MONTGOMERY COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

Address: 6300 Brookville Rd., Chevy Chase
Resource: Contributing Resource
Chevy Chase Village Historic District
Applicant: JL Property Ventures, LLC
(Jobi Jones, Architect)
Review: HAWP
Case Number: 35/13-17II

Meeting Date: 10/11/17
Report Date: 10/4/2017
Public Notice: 9/27/2017
Tax Credit: N/A
Staff: Michael Kyne

PROPOSAL: Fence, hardscape, and accessory structure alterations

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the HPC approve the HAWP application.

ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

SIGNIFICANCE: Contributing Resource within the Chevy Chase District
STYLE: Colonial Revival
DATE: c. 1916 - 1927

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes the following work items at the subject property:

- Replace the existing non-historic garage doors.
- Remove the existing chain link fence from the perimeter of the subject property.
- Install a new board-on-board wooden fence at the north and west property lines.
- Install a new 25'-4 1/2" wide x 20' deep at grade fieldstone patio at the rear/left side of the house.

APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

When reviewing alterations and new construction within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District, several documents are to be utilized as guidelines to assist the Commission in developing their decision. These documents include the historic preservation review guidelines in the approved and adopted amendment for the Chevy Chase Village Historic District (Guidelines), Montgomery County Code Chapter 24A (Chapter 24A), and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Standards). The pertinent information in these documents is outlined below.

Montgomery County Code; Chapter 24A-8

(a) The commission shall instruct the director to deny a permit if it finds, based on the evidence and information presented to or before the commission that the alteration for which the permit is sought would be inappropriate, inconsistent with or detrimental to the preservation, enhancement
or ultimate protection of the historic site or historic resource within an historic district, and to the purposes of this chapter.

(b) The commission shall instruct the director to issue a permit, or issue a permit subject to such conditions as are found to be necessary to insure conformity with the purposes and requirements of this chapter, if it finds that:

(1) The proposal will not substantially alter the exterior features of an historic site or historic resource within an historic district; or

(2) The proposal is compatible in character and nature with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural features of the historic site or the historic district in which an historic resource is located and would not be detrimental thereto or to the achievement of the purposes of this chapter; or

(3) The proposal would enhance or aid in the protection, preservation and public or private utilization of the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district in a manner compatible with the historical, archeological, architectural or cultural value of the historic site or historic district in which an historic resource is located; or

(4) The proposal is necessary in order that unsafe conditions or health hazards be remedied; or

(5) The proposal is necessary in order that the owner of the subject property not be deprived of reasonable use of the property or suffer undue hardship; or

(6) In balancing the interests of the public in preserving the historic site or historic resource located within an historic district, with the interests of the public from the use and benefit of the alternative proposal, the general public welfare is better served by granting the permit.

(c) It is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction, alteration or repairs to any 1 period or architectural style.

(d) In the case of an application for work on an historic resource located within an historic district, the commission shall be lenient in its judgment of plans for structures of little historical or design significance or for plans involving new construction, unless such plans would seriously impair the historic or architectural value of surrounding historic resources or would impair the character of the historic district. (Ord. No. 9-4, § 1; Ord. No. 11-59.)

Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines

The guidelines break down specific projects into three levels of review — Lenient, Moderate and Strict Scrutiny.

"Lenient Scrutiny" means that the emphasis of the review should be on issues of general massing and scale, and compatibility with the surrounding streetscape, and should allow for a very liberal interpretation of preservation rules. Most changes should be permitted unless there are major problems with massing, scale and compatibility.

"Moderate Scrutiny" involves a higher standard of review than "lenient scrutiny." Besides issues of massing, scale and compatibility, preserving the integrity of the resource is taken into account. Alterations should be designed so that the altered structure still contributes to the district. Use of compatible new materials, rather than the original building materials, should be permitted. Planned
changes should be compatible with the structure's existing design, but should not be required to replicate its architectural style.

