existing 4 rear and side flat roofs down to wood deck, replace any bad wood at additional cost to owner of $2.75 per lin ft.
2. Furnish and install a 1" layer of ISO insulation to cover entire roof deck using screws and plates to secure to roof.
3. Furnish and install a mechanically attached GAF.060 TPO, secure to insulation.
4. Furnish and install all flashing and counter flashings to provide a water tight roofing system, heat welded and fused together.
5. Furnish and install a 12" TPO base flashing, heat welded along parapet walls.
6. Furnish and install a TPO drip edge primed, heat welded and integrated into roofing system.
7. Clean up and remove all debris from job.

Warranty 20 years limited liability by GAF and 12 years on labor by Harry & Sons.

EXTRAS INCLUDED IN THE PRICE OF THE JOB
1. Replace the 3 through wall scupper drains with new 4"X6" scupper drains using 24 gauge galvanized steel.
2. Furnish and install new wall coping over parapet walls using .032 baked white aluminum.
3. Replace both built in drains with new PVC drains.
4. Furnish and install 1/4" tapers in drain field using poly ISO insulation.
5. Remove gutters and downsputs on side flat roof. Furnish and install new 6" K style seamless gutters with 3"X4" downsput and beige enamel finish. Gutter will be fastened to fascia using commercial grade hidden screw hangers every 24". Remove downsput on rear shingle roof which flows onto rear flat roof. Cap off outlet opening then install on rear gutter and mount to corner window trim.

CONTRACTOR FIRST WILL REMOVE SKYLIGHT + BUILD DECK OVER OPENING 3/4" PLYWOOD ON SLOPE-READY FOR ROOFING

ANY PERSON or Object installed on this job without the supervision of HARRY AND SONS, will void this contract.

We hereby propose to install the above complete in accordance with the above specifications for

Fifteen thousand five hundred seventy five

Dollars ($15,575.00 )

Payments to be made as follows: Deposit of 40% ($6230.00) and balance due upon completion

All material in this contract is guaranteed to be as specified. The entire job is to be done in a neat and substantial manner.

Any alteration or deviation from specifications herein agreed upon involving extra cost of labor and material will be executed only upon written order from your authorized agent and will become an extra charge over the sum mentioned in this contract.

DATE 12/16/16

BY

ACCEPTANCE OF ESTIMATE

BRAVERMAN /p.9
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Braverman: Front façade: facing North

Detail: 2 MAGNOLIA PARKWAY

Braverman: Living Room East facing

Detail: LIVRM BAY WINDOW

Applicant: BRAVERMAN, BURT
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Detail: REAR OF BILLIARD

Detail: POOL RM ON LEFT - LG FLAT ROOF ABOVE

Applicant: BRAVERMAN, BURT
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

West face of house: Braverman

Detail: FLAT ROOF OVER LAUNDRY & DINING

West face of house: Braverman

Detail:

Applicant: BRAVERMAN, BURT
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Stains/Leaks on wall of laundry room from flat roof above/West side of house: Braverman

Detail: ________________________________

Stains/Leaks on wall of laundry room from flat roof above/West side of house: Braverman

Applicant: BRAVERMAN, BURT
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Med-size flat roof on West side above laundry room (& part of dining room): Braverman

Stains/leaks pool interior – West side of house Braverman

Detail:

Applicant: BRAVEMAN, BURT
Stains/leaks terrace wall from lg flat roof above – rear/ South side of house  Braverman

Stains/leaks on ceiling trim of 2nd skylight - terrace from lg flat roof above – South/rear of house  Braverman
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

PONDING WATER at 2nd DRAIN on LG FLAT ROOF

Ponding water at through-roof 1st drain – LG flat roof – rear/South  Braverman

Applicant: BRAVEMAN, BURT
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Lg flat roof rear/South side: broken skylight on far right (to be replaced). 2nd drain in center

Braverman skylight on left (not being replaced) Braverman

Detail:

Lg flat roof - standing on West edge of roof looking East to Master bdrm & Master bath bay window

Braverman

Detail:

Applicant: Braverman, Burt
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Facing So.
SM FLAT ROOF ABOVE MASTER BATH BAY WINDOW  Braverman

Detail:

Small flat roof above guest bdrm – above dining room  Braverman

Detail:

Applicant: BRAVERMAN, BURT
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

Broken skylight w/ silicone and duct tape patches—looking down into pool room  Braverman

Detail:

Looking up through broken skylight – from pool room below  Braverman

Detail:

Applicant: **BRAVERMAN, BURT**
Existing Property Condition Photographs (duplicate as needed)

View from rear neighbor's fence to flat roof & skylight area – skylight is not visible from their property Braverman

Detail:

View from Magnolia Parkway NW corner of property using telephoto lens – skylight not visible from street or neighbor's houses Braverman

Detail:

Applicant: BURMAN, BURT
**HAWP APPLICATION: MAILING ADDRESSES FOR NOTIFYING**

[Owner, Owner’s Agent, Adjacent and Confronting Property Owners]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner’s mailing address</th>
<th>Owner’s Agent’s mailing address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BURT BRAVERMANN</td>
<td>KATHLEEN MEREDITH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 MAGNOLIA PARKWAY</td>
<td>SAME 2 MAGNOLIA PKWY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815</td>
<td>CHEVY CHASE, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Adjacent and confronting Property Owners mailing addresses**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Heather &amp; Richard Cass</td>
<td>7 Magnolia Parkway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cynthia &amp; Joel Rosenberg</td>
<td>9 Magnolia Parkway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heidi &amp; William Maloni</td>
<td>5 Chevy Chase Circle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abigail Wenner</td>
<td>2 Hesketh Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geraldine &amp; Robert Josephs</td>
<td>3 Grafton Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leslie &amp; Richard Perle</td>
<td>5 Grafton Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chevy Chase, MD 20815</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>