"Strict Scrutiny" means that the planned changes should be reviewed to insure that the integrity of the significant exterior architectural or landscaping features and details is not compromised. However, strict scrutiny should not be "strict in theory but fatal in fact" i.e. it does not mean that there can be no changes but simply that the proposed changes should be reviewed with extra care.

The Guidelines state three basic policies that should be adhered to, including:

Preserving the integrity of the contributing structures in the district. Alterations to contributing structures should be designed in such a way that the altered structure still contributes to the district.

Design review emphasis should be restricted to changes that will be visible from the front or side public right-of-way, or that would be visible in the absence of vegetation or landscaping.

Alterations to the portion of a property that are not visible from the public right-of-way should be subject to very lenient review. Most changes to rear of the properties should be approved as a matter of course.

The Guidelines that pertain to this project are as follows:

**Fences** should be subject to strict scrutiny if they detract significantly from the existing open streetscape. Otherwise, fences should be subject to moderate scrutiny if they are visible from the public right-of-way, lenient scrutiny if they are not.

**Garages and accessory buildings** which are detached from the main house should be subject to lenient scrutiny but should be compatible with the main building.

**Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation**

The Secretary of the Interior defines rehabilitation as “the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features, which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.” The Standards are as follows:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

STAFF DISCUSSION

The subject property is a c. 1916-1927 Colonial Revival-style Contributing Resource within the Chevy Chase Village Historic District. The house is situated on a corner lot, sharing its north side property line with the rear of the houses on Oxford Street.

The applicant proposes the following work items at the subject property:

- Replace the existing non-historic garage doors.
- Remove the existing chain link fence from the perimeter of the subject property.
- Install a new board-on-board wooden fence at the north and west property lines.
- Install a new 25’-4 1/2” wide x 20’ deep at grade fieldstone patio at the rear/left side of the house.

Garage Doors

The existing garage doors are non-historic, with no distinctive features or characteristics. The proposed replacement garage doors are carriage style with paintable faux wood composite-cladding and SDL windows at the top. The submitted specification sheets indicate that the proposed doors will have clip-in grilles. Although the Commission typically requires grilles/muntins to be permanently-affixed, the Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines state that alterations to detached garages should be reviewed with lenient scrutiny. In this instance, staff interprets lenient scrutiny to indicate that the proposed garage doors, which in all other respects are compatible with the subject property and surrounding historic district, should be approved. Staff also suggests that the proposed replacement garage doors are unlikely to detract from the streetscape, due to the garage’s location more than 100’ from Brookeville Road.

Fences

The applicant proposes to remove the incompatible, non-historic chain link fence from all four sides of subject property. A new 6’ tall board-on-board wooden fence is proposed at the north property line, and a 6’ tall board-on-board wooden fence, which transitions to 3’ tall at the approximate rear plane of the historic house, is proposed at the west property line. The Commission typically requires all fences forward of the rear plane of a historic house to be no taller than 4’. Although the proposed fence at the north property line will continue at 6’ in height from the rear of the property to Brookeville Road, the north property line is shared with the rear of the houses on Oxford Street, where similar fences (in height and design) currently exist. Staff suggests that the proposed fence will be viewed as being at the rear of the houses on Oxford Street and it is unlikely to detract from the perceived openness of the streetscape.

Patio

Staff fully supports the proposed patio installation, finding that the patio is at grade and at the rear of the property, where it is unlikely to alter or remove character defining features of the resource.
After full and fair consideration of the applicant’s submission staff finds the proposal as being consistent with the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-(b) 1 and 2, having found the proposal is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation outlined above.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Commission **approve** the HAWP application under the Criteria for Issuance in Chapter 24A-8(b), having found that the proposal is consistent with the *Chevy Chase Village Historic District Guidelines* identified above, and therefore will not substantially alter the exterior features of the historic resource and is compatible in character with the district and the purposes of Chapter 24A;

and with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall present the 3 **permit sets of drawings**, if **applicable to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) staff for review and stamping** prior to submission for the Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services (DPS) building permits;

and with the general condition that final project design details, not specifically delineated by the Commission, shall be approved by HPC staff or brought back to the Commission as a revised HAWP application at staff’s discretion;

and with the general condition that the applicant shall notify the Historic Preservation Staff if they propose to make **any alterations** to the approved plans. Once the work is completed the applicant will **contact the staff person** assigned to this application at 301-563-3400 or michael.kyne@montgomeryplanning.org to schedule a follow-up site visit.
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
301/563-3400
APPLICATION FOR
HISTORIC AREA WORK PERMIT

Contact Email: jobi@jobijones11c.com  Contact Person: Jobi Jones
Daytime Phone #: 703-441-1112

Tax Account No.:

Name of Property Owner: JL Property Ventures Daytime Phone #: 571-277-5321
Address: 1350 Beverly Rd S# 116-449 McLean, VA 22101
Street Number  City  State Zip Code

Contractor:
Contractor Registration No.:
Agent for Owner: Jobi Jones Daytime Phone #: 703-441-1112

LOCATION OF BUILDING PREMISES
House Number: 1350  Street: Brookville Road
Town/City: Chevy Chase  Nearest Cross Street: Newlands Street
Lot: 11  Block: 54  Subdivision: Chevy Chase Village
Lot:
Block:

PART ONE: TYPE OF PROJECT/ALTERATION AND USE

1A. CHECK ALL APPLICABLE:
☐ Construct  ☐ Extend  ☐ Alter/Remodel  ☐ Add/Install
☐ Remove  ☐ Alter/Remodel  ☐ Room Addition  ☐ Remodel
☐ Move  ☐ Add/Install  ☐ Wall  ☐ Add/Install
☐ Revision  ☐ Repair  ☐ Revocable  ☐ Other:
☐ A/C  ☐ Slat  ☐ Room Addition
☐ Solar  ☐ Fireplace  ☐ Woodburning Stove  ☐ Single Family
☐ Single Family

1B. Construction cost estimate: $ 20,000

1C. If this is a revision of a previously approved active permit, see Permit #: 801330

PART TWO: REMODEL CONSTRUCTION AND EXTENSIONS/ADDITONS

2A. Type of sewage disposal: 01 ☑ WSSC 02 ☐ Septic 03 ☐ Other:

2B. Type of water supply: 01 ☑ WSSC 02 ☐ Well 03 ☐ Other:

PART THREE: COMPLETE ONLY FOR FENCE/RETAINING WALL

3A. Height (feet) and (inches)

3B. Indicate whether the fence or retaining wall is to be constructed on one of the following locations:
☐ On property line/property line  ☐ Entirely on land of owner  ☐ On public right of way/basement

I hereby certify that I have the authority to make the foregoing application, that the application is correct, and that the construction will comply with plans approved by all agencies listed and I hereby acknowledge and accept this to be a condition for the issuance of this permit.

Signature of Owner or Authorized Agent  9-15-17

Approved:  For Chairperson, Historic Preservation Commission
Disapproved:
Date:

Application/Permit No.:  Signature: Date:

Data Filed:  Data Issued:

Edit 5/21/99
SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR INSTRUCTIONS
SUMMARY OF SCOPE FOR THIS APPLICATION:
- Replace existing garage door with new
- Remove existing shed on property
- Remove existing fences on property
- Install new wood fence on north and west property lines
- Expand on existing patio area
- Install asphalt in existing driveway location

DESCRIPTION OF EXISTING STRUCTURE(S) AND ENVIRONMENTAL SETTING, INCLUDING THEIR HISTORICAL FEATURES AND SIGNIFICANCE

GARAGE
The existing garage door is not well-functioning; the doors are warped and the hinges bent. As-is the door has no historical detailing or significance.

FENCE
The existing fence is in disrepair around the entirety of the property. It is a chain-linked fence bearing no historical significance. In many areas the fence is bent and disfigured.

PATIO
There are some remaining stones from a previous patio area in the location of the new patio.

GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT AND ITS EFFECT ON THE HISTORIC RESOURCE(S), THE ENVIRONMENTAL SETTING, AND, WHERE APPLICABLE, THE HISTORIC DISTRICT

GARAGE
We’d like to install a new garage door that will provide function to the now un-used garage. The door style will be more in keeping with the aesthetic of the historic neighborhood.

FENCE
By eliminating the fence along the south and east sides of the property, we are providing a stronger connection to the neighborhood and removing what is otherwise an eye sore.

PATIO
We’d like to install new fieldstone to create a small patio outside of the dining room. Naturally sourced materials will be used and laid on grade for minimal site impact.
CLOPAY CANYON RIDGE, LIMITED EDITION SERIES; ORDERED PRIMED TO BE PAINTED WHITE

FRONT ELEVATION - PROPOSED
Scale: 1/4" = 1'-0"

STYLE AND CONSTRUCTION
- 5-layer Intelicore® polyurethane insulated composite faux wood doors. 20.4 R-value.
- Multiple door designs and window options. Custom designs also available. See your Clopay Dealer for more information.
- Many glass options available including clear, frosted, seeded, rain and obscure as well as insulated. See page 41 for specialty glass options.
- Attractive beveled edge clip-in grilles are removable for easy cleaning.
- Comes complete with spade lift handles and step plates. See pages 42–43 for details.

Calculated door section R-value is in accordance with GAMA TDS-163.
Canyon Ridge® Collection not applicable for new construction in California areas designated as "Fire Hazard Severity Zones".

Project Name: Chevy Chase Village
Client Name and Address: 6300 Brookville Road
Bethesda, MD 20816
Sheet Number: Sch-500
Sheet Title: Garage
REAR ELEVATION - EXISTING - No Proposed Change

Scale: 1/4" = 1'-0"
fauw wood.
REAL BEAUTY.

CANYON RIDGE®

LIMITED EDITION series

Beautiful and unique, Canyon Ridge® Limited Edition Series carriage house doors are constructed with an energy-efficient, Intelllicore® insulated steel base and finished with faux wood composite cladding and overlays. The appearance is that of authentic swing-out doors but with the convenience of modern, upward operation.

The Limited Edition Series cladding and overlay materials are molded from actual wood to reproduce the detailed natural texture and intricate grain patterns of the species that they emulate. The result is a distinctive wood-look door that is often indistinguishable from the real thing.
STYLE AND CONSTRUCTION
- 5-layer Intellicore® polyurethane insulated composite faux wood doors.
  20.4 R-value.
- Multiple door designs and window options. Custom designs also available. See your Clopay Dealer for more information.
- Many glass options available including clear, frosted, seeded, rain and obscure as well as insulated. See page 41 for specialty glass options.
- Attractive beveled edge clip-in grilles are removable for easy cleaning.
- Comes complete with spine lift handles and step plates. See pages 42–43 for details.

Calculated door section R-value is in accordance with DASMA T05-163.
Canyon Ridge® Collection not applicable for new construction in California areas designated as “Fire Hazard Severity Zones.”

DOOR DESIGNS
SERIES 1
Design 01  Design 11  Design 12  Design 13

SERIES 2
Design 21  Design 22  Design 23

SERIES 3
Design 31  Design 32  Design 33  Design 34

Design 35  Design 36  Design 37  Design 38

Doors shown in Dark Finish with Clear Cypress cladding and Clear Cypress overlay. Design 01 does not have an overlay.

TOP/ WINDOW SECTIONS
TOP11  TOP12  TOP13  ARCH1  REC11  REC13  REC14  SQ23  SQ24  ARCH1  ARCH3  ARCH4  ARC4A (Double Door)
Additional details with door designs available.

MATERIAL DESIGN OPTIONS
Clear Cypress  Mahogany  Pecky Cypress

COLORS
Walnut Finish  Dark Finish  Medium Finish  Whitewash Finish  Primed
Composite Cladding and Overlays are finished in the same color. Whitewash Finish available only on Mahogany Composite Cladding and Overlays. Doors can be ordered primed for those homeowners wishing to custom paint or stain their doors. Door stain color will vary slightly within a door due to finishing process. Due to the printing process, colors may vary.

WARRANTIES
EXISTING FENCE ON WEST SIDE OF PROPERTY TO BE REPLACED

NEIGHBORING 6' HIGH WOOD FENCE

EXISTING FENCE ON WEST SIDE OF PROPERTY TO BE REPLACED
NEIGHBORING 6' HIGH WOOD FENCE

EXISTING CHAINLINK FENCE ON PROPERTY TO BE REMOVED

EXISTING FENCE ON NORTH SIDE OF PROPERTY TO BE REPLACED

EXISTING CHAINLINK FENCE ON NORTH PROPERTY LINE TO BE REPLACED
EXISTING FENCE ON EAST SIDE OF PROPERTY TO BE REMOVED

EXISTING CHAINLINK FENCE ON SOUTH SIDE OF PROPERTY TO BE REMOVED
Municipality Letter for
Proposed Construction Project

Subject Property: 6300 Brookville Road, Chevy Chase, MD 20815
Property Owner: Julie Fletcher & Linda McElligott
Project Manager/Contractor: JL Property Ventures
Proposed Work: Renovation & alterations; new fencing; new patio

2/27/2017

Diane R. Schwartz Jones, Director
Department of Permitting Services of Montgomery County
255 Rockville Pike, 2nd floor
Rockville, MD 20850

Dear Ms. Jones,

This letter is to inform your department that the above homeowner/contractor has notified Chevy Chase Village that he or she plans to apply for both county and municipal permits for the above summarized construction project. Chevy Chase Village will not issue any municipal building permit(s) for this proposed project until Montgomery County has issued all necessary county permits and the applicant has provided Chevy Chase Village with copies of county-approved and stamped plans. We have advised the homeowner/contractor that a permit from Montgomery County does not guarantee a permit from this municipality unless the project complies with all our municipal rules and regulations.

If this homeowner/contractor later applies for an amended county permit, please do not approve that application until you have received a Municipality Letter from us indicating that the homeowner/contractor has notified us of that proposed amendment to the permit.

If you have any questions about this proposed project and the municipal regulation of it by Chevy Chase Village, do not hesitate to have your staff contact my office. The Village Permitting Coordinator can be reached by phone at 301-654-7300 or by e-mail at ccvpermitting@montgomerycountymd.gov.

Sincerely,

[Signature]
Shana R. Davis-Cook
Chevy Chase Village Manager

---

CHEVY CHASE VILLAGE
5906 Connecticut Avenue
Chevy Chase, Maryland 20815
Phone (301) 654-7300
Fax (301) 917-9721
ccv@montgomerycountymd.gov
www.cheychasevillage.md.gov

BOARD OF MANAGERS
MICHAEL L. DENER
Chair
ELISSL A. LEFARD
Treasurer
DAVID L. WINTHAD
Secretary
MINHLE
Assistant Secretary

GARY CRACIT
Vice Chair
ROBERT C. GOODWIN, JR.
Assistant Treasurer
RICHARD M. RUDA
Board Member

VILLAGE MANAGER
SHANA R. DAVIS-COOK
LEGAL COUNSEL
SUZELLE M. FERGUSON
OWNER ADDRESS
1350 Beverly Road
Suite 115-449
McLean, VA 22101

OWNER AGENT ADDRESS
1901 Columbia Road NW
#204
Washington, DC 20009

CONFRONTING AND ADJACENT PROPERTY OWNERS
14 Oxford St - JW and Helene Rayder - Account # - 00456605
16 Oxford St - Matthew Leggett & Melissa Vap - Account # - 00455997
18 Oxford St - Gall Feldman - Account # - 00455816
20 Oxford St - Marc and Lori Gordon - Account # - 00457484
26 Oxford St - Gerstenfeld/Wiltshire Revocable Trust - Account # - 00456902
103 Newlands St - Virginia Leachman - Account # - 00455838
15 Newlands St - Jon and Theresa - Account # - 00455031
16 Newlands St - Robert Morgenstein - Account # - 00456970
104 Newlands St - James and Bernice Todaro - Account # 03710